00871867



Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Chambres Extraordinaires au sein des Tribunaux Cambodgiens

# ព្រះរាស់ឃានដែងគី ស្ សូឌូ សាសស រល់ះគលរដវិនិ

Kingdom of Cambodia Nation Religion King Royaume du Cambodge Nation Religion Roi

### អតិន្នមុំស្រិះមារបន្តជំន

Trial Chamber Chambre de première instance

#### ង្គាសារខ្មើន

**ORIGINAL/ORIGINAL** 

21-Dec-2012, 15:20

**Uch Arun** 

#### TRANSCRIPT OF TRIAL PROCEEDINGS **PUBLIC**

Case File Nº 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC

13 December 2012 Trial Day 140

Before the Judges: NIL Nonn, Presiding

Silvia CARTWRIGHT

YA Sokhan

Jean-Marc LAVERGNE

YOU Ottara

THOU Mony (Reserve)

Claudia FENZ (Reserve)

The Accused: **NUON Chea** 

**IENG Sary** 

SON Arun

KHIEU Samphan

Lawyers for the Accused:

Andrew IANUZZI Trial Chamber Greffiers/Legal Officers: Jasper PAUW

ANG Udom

SE Kolvuthy Michael G. KARNAVAS Matteo CRIPPA KONG Sam Onn **DAV Ansan** Arthur VERCKEN

For the Office of the Co-Prosecutors: Lawyers for the Civil Parties:

> **CHAN Dararasmey** PICH Ang

Vincent DE WILDE D'ESTMAEL Élisabeth SIMONNEAU-FORT

> LOR Chunthy SAM Sokong **HONG Kimsuon**

Christine MARTINEAU Isabelle DURAND **Emmanuel JACOMY** 

**VEN Pov** 

UCH Arun **SOUR Sotheavy** 

For Court Management Section:

# INDEX

MR. PHAN VAN (TCW-307)	
Questioning by Judge Lavergne resumes	page 2
Questioning by Mr. lanuzzi	page 11
Questioning by Mr. Son Arun	page 66
MS. DENISE AFFONÇO (TCCP-1)	
Questioning by Mr. Pauw	page 75
MR. PHAN VAN (TCW-307)	
Questioning by Mr. Son Arun resumes	page 110
Questioning by Mr. Kong Sam Onn	page 121

# **List of Speakers:**

Language used unless specified otherwise in the transcript

Speaker	Language
MS. AFFONÇO (TCCP-1)	French
MR. ANG UDOM	Khmer
JUDGE CARTWRIGHT	English
MR. DE WILDE D'ESTMAEL	French
MR. IANUZZI	English
MR. JACOMY	French
MR. KARNAVAS	English
MR. KONG SAM ONN	Khmer
JUDGE LAVERGNE	French
THE PRESIDENT (NIL NONN, Presiding)	Khmer
MR. PAUW	English
MR. PHAN VAN (TCW-307)	Khmer
MR. PICH ANG	Khmer
MS. SIMONNEAU-FORT	French
MR. SON ARUN	Khmer

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 PROCEEDINGS
- 2 (Court opens at 0904H)
- 3 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 4 Please be seated. The Court is now in session.
- 5 During today's sessions and as scheduled, the Chamber continues
- 6 hearing the testimony of Witness Phan Van.
- 7 Madam Se Kolvuthy is now instructed to report to the Chamber the
- 8 current status of the parties to the proceedings.
- 9 [09.06.13]
- 10 THE GREFFIER:
- 11 Good morning, Mr. President. During today's sessions, all the
- 12 parties to the proceedings are present, except Mr. Ieng Sary, who
- 13 is present but in his holding cell, due to his health concerns.
- 14 During today's sessions, starting from the morning, the Chamber
- 15 continues hearing the testimonies of Mr. Phan Van, who is now
- 16 before the Chamber.
- 17 In the afternoon session, the Chamber continues hearing the
- 18 testimony of Civil Party Madam Denise Affonço through remote --
- 19 or videoconference. According to the report by the AV booth
- 20 officers, the equipment are ready for today -- this afternoon
- 21 sessions.
- 22 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 23 Judge Lavergne, would you wish to continue putting a few more
- 24 questions to the witness?
- 25 You may now proceed.

- 1 [09.17.14]
- 2 QUESTIONING BY JUDGE LAVERGNE RESUMES:
- 3 Thank you, Mr. President. I have a few questions to ask the
- 4 witness.
- 5 Good morning, Mr. Kham Phan.
- 6 Q. If we can, I would like to come back to the administrative
- 7 structures and to the connections between Sector 105 and the
- 8 Northeast region.
- 9 You told us that Sector 105 was, as far as you were aware,
- 10 autonomous. But can you tell us if there were in fact relations
- 11 between Sector 105 and the Northeast region, please?
- 12 MR. PHAN VAN:
- 13 A. There was a connection between Sector 105 and the Northwest
- 14 (sic) Zone. There was some kind of connection through the border.
- 15 However, when it comes administrative communication, the report
- 16 had to be done vertically -- from bottom up.
- 17 [09.08.38]
- 18 Q. There may be a slip here because in my earphones, I heard
- 19 "Northwest", but we're talking here about the Northeast.
- 20 A. Well, I was talking about the South rather, the Northeast,
- 21 indeed.
- 22 Q. Thank you.
- 23 So, you're telling us that all of the communications between
- 24 Sector 105 and the Northeast Zone had to be organized
- 25 hierarchically. So, all of the communication had to go through

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 who -- through the Central Committee, through Office 870? Who did
- 2 the communications go through?
- 3 A. According to my understanding, the communication went through
- 4 870, but at the same time there was a committee along the border
- 5 where the communication could channel through. This committee was
- 6 set up by the Upper Echelon and there were names of individuals
- 7 in the committee, though I don't remember all the names. But I
- 8 knew for sure that such committee existed.
- 9 Q. Who was in charge of the Northeast region? Do you remember
- 10 that?
- 11 A. Ta Ya was the secretary of that zone during the time when I
- 12 had worked there.
- 13 [09.10.55]
- 14 Q. Can you remember what happened to Ta Ya? Was Ta Ya also known
- 15 under the name of Ney Sarann?
- 16 A. I am afraid I don't know his other name other than Ta Ya
- 17 because he was popularly known as Ta Ya at that time.
- 18 Previously, his wife was somehow connected to my mother by
- 19 marriage or, rather, his wife was connected to my mother, as
- 20 she was my mother's cousin, and that -- he was the secretary of
- 21 the zone. That's all I know.
- 22 Q. Do you know if Ta Ya was viewed as being an enemy and if he
- 23 was purged?
- 24 MR. IANUZZI:
- 25 Excuse me, Mr. President--

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 2 Counsel, you have already been -- rather, a ruling was already
- 3 made yesterday that counsel is not allowed to object to the
- 4 question put by any member of the Bench. You are not allowed to
- 5 do that, so please be seated.
- 6 [09.12.39]
- 7 MR. IANUZZI:
- 8 I understood -- good morning, everyone; excuse me. I understood
- 9 the ruling yesterday that I'm not permitted to object, so I would
- 10 just like to make an observation that purges -- purges are--
- 11 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 12 No observation is being allowed to make at this moment.
- 13 BY JUDGE LAVERGNE:
- 14 Q. Mr. Witness, would you like me to repeat the question or can
- 15 you remember the question?
- 16 Just to remind you, do you know what happened to Ta Ya and,
- 17 possibly, who replaced him?
- 18 MR. PHAN VAN:
- 19 A. Yes, I knew about this because after his disappearance there
- 20 was a public announcement concerning this. He was said to have
- 21 betrayed us.
- 22 Q. Why did he betray you? Why was there this announcement that he
- 23 was considered a traitor?
- 24 A. We heard that he had been affiliated with the Vietnamese.
- 25 [09.14.21]

- 1 Q. I want to ask you a series of questions about how we define
- 2 enemies, and in so doing, I'd like to refer you to a certain
- 3 number of documents. The first is E3/1111 (sic). The French ERN
- 4 is 00532706, Khmer ERN 00376671, ERN in English is 00524192.
- 5 This telegram is headed "Advice Given to 920" and it's dated 23rd
- of September 1976. It's to "Beloved and Missed Comrade Chhin".
- 7 So, my first question is -- we've already been talking about a
- 8 certain Chhin during our discussions. Can you confirm for us that
- 9 Chhin was the Secretary of Division 920?
- 10 A. Yes, it is correct. Chhin was that -- was the commander of
- 11 that division.
- 12 Q. So, the telegram reads as follows:
- 13 "Based on the news, the revisionist enemies" -- in the French
- 14 version, it says the equivalent of reformist, and in English it
- 15 says revisionist "especially the group 7, initiated
- 16 communications with an attempt to burrow from within our army and
- 17 the base.
- 18 [09.16.46]
- 19 "Meanwhile, they contacted some traitors to encourage the people
- 20 against the cooperatives and oppose the line of our socialist
- 21 revolution, especially to burrow from inside for long-term
- 22 purposes.
- 23 "The following actions, therefore, must be taken:
- 24 "1. Conducting education sessions for all the division committees
- 25 in order for them to be well acquainted with the enemy artifices.

- 1 "2. Tracking any persons who have been contracted with group 7 or
- 2 who have sympathies with group 7 to ensure that they will not
- 3 hold any leadership positions in the army, whatever their rank.
- 4 "The ideology of comrades who work as the division
- 5 representatives and play a role in contacting group 7 must be
- 6 closely monitored, ideologically speaking, without taking one's
- 7 attention away from them for one second.
- 8 "Experience indicates that group 7 people always entice our
- 9 communication committee to serve their Cambodia invasion
- 10 policies. Some committee members in some places have already been
- 11 contacted.
- 12 [09.18.53]
- 13 "Therefore, absolute vigilance is needed to prevent them from
- 14 burrowing within the army -- from cadre to combatants. In
- 15 particular, contacts with the border division are absolutely
- 16 prohibited."
- 17 Signed "Khieu", who one assumes is Son Sen, with copies to
- 18 "Brother 81", "Brother Som", "Brother Nath", "Brother Ren", and
- 19 for the "Documentation".
- 20 Have you heard of the 7 Group?
- 21 A. No, I haven't. I haven't heard anything about the 7 Group.
- 22 Q. All right.
- 23 Well, in that case, I'm going to turn to another document. It's
- 24 E3/1196. The French ERN is 00597060; in Khmer, 00000879; English,
- 25 00506647. It's Telegram 33, dated 26 of November 1976, signed by

- 1 Chhan.
- 2 Perhaps, Mr. President, the witness could be given a copy of the
- 3 document.
- 4 [09.21.12]
- 5 So, the telegram is signed by Chhan and addressed to "Office
- 6 870". Now, can you tell us who Chhan is?
- 7 A. I don't know this person clearly.
- 8 Q. Do you believe that there is any connection between Chhan and
- 9 somebody called Laing -- perhaps the Laing who is your father --
- 10 was your father?
- 11 A. No, I haven't heard about this.
- 12 Q. In that case, please remove the document from the witness.
- 13 But I will read it out anyway. Telegram 33:
- 14 "To Beloved and Missed Office 870
- 15 "We would like to inform you about the situation at the base. The
- 16 activity is similar to that of 1974; there has been stone
- 17 throwing onto houses at many places. People are seen at night,
- 18 but we were not able to shoot them in time.
- 19 "2. The situation of the 7 people remains the same. We have
- 20 adopted military measures. Both the divisions and sector units
- 21 are in consensus."
- 22 [09.23.19]
- 23 I would point out that this telegram was copied to "Brother Nuon"
- 24 therefore, Nuon Chea "Brother Khiev" -- Son Sen, in all
- 25 probability -- the "Office", and "Documentation".

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 I'd now like to look at another document, a document that you saw
- 2 yesterday. It was presented to you by the Co Prosecutors. It's
- 3 document E3/877 -- in French, ERN 00283109; in Khmer, 00021513;
- 4 and in English, 00185226.
- 5 Here we're looking at a telegram that was sent by "Chhan" to
- 6 "Beloved and Missed Office 870". And yesterday, unless I am
- 7 mistaken, you told us that this telegram from Chhan had been sent
- 8 by your father, unless I got that wrong.
- 9 So I propose that this document be shown once again to the
- 10 witness so that he can tell us what he thinks.
- 11 Witness, do you remember this telegram?
- 12 [09.25.46]
- 13 A. During this period, my elder sibling was working at that
- 14 place. So, to be precise about this person's name, we may need to
- 15 talk to my sister because this is the secret name. Chhan could
- 16 have been another person because my father did not use other name
- 17 other than Laing. However, it was possible that people could have
- 18 different names because names could be changed from time to time
- 19 during the Khmer Rouge regime.
- 20 Q. In the document, there is a reference to suspicions vis-a-vis
- 21 the Contemptible Som and Chhin -- and we were told yesterday that
- 22 Chhin was the Secretary of Division 920 and that such matters
- 23 were reported to Comrade San. Can you tell us who Comrade San is?
- 24 A. San was Comrade Chhin's successor at Division 920.
- 25 Q. And it then goes on to say: "Despite arrests of Unit 920's,

- 1 activities continue one after the other, but we were making
- 2 arrest after arrest, too."
- 3 Did you know what was going on in Division 920?
- 4 [09.27.54]
- 5 A. At that time, people continued to disappear one after another.
- 6 I learned about this.
- 7 Q. Let's look at one last document, E3/1030 -- ERN in French,
- 8 00623150; in Khmer, 00033312; English, 00324806.
- 9 This is a telegram from "Sophea" to "Beloved and Missed Brother
- 10 Chhan" "Brother Chhan". Does the name Sophea mean anything to
- 11 you? Can you tell us who Sophea might be?
- 12 A. I am not sure which Sophea the message referred to here,
- 13 because there was a person by the name of Sophea who was in
- 14 charge of the military at that time, at that zone.
- 15 Q. Let me read the document, and then you can tell us what you
- 16 think:
- 17 "I would like to report about the situation of the 7 group as
- 18 follows:
- 19 "At Au Phlay, they intruded 20 kilometres" -- it says in the
- 20 French, "metres" in the English "into our land and cut bamboo.
- 21 We attacked, and killed, and wounded a number of them on the 17th
- 22 of June 1977."
- 23 [09.30.19]
- 24 Then it goes on to say that there were some clashes.
- 25 And then, in paragraph 2 it says: "The 7 group attacked us at

- 1 Pech Chenda. They now attacked and entered Pou Chri Chas."
- 2 Now, when you hear these names and the name of "group 7", does
- 3 this mean anything to you?
- 4 A. Having listened to this, I can say that this group 7 could
- 5 have been the Vietnamese. That's that's my understanding, and
- 6 this is how I may conclude, based on the experience during my
- 7 work there. However, I cannot say exactly this group of people
- 8 could have been the Vietnamese 100 per cent.
- 9 Q. To your knowledge, were the soldiers who participated in the
- 10 revolutionary struggle under the command of the Vietnamese? Were
- 11 they then, subsequently, considered as enemies?
- 12 A. I am sorry; I do not understand the question. Could you please
- 13 clarify it?
- 14 Q. Among the soldiers who comprised the Khmer Rouge forces, there
- 15 were soldiers who, under -- at another time had served under the
- 16 Vietnamese. Do you have knowledge of that or not?
- 17 A. Yes, I do. At the time, there were some soldiers, particularly
- 18 those who were in Mondulkiri province; they were also working
- 19 alongside with their Vietnamese counterpart.
- 20 [09.33.17]
- 21 Q. And it would appear that as of 1973 there were agreements
- 22 according to which those soldiers would no longer be working
- 23 under the Vietnamese, but they would be serving exclusively under
- 24 the Khmer Rouge. Do you recall this?
- 25 A. I recall some of the events. Well, actually, it was not in the

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 form of superior command structure. I mean, it does not mean that
- 2 the Vietnamese were the superior and we were following them, but
- 3 actually we worked with them as counterparts. But later on, in
- 4 mid 1975, we were sent to the battlefield along the border, and
- 5 at that time I was also sent there, as well. I was assisting them
- 6 in supplying items, or so, or in the transport or logistic
- 7 support.
- 8 Q. And how did that alter relations with the Vietnamese?
- 9 A. At first, we cooperated in order to fight against Thur Ky
- 10 (phonetic) Thiev Ky, rather, along the border.
- 11 [09.35.20]
- 12 JUDGE LAVERGNE:
- 13 Very well.
- 14 I wish to thank you, Mr. Witness, for all of your responses.
- 15 Mr. President, I have no further questions to put. Thank you.
- 16 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 17 Thank you, Judge.
- 18 Now, I hand over the floor to the defence team for Mr. Nuon Chea
- 19 to put questions to the witness. You may proceed.
- 20 QUESTIONING BY MR. IANUZZI:
- 21 Thank you, Mr. President. Again, good morning, everyone.
- 22 And good morning to you, Mr. Witness. Thank you very much for
- 23 coming to give your evidence today and this week. I'm one of the
- 24 lawyers for Nuon Chea, along with my colleague, Major Son Arun,
- 25 and we both have some questions for you today.

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 [09.36.08]
- 2 Let me begin by giving you a brief outline of the of the main
- 3 areas that I intend to cover: first of all, I'll start with some
- 4 questions regarding your knowledge of Ta Sarun, who you spoke
- 5 about; I'll then move on to what you've told us about the
- 6 communication structure at K 17 and Sector 105; and, finally,
- 7 time permitting -- but I don't think we'll have a problem with
- 8 time -- I'll ask you some questions about a variety of other
- 9 matters, including a few of your experiences prior to 1975.
- 10 Q. Before I begin with any of that, I would like to first confirm
- 11 your present address -- your current address. I believe you told
- 12 us it's somewhere in Malai district. And, if you wouldn't mind,
- 13 could you please tell me again, exactly, where your current
- 14 resident is located in Cambodia?
- 15 MR. PHAN VAN:
- 16 A. My current address is in Malai Sub-district, Malai district,
- 17 Banteay Meanchey province, and my house number is 01, Phsar
- 18 Taprum Street (phonetic).
- 19 [09.37.43]
- 20 Q. Very well. Thank you for that, Mr. Witness. How long have you
- 21 lived at that particular location?
- 22 A. I have lived in Malai district following the arrival of UNTAC.
- 23 Q. Thank you. And prior to the arrival of UNTAC, where were you
- 24 living?
- 25 A. Prior to the arrival of UNTAC, I was living in 105 -- Street

- 1 505, rather.
- 2 Q. In which town, Mr. Witness?
- 3 A. At that time, it was not a downtown area; it was called
- 4 Corridor 505, but now it was called Thommoda. And it was the
- 5 place where Nuon Chea worked, as well, and Pol Pot and Khieu
- 6 Samphan also had their office over there.
- 7 Q. Thank you. Is that is that also in the northwest part of the
- 8 country?
- 9 A. It was somewhere along the border of Pursat and Koh Kong
- 10 province and it was also close to the Trat province of Thailand.
- 11 Q. Thank you very much. So, just to be absolutely clear, when you
- 12 talk about the border, you are indeed talking about the border
- 13 between Cambodia and Thailand; correct?
- 14 [09.40.26]
- 15 A. Yes, that is correct.
- 16 Q. Thank you very much for the preliminary information, Mr.
- 17 Witness.
- 18 I'll now move onto those more substantive matters I mentioned.
- 19 Let's start with Sao Sarun. You've told us over the course of
- 20 this week that your father -- your father was the Secretary in
- 21 charge of Office K-17 and that he was succeeded in that position
- 22 by Ta Sarun that is, Ta Sarun took over the position following
- 23 your father's death; is that correct?
- 24 A. That is correct.
- 25 Q. Thank you. Now, according to one of the statements you gave to

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 the Office of the Co-Investigating Judges -- the investigators
- 2 from that office -- you were asked whether you knew about any
- 3 killings that took place in Sector 105, and you gave the
- 4 following answer -- and I'm quoting now, I'll give you the
- 5 reference in a moment: "During my father's era, there was no
- 6 killing; but during the Ta Sarun era, the arrests of whole
- 7 families were made; but I don't know where those families were
- 8 taken to be killed."
- 9 [09.41.52]
- 10 And, before I ask you a question about that, Mr. Witness, just
- 11 let me, for everyone's benefit, give the reference to the
- 12 document. That is -- and you've seen this document already, Mr.
- 13 Witness -- E3/57; it's a written record of an interview with you
- 14 and the investigators of the OCIJ. It's dated the 10th of March
- 15 2009. And the passage I just read is at English page 6, and
- 16 that's ERN 00290508; Khmer, 00287705; and French, 00353104.
- 17 So, again, perhaps I'll just repeat it for you: "During my
- 18 father's era, there was no killing; but during the Ta Sarun era,
- 19 the arrests of whole families were made; but I don't know where
- 20 those families were taken to be killed."
- 21 So, my first question to you, Mr. Witness: Is that a correct
- 22 statement of your evidence? Is that accurate that during Ta
- 23 Sarun's tenure in Section 105, whole families were arrested and
- taken somewhere to be killed?
- 25 A. That is correct. I did not know the arrests myself, but what I

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 knew was that there were arrests of people and then those people
- 2 never came. And as for my -- during my father's era, there were
- 3 only a few families who disappeared, like Uncle Chuon, his family
- 4 disappeared. But, when Ta Sarun came take the place of my father,
- 5 whole families were taken away and they disappeared. And this was
- 6 the correct summary of my statement.
- 7 [09.44.14]
- 8 Q. Thank you very much for that, Mr. Witness. I'm going to move
- 9 on -- I'm going to stay with this topic; I'm going to move onto
- 10 another document.
- 11 This document has been put before the Chamber, it has an E3
- 12 number that's been used in Court already; it's E3/1664. It's a
- 13 DC-Cam document -- that is, a document prepared by the
- 14 Documentation Center of Cambodia. It's entitled "Khmer Rouge
- 15 Purges in the Mondulkiri Highlands", and at the bottom it refers
- 16 to a document series of DC-Cam. The document the ERN number -
- 17 excuse me in Khmer is 00397566 through 00397749; French,
- 18 00742838 through 00742-
- 19 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 20 Counsel, please repeat the ERN numbers because you read it rather
- 21 fast; it was not followed by the interpreters. Could you please
- 22 read out rather slowly so that it can be properly rendered?
- 23 [09.45.32]
- 24 BY MR. IANUZZI:
- 25 I will indeed; my apologies to the translators.

- 1 Q. Khmer ERN 00397566 through 00397749; French ERN 00742838
- 2 through 00742889. I'm interested in two particular passages, and
- 3 I've only got the English ERNs for those; I don't think this
- 4 entire document has been translated, but I'll read the bit into
- 5 the record. The first page is, English, 00397653.
- 6 Mr. Witness, I'm going to read a passage to you from this
- 7 document, and then I'll ask you some questions about those
- 8 passages. I'm actually going to read you three passages, but I'll
- 9 do that step-by-step, one at a time.
- 10 So, again, the first one -- I'm quoting now:
- 11 "With Horm's death, Sarun, an ethnic Lao, became Secretary of
- 12 Region 105. The conflict between Kham Phuon and Horm and the
- 13 installation of Sarun as region secretary led to the imposition
- 14 of stricter rules in the region and coincided with the period of
- 15 the greatest number of deaths."
- 16 [09.47.20]
- 17 So, my first question, Mr. Witness: Can you confirm can you
- 18 confirm that Horm was indeed an alias or another name used by
- 19 your father? Is that correct?
- 20 A. Horm was one of the aliases of my father. Actually, this name
- 21 was derived from a Laotian name.
- 22 Q. Thank you, Mr. Witness. My next question: Is it correct -- is
- 23 it correct, according to your knowledge, of course, that the
- 24 rules imposed in Sector 105 became stricter -- that is, more
- 25 strict, more harsh -- under Sarun's leadership -- that is, after

00871886

E1/153.1

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 your father's death?
- 2 A. That I do not know because I did not stay in the region at
- 3 that time. But to my understanding, those were at the sector's
- 4 level had to follow strictly the instruction from the upper
- 5 authority; they did not dare to make any decision all on their
- 6 own. That's what I can clarify it for you. At that time, everyone
- 7 were self-disciplined.
- 8 Q. Thank you. And you've already told us that there was an
- 9 increased number of arrests and, possibly, killings during
- 10 Sarun's leadership. Would you agree, then, with this passage that
- 11 under Sarun's leadership -- that that period, rather, was
- 12 associated with a greater number of deaths than your father's --
- 13 that is, than the period in which your father was in charge of
- 14 Sector 105?
- 15 [09.49.39]
- 16 A. To my understanding, I actually also learnt it from my
- 17 friends, as well, that following the death of my father and
- 18 during the tenure of Ta Sarun, many people disappeared.
- 19 Q. Thank you.
- 20 Moving onto the next passage -- and I'm in the same document, and
- 21 I'm on the following page in English, so that's 00397654, and
- 22 again, Mr. Witness, I'm quoting from this document: "Many
- 23 informants mark the beginning of the most radical changes in
- 24 Mondulkiri to late 1977 and 1978, when Sarun took power."
- 25 So, again, based on your experience, your personal knowledge,

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 what others may have told you, would you agree with that
- 2 assessment that radical changes took place in Mondulkiri after
- 3 Sarun took control of the sector?
- 4 [09.51.00]
- 5 A. I actually witnessed the disappearance of people. I asked the
- 6 villagers, for example, where was the family of Mr. A, for
- 7 example; then they told me that they had already disappeared.
- 8 Q. Thank you very much.
- 9 And the third and final passage from this same document, the same
- 10 page that I just mentioned, Mr. Witness again, I'm quoting:
- 11 "After Sarun became the region secretary, they arrested people
- 12 every day -- four or five people a day. The chief of the
- 13 cooperative tried to intimidate the people to work harder by
- 14 telling them Sarun was going to kill the lazy people."
- 15 Now, again, if you know if you know, according to your
- 16 knowledge or experience, is that an accurate statement of the
- 17 situation in Sector 105 after Ta Sarun became the secretary?
- 18 A. I tend to disagree with this statement because it was not as
- 19 harsh as what it is stated in this, because they did not actually
- 20 kill lazy people as being stated.
- 21 We can also ask other people who were still who are still
- 22 alive, those who have come across the experience. Some of them
- 23 are now alive and they are living somewhere in Anlong Veng
- 24 district. We may ask them for further clarification.
- 25 But I do not think that the policy at that time was that harsh.

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 [09.52.57]
- 2 Q. Thank you, Mr. Witness. So, just so I understand you clearly,
- 3 you disagree with the portion indicating that people were killed
- 4 because they were lazy; is that correct?
- 5 A. In my personal understanding, I simply do not believe that the
- 6 only fact that they were lazy was the factor for their execution.
- 7 Of course, at that time, they did kill people, but these were
- 8 minor things, and I did not believe that it would amount to the
- 9 execution of those people; only those who were alleged of being
- 10 enemies, for example those people were destined to be executed,
- 11 but it was also the decision of the upper authority, who passed
- 12 it down to people at the lower lever to carry out the activity.
- 13 Q. Very well. Thank you for that. I understand. Yesterday -
- 14 actually, it wasn't yesterday, I believe it was the day before --
- 15 you discussed with the International Co-Prosecutor a so-called
- 16 12-point moral code, and I believe you indicated that you did not
- 17 recall the specifics of that particular code, but nevertheless,
- 18 the essence "the essence" of the code, I believe, is how you
- 19 put it -- was to respect people; is that correct?
- 20 [09.54.52]
- 21 A. Yes, that is correct.
- 22 Q. Thank you. And then you went on to indicate -- in that same
- 23 exchange with the International Co-Prosecutor, you went on to
- 24 indicate that later on in the DK regime people deviated from that
- 25 standard -- that is, they didn't follow that standard -- and they

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 lived by what you said -- what you described were "their own
- 2 moral codes"; is that correct?
- 3 A. No, I don't think I have said that.
- 4 Q. Thank you, Mr. Witness.
- 5 Perhaps I'll just read back what we have quoted in the draft
- 6 transcript, and then you can correct it for me. And I'm quoting
- 7 now from the draft trial transcript of page excuse me, 11
- 8 December -- that was two days ago -- at page 83, lines 1 through
- 9 12.
- 10 And the question was: "Can you tell us a little bit about the
- 11 12-point moral code that had to be adhered to?"
- 12 [09.56.09]
- 13 And the answer was: "I do not recall the 12 moral codes, but most
- 14 important of all was the moral livings.
- 15 "In the early days, many people supported these 12 moral codes,
- 16 but later on everyone was alleged of the enemies of the Party.
- 17 That's why people did not abide by these [...] moral codes anymore.
- 18 "Of course, the essence of [the] moral codes was to respect each
- 19 other in society, pay respect to Buddhist monks, and so and so
- 20 forth. But later on people did not adhere to these 12 moral
- 21 codes; they lived by their own moral codes."
- 22 Now, that's what we have in the draft transcript, so please
- 23 correct me if that's not what you said or if that's not accurate.
- 24 Is that -- what I've just read -- an accurate reflection of your
- 25 evidence?

- 1 A. Yes, that's what I said in Court; it was the truth. And I
- 2 simply would like to give an example concerning the 12 moral
- 3 codes.
- 4 During the war era, the 12 moral codes were strictly applied. For
- 5 example, in Mondulkiri province, people had to pay a great
- 6 respect to Buddhist monks and they must not steal, even -- not
- 7 even a piece of chili of the villagers. But later on the Khmer
- 8 Rouge confiscated all the belongings of people; they put them
- 9 into collective use, and people were not very happy with this
- 10 practice, so they did not follow these 12 moral codes anymore and
- 11 they did not see Buddhist monks anymore either. And money or
- 12 currency were abolished; everything was in a collective form, so
- 13 they no longer abided by these moral codes.
- 14 [09.58.26]
- 15 Q. Thank you, Mr. Witness. And would you agree -- or was it the
- 16 case that your father adhered to the moral codes, that he tried
- 17 his best to follow those moral codes in the early days of the
- 18 regime?
- 19 A. Actually, during my father's tenure, he did not agree with the
- 20 practice. Everyone wanted to protest, but they dared not do it.
- 21 And at that time I was too young, as well; I did not understand
- 22 the politics and I only heard from others what they did. So, at
- 23 that time, all people did not content with this practice, but
- 24 they dared not go against it.
- 25 Q. Just so I have you clearly, are you saying that your father

00871891

E1/153.1

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 and others didn't agree with the with the DK practices but they
- 2 still believed in these moral codes you discussed, but they
- 3 didn't dare to say that? Is that what you meant?
- 4 A. (Microphone not activated)
- 5 [10.00.06]
- 6 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 7 Witness, please make sure the mic is activated before you
- 8 proceed.
- 9 You may now proceed.
- 10 MR. PHAN VAN:
- 11 A. Yes, it is correct. Everyone did not prefer these policies,
- 12 but they did not have they were not brave enough to challenge
- 13 it.
- 14 BY MR. IANUZZI:
- 15 Q. Thank you.
- 16 What about Ta Sarun? Would you agree, given what you've told us
- 17 already about the increased killings under his tenure and the
- 18 changes that took place during his leadership -- would you agree
- 19 that Ta Sarun, Sao Sarun, exercised his leadership in a manner
- 20 quite different from your father and that perhaps he, himself,
- 21 Sao Sarun, deviated from those moral codes you told us about?
- 22 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 23 Mr. Witness, please hold on.
- 24 International Co-Prosecutor, you may now proceed.
- 25 [10.01.29]

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 MR. DE WILDE D'ESTMAEL:
- 2 Thank you, Mr. President; and good morning to everybody. It does
- 3 seem to me that this question is on the verge of asking the
- 4 witness to speculate.
- 5 He, himself, said he wasn't there; the only source of information
- 6 he had was friends who he probably spoke to well after the
- 7 events. So, it seems to me that this question is rather expecting
- 8 too much of the witness, in asking him to identify practices
- 9 under Ta Sarun, while he, himself, was in Phnom Penh at the time.
- 10 So, I think that this question is inviting the witness to
- 11 speculate on what happened when he wasn't there.
- 12 [10.02.11]
- 13 MR. IANUZZI:
- 14 Mr. President, if I could just respond briefly, I'm not asking
- 15 the witness to speculate. And perhaps I'll rephrase the question
- 16 and put it in a more direct way.
- 17 I would just like to say that all of the witnesses -- nearly all
- 18 of the witnesses that have testified in this court room have, to
- 19 some degree or another, given us what we would call hearsay
- 20 evidence -- that is, evidence that -- of things they saw or heard
- 21 or that other people saw or heard and then told them. So that, as
- 22 a starting point, would be my first response, that hearsay
- 23 evidence is not only admissible before this Chamber, it's widely
- 24 used.
- 25 Second point I would make is that the witness has already told

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 us, based on his experience in talking to people and his own
- 2 personal experience at the time, that he does have some knowledge
- 3 of what happened under Ta Sarun's tenure.
- 4 [10.03.05]
- 5 BY MR. IANUZZI:
- 6 Q. So -- perhaps I could break up the question because I think it
- 7 was a bit of a compound question let me ask you this, Mr.
- 8 Witness. You've told us about your father -- about your father
- 9 and how he believed in that moral code that you described -- but
- 10 he wasn't able, unfortunately, to adhere to it -- and you've also
- 11 told us you've also told us about the several differences in
- 12 the leadership styles or the leadership the effects of the
- 13 leadership, shall we say, of your father and Ta Sarun.
- 14 So my question is -- let me make it a bit more simple: How would
- 15 you compare your father and Ta Sarun?
- 16 MR. PHAN VAN:
- 17 A. I cannot make a comparison between these two people because I
- 18 did not stay under the time when Ta Sarun worked there. I, when
- 19 hearing that people disappeared, asked some questions from the
- 20 villagers about this. So, it makes it difficult for me to compare
- 21 the two people's leadership style.
- 22 [10.04.47]
- 23 Q. Very well. Thank you, Mr. Witness. I'm going to stay with this
- 24 topic just a little while longer; I'm almost finished with this,
- 25 my first area.

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 You may be aware -- you may not, Mr. Witness -- that Ta Sao Sarun
- 2 has already testified before this Chamber -- that is, he sat in
- 3 the same chair where you're sitting now and gave us some
- 4 testimony, answered some questions by all of us -- and he was
- 5 confronted, specifically, with some of your testimony, some of
- 6 you OCIJ testimony, and in particular he was confronted with the
- 7 bit that you just confirmed for us this morning -- that is, when
- 8 you told us that: "During my father's era, there was no killing;
- 9 but during the Ta Sarun era, the arrests of whole families were
- 10 made; but I don't know where those families were taken to be
- 11 killed."
- 12 That very portion was put to Mr. Sao Sarun, and he very clearly
- 13 rejected your testimony; he rejected it, he denied it. And what
- 14 he said was, in particular -- and I'm quoting: "No, no whole
- 15 family members would ever be arrested. I think the person who
- 16 stated this" and there he's referring to you, Mr. Witness --
- 17 "must be exaggerating, because we never made any arrests of any
- 18 villager to be executed."
- 19 [10.06.10]
- 20 So, he, Sao Sarun, has very clearly rejected your testimony in
- 21 that regard.
- 22 So my first question to you is: Were you, in fact, exaggerating
- 23 when you told the investigators from the OCIJ that whole families
- 24 were arrested during Sao Sarun's period of leadership, or as
- 25 you've already told us this morning, was your evidence accurate

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 and correct?
- 2 A. I did not observe the proceedings during the time when Om Sao
- 3 Sarun took the stand. But I was or I am not in any position to
- 4 exaggerate. I do not know who gave him orders to arrest people,
- 5 but I learned that people were arrested and a lot of new a lot
- 6 more people were disappearing. Another person who was a very
- 7 honest tribal person was also arrested, and I couldn't believe
- 8 that such an honest person like him could disappear. And some
- 9 other people were also believed to have disappeared. I did not
- 10 really implicate him in making such arrests, but the arrests were
- 11 made during his tenure. And I asked a lot of people about this,
- 12 and they confirmed that such arrests did happen.
- 13 [10.08.09]
- 14 Q. Thank you for that, Mr. Witness. Do you have any personal
- 15 knowledge -- any personal knowledge as to why Sao Sarun would
- 16 reject that piece of your testimony? Do you think he's attempting
- 17 to minimize his own responsibilities?
- 18 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 19 International rather, Lead Co-Lawyer for the civil parties, you
- 20 may now proceed.
- 21 MR. PICH ANG:
- 22 Mr. President, I take issue with this line of questioning because
- 23 it invited witness to speculate.
- 24 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 25 And, International Co-Prosecutor, we noted you were on your feet

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 a moment ago. You may proceed.
- 2 MR. DE WILDE D'ESTMAEL:
- 3 Thank you, Mr. President. It was certainly along the same lines.
- 4 The Chamber has decided several times that questions should not
- 5 be put to the witness on the subject of the hypothetical thoughts
- 6 of another witness who is not there, and the witness is thus
- 7 being invited to speculate or put himself in somebody else's
- 8 shoes, and that's not his role before this Chamber.
- 9 Thank you.
- 10 [10.09.29]
- 11 MR. IANUZZI:
- 12 Again, if I could just briefly respond to that question (sic), I
- 13 would accept -- I would fully accept that we cannot ask witnesses
- 14 to speculate as to hypothetical matters.
- 15 However, I would strongly disagree with the suggestion that a
- 16 witness cannot know something because someone may have told him
- 17 that. It's -- I know many things because people have told them to
- 18 me. I don't experience everything in life, first hand, through my
- 19 eyes, through my ears, through my senses. Much of what we all
- 20 experience in life comes from our interactions with other people.
- 21 I think that's obvious.
- 22 So, it may be the case that the witness sitting on the stand
- 23 knows what I'm talking about, has direct personal information
- 24 about it, and it may be the case that he doesn't, and he is
- 25 perfectly able, capable, intelligent enough to tell us that. So I

- 1 don't think there's anything wrong with that question I just
- 2 asked.
- 3 I believe my colleague wants to make a comment, Mr. President.
- 4 [10.10.37]
- 5 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 6 Indeed, I am waiting for your comment to conclude and I would
- 7 then give the floor to another counsel.
- 8 Then, Counsel Karnavas, you may now proceed.
- 9 MR. KARNAVAS:
- 10 Good morning, Mr. President. Good morning, Your Honours, and good
- 11 morning to everyone in and around the courtroom.
- 12 The questions that are being asked are not only relevant, but
- 13 they're appropriate. And, when you look at the manner in which
- 14 the questions are being asked and how they're framed, they're no
- 15 different than the questions that were framed by Judge Lavergne.
- 16 I don't think that we're asking the gentleman to speculate. What
- 17 we're asking the gentleman to do is to make comparisons based on
- 18 his personal observations and his experiences.
- 19 [10.11.20]
- 20 Now, it's for the Trial Chamber to determine, at some point, what
- 21 weight to give to that evidence. But the gentleman was there; he
- 22 was able to see what happened before and after certain events or
- 23 where people were involved in making -- in holding certain
- 24 positions and he certainly can draw some conclusions. I think
- 25 that's what was being asked. That's what we normally do.

- 1 And of course, if there's no independent indicia to back up what
- 2 the gentleman is saying, you will give it little weight. But I
- 3 don't see anything that would -- that is being asked thus far
- 4 that we're asking this gentleman to speculate. We're merely
- 5 asking him to make comparisons based on his observations.
- 6 And, therefore, I think the line of questioning is extremely
- 7 pertinent, particularly given that he's now being confronted with
- 8 testimony that was given by the very same witness to which he's
- 9 being asked to make comparisons to.
- 10 And I think, in fairness to the Defence, we should be allowed to
- 11 explore the same sort of areas. And, if the Judges avail
- 12 themselves to ask the sort of questions that we're asking, we
- 13 should be able to ask those questions as well. Thank you.
- 14 (Judges deliberate)
- 15 [10.14.38]
- 16 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 17 Counsel for Mr. Nuon Chea, you are now instructed to rephrase
- 18 your question.
- 19 And please be advised question that invites witness to speculate
- 20 should be avoided.
- 21 BY MR. IANUZZI:
- 22 I will certainly do that, Mr. President. Thank you.
- 23 Q. Mr. Witness, just to recap what's just happened, again, I've
- 24 told you that Mr. Sao Sarun has come into this Chamber, has given
- 25 testimony before this Chamber, explicitly denying, rejecting, not

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 accepting a piece of your evidence which you have confirmed for
- 2 us today.
- 3 So, my simple question is: Do you have any personal knowledge as
- 4 to why he would do that? Do you have any personal knowledge to
- 5 indicate that he's attempting to minimize his responsibility
- 6 before this Chamber as it obviously appears? If you don't, Mr.
- 7 Witness, if you don't have any personal knowledge, then you can
- 8 simply tell us, and that's completely acceptable to me. I
- 9 couldn't expect you to tell us something that you don't know
- 10 anything about.
- 11 [10.16.25]
- 12 MR. PHAN VAN:
- 13 A. I don't know about this.
- 14 Q. Very well. Thank you for that.
- 15 Mr. Witness, I have one more question on this topic, the topic of
- 16 Sao Sarun, and then I'll move on to my next one.
- 17 Again, just to refresh your memory, earlier, not very long ago at
- 18 all, I read three passages to you from a document prepared by
- 19 DC-Cam, and we had a discussion about those passages. Those very
- 20 passages, those same passages, passages which, I should add, that
- 21 you agreed with either wholly or in part -- or in part, you did
- 22 make some qualifications; however, I would say that you generally
- 23 agreed with them -- those very passages were put to Mr. Sao
- 24 Sarun, and again, he rejected them outright, and this is what he
- 25 had to say to the Chamber:

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 "My answer to this is that this matter is not correct. Those who
- 2 reported this [are exaggerating] the facts. I never saw or knew
- 3 [of] killings of the people. I deny this statement. [...] When I
- 4 took power, it last only for two months. I was not a strong man
- 5 who arrested the people. I reject what was read out just now. It
- 6 was accusing me incorrectly."
- 7 [10.17.56]
- 8 So, again, my question would be: Do you have any personal
- 9 knowledge -- any personal knowledge as to why Mr. Sao Sarun would
- 10 come to Court and reject these passages which relate to his
- 11 responsibility? Do you know do you know -- and tell us if you
- 12 don't -- that he is attempting to minimize his responsibility
- 13 before this Trial Chamber?
- 14 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 15 Witness is now instructed not to respond to the question because
- 16 it was inviting you to speculate.
- 17 Counsel has already been advised. And be cautious when putting
- 18 questions to the witness. And counsels were asked also not to put
- 19 questions that inviting such speculation.
- 20 [10.19.02]
- 21 MR. IANUZZI:
- 22 Thank you, Mr. President.
- 23 I will move on, but before I do that I will just say, for the
- 24 record, it was a completely appropriate question. It was framed
- 25 as a search for information that may be within the--

- 1 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 2 You may as well proceed.
- 3 The questions, again, that are inviting a witness to speculate or
- 4 provide his or her personal conclusion are not allowed.
- 5 MR. IANUZZI:
- 6 Thank you. Just to clarify that, did you say "personal
- 7 conclusion"? That's what came through on the English translation,
- 8 that we are not permitted to elicit witnesses' "personal
- 9 conclusions".
- 10 So my question would be: What else are we doing here?
- 11 [10.19.55]
- 12 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 13 Indeed, the witness is not expected to speculate. That's all.
- 14 And this has been the practice all along from the very beginning
- 15 of this trial. It has been more than one year that we've been
- 16 adhering to the same practices. Questions that -- questions by
- 17 the counsel to the experts may be of those that are for some kind
- 18 of personal rather, speculation, if you like.
- 19 Mr. Co-Prosecutor, you may now proceed.
- 20 MR. DE WILDE D'ESTMAEL:
- 21 Thank you, Mr. President.
- 22 For the purposes of the transcript and so that we all understand
- 23 each other, when I heard the French translation, it mentioned
- 24 hypothetical conclusions -- "hypothétique" -- and so that
- 25 presumably came from the English, and so we're not talking about

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 personal conclusions, but hypothetical ones. That, at least, is
- 2 what we heard. Thank you.
- 3 [10.21.18]
- 4 MR. IANUZZI:
- 5 Perhaps, then, it's just, as so many things are in this Chamber,
- 6 a matter of translation.
- 7 I can assure you it was not a hypothetical question. It was not a
- 8 request for the witness to speculate. It was simply a request
- 9 whether or not the witness knew that a particular thing had
- 10 occurred, whether it was in the witness' knowledge that Sao Sarun
- 11 denied his own -- excuse me, minimized his own responsibility
- 12 here in Court, whether that's why he denied all those questions
- 13 that were put to him about his own role.
- 14 Again, if the witness doesn't know that, there's nothing I can do
- 15 about that, and I don't want the witness to speculate. So, that's
- 16 all I have to say.
- 17 And again, getting back to what you said, Mr. President, about
- 18 experts, I don't see how that really applies. I wasn't asking for
- 19 an expert opinion from this witness; I was asking for his
- 20 personal--
- 21 [10.22.20]
- 22 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 23 Counsel, you may proceed to other questions, please. You are not
- 24 allowed to give us instruction or teaching us.
- 25 BY MR. IANUZZI:

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 I wouldn't dare, Mr. President. I'll move on to my next structure
- 2 -- my next questions.
- 3 Q. And these questions, Mr. Witness, relate to K-17 -- Office
- 4 K-17 -- and its communication structure. And I'm going to ask you
- 5 a few questions about what you've told us already. This shouldn't
- 6 take too long. Hopefully, I can finish this segment before the
- 7 morning coffee break.
- 8 Yesterday and the day before, you answered some questions by the
- 9 International Co-Prosecutor regarding alleged communications
- 10 between Office K-17 and Nuon Chea, our client, on two issues in
- 11 particular: Security matters, I believe you said, and invitations
- 12 to certain meetings in Phnom Penh. And with respect to the second
- 13 category with respect to the second category -- that is, the
- 14 invitation to the meetings -- you have described a certain
- 15 invitation a certain invitation that closely preceded your
- 16 father's death. And, just to reorient you, this is -- this
- 17 relates, excuse me, to a discussion that you had yesterday with
- 18 Judge Lavergne, the French Judge on the Bench.
- 19 [10.23.56]
- 20 You, no doubt, heard what I had to say yesterday about that
- 21 issue. I stand by that position, that it's an irrelevant topic --
- 22 it's an irrelevant topic, what happened to your father after he
- 23 arrived in Phnom Penh. However, given that the Bench seems to
- 24 take a particular interest in this, I'm going to ask you just one
- 25 or two questions about that--

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 2 Counsel, you are instructed not to make a lot of comments before
- 3 putting questions. You may proceed to the questions right away.
- 4 Please try not to make a lot -- unnecessary comments that may
- 5 lead to you putting some leading questions because of the
- 6 comments. The questions should be simple, short, and precise, and
- 7 then they must not be repetitive, because if the questions are
- 8 framed in that nature, you will get straightforward response.
- 9 MR. IANUZZI:
- 10 Thank you, Mr. President. I will just say, for the record, at
- 11 times it is necessary to set a context for questions; everybody
- 12 does that before this Chamber -- every single advocate who has
- 13 been on his or her feet has done--
- 14 [10.25.22]
- 15 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 16 But what we what to hear from you now is putting the question
- 17 right away. Indeed, you are not given the opportunity here to
- 18 make any comments. You have been told that the floor is given to
- 19 you to put questions to the witness.
- 20 BY MR. IANUZZI:
- 21 Tout de suite, Mr. President. I will do that immediately.
- 22 Q. Mr. Witness, you discussed the death of your father with Judge
- 23 Lavergne. Judge Lavergne asked you when that particular episode
- 24 occurred, and you told Judge Lavergne, if I'm not (sic) correct,
- 25 that you were not quite sure about the precise date.

- 1 So, I'd like to refer you, if I may, to one of your statements,
- 2 and this is another record of one of those interviews that you
- 3 gave to the investigators of the Office of the Co-Investigating
- 4 Judges, and this one in particular is E3/57 E3/57 and,
- 5 again, I believe that's the same one I mentioned already, so I
- 6 don't need to read out the ERN numbers again. I will refer you
- 7 strictly to the page: page 6. Again, it's the same page that I
- 8 mentioned before.
- 9 [10.26.53]
- 10 And you were asked this question: "In what year did you come to
- 11 Phnom Penh with your father?" And this is very much in the
- 12 context of what you told Judge Lavergne.
- 13 And you said: "In late 1977."
- 14 Now, does that refresh your recollection in any in any sense as
- 15 to when you made that, allegedly, ultimate trip -- that is, the
- 16 last trip your father is said to have made to Phnom Penh? Could
- 17 it have been in -- or was it in late 1977 as you told the
- 18 investigators?
- 19 MR. PHAN VAN:
- 20 A. I stated that I did not remember this quite clearly.
- 21 Q. Very well. Thank you, Mr. Witness. So, do you not stand by
- 22 your statement, then?
- 23 A. The statement that I stand by is that I'm not quite sure about
- 24 that.
- 25 Q. Very well. Perhaps we could try to figure it out.

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 You told us that you and your father -- or that your father made
- 2 many trips to Phnom Penh -- many trips -- and that you
- 3 accompanied him on those on those trips; is that correct? He
- 4 made several trips to Phnom Penh and you accompanied him each and
- 5 every time?
- 6 [10.28.52]
- 7 A. Yes, it is correct.
- 8 Q. Do you have any idea -- do you have any recollection and,
- 9 again, just tell me if you don't -- do you have any recollection
- 10 as to how many of those trips you made? Was it two or three? Was
- 11 it 10? Was it 25? Roughly -- can you give us a rough guess or
- 12 rough estimation? Or, if you perhaps, if you remember clearly,
- 13 how many of those trips did you make to Phnom Penh with your
- 14 father?
- 15 A. I don't remember this. I may say I don't know.
- 16 Q. Thank you. Would it be more than 10 or less than 10? Are you
- 17 able to say that?
- 18 A. I don't quite understand your question. Are you saying --
- 19 talking about the frequency of my going with him in a period of
- one month, one year, or the whole period?
- 21 Q. No, I'm just -- apologies for not being clear. I'm still
- 22 trying to see if we can arrive at a rough estimation as to when
- 23 that final trip took place. So, I'm asking you, did you take more
- 24 or less than 10 trips in total with your father, if you remember?
- 25 A. I may say it was less than 10 times.

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 [10.30.36]
- 2 Q. Thank you. Thank you very much.
- 3 I will move on now to my second question regarding this alleged
- 4 invitation to Phnom Penh, the invitation that you discussed with
- 5 Judge Lavergne.
- 6 Do you know the reason that was given for your father to go on-
- 7 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 8 Counsel, please accept our apologies to interrupt. Indeed, you
- 9 are now moving to the new topic in your questioning, and since it
- 10 is now appropriate time for the adjournment, we may adjourn, and
- 11 that when we resume, you can proceed with a new line of
- 12 questioning.
- 13 Court officer is now instructed to assist the witness and his
- 14 duty counsel during the adjournment and have them return to the
- 15 courtroom when the next session resumes. We'll resume at 10 to
- 16 11.00.
- 17 (Court recesses from 1031H to 1053H)
- 18 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 19 Please be seated. The Court is now back in session.
- 20 Without further ado we would like now to hand over to counsel for
- 21 Mr. Nuon Chea to continue putting questions to this witness.
- 22 MR. IANUZZI:
- 23 Thank you, Mr. President. And if I may, just to give everyone on
- 24 the stage an indication of where I am in my examination -- where
- 25 we are in our examination, I believe I had approximately 30 more

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 minutes of questioning. My colleague, Major Son Arun, informs me
- 2 that he has about 40 minutes himself.
- 3 [10.53.50]
- 4 I believe, and I just want to confirm this, that the Defence,
- 5 collectively, has an entire day with this witness and perhaps
- 6 more, given the flexibility that we've shown to our colleagues
- 7 across the stage. So I don't think we'll have any problems
- 8 fitting all of our questioning into that day, plus, if necessary.
- 9 And I will move as quickly as I can now.
- 10 BY MR. IANUZZI:
- 11 Q. Mr. Witness, welcome back. And, again, good morning.
- 12 Turning back to the question that I attempted to start just
- 13 before the break, you again discussed this final trip that your
- 14 father took to Phnom Penh, with Judge Lavergne, and I've been
- 15 asking you some questions about it, myself.
- 16 So, one more question about that: Do you know or were you
- 17 informed by your father or anyone else as to the reasons given
- 18 for that journey, the purpose of that journey? Why, in other
- 19 words, was your father invited to Phnom Penh on that particular
- 20 occasion?
- 21 [10.55.13]
- 22 MR. PHAN VAN:
- 23 A. I don't know about this. I only accompanied him because it was
- 24 my duty to do so.
- 25 Q. Thank you.

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 And now I would like to confront you with something. I'm going to
- 2 have -- I'm going to make reference to one of your statements to
- 3 the OCIJ, and this one is E3/58. And I'm looking now at page 4 of
- 4 that document in English -- page 4 -- and that's English ERN
- 5 00250089, the Khmer ERN 00239937, and the French ERN 00283915.
- 6 Now, in this -- as this document reflects to us -- to all of us,
- 7 to the parties to the Chamber -- there's an exchange between you
- 8 and the investigator who prepared that statement -- or the
- 9 investigators and translators who prepared that statement --
- 10 regarding this event that we've been talking about.
- 11 However, there was a bit that was left out of the answer you
- 12 gave, and we know this because we have audio records of these -
- 13 of these interview sessions. And unfortunately, as we've seen
- over the course of this trial, often, far too often, the written
- 15 records don't reflect what actually transpired -- what was
- 16 actually said completely. We've had -- quite frankly, we've had
- 17 serious problems with this over the course of the trial.
- 18 [10.57.08]
- 19 Now, the Judges don't seem too concerned about this. They've --
- 20 they haven't taken an interest in these problems at all. However,
- 21 it is important for us -- it's very important for us, as defence
- 22 counsel, to be able to confront you with -- well, with what
- 23 you've actually said, and not what is oftentimes reflected in
- 24 these in these statements.
- 25 Now, as a matter of fact -- turning back to my question, as a

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 matter of fact, you told the investigators -- you may not recall
- 2 it, but you told the investigators that your father was called to
- 3 Phnom Penh on that particular occasion to discuss something to do
- 4 with Vietnam -- with the situation with Vietnam. Now, that is not
- 5 reflected in the written record; it is on the audio recording.
- 6 Does that refresh your recollection at all? Did your father's
- 7 trip to Phnom Penh -- that final trip -- have anything to do with
- 8 a discussion regarding the situation -- that is, the conflict
- 9 between Cambodia and Vietnam?
- 10 [10.58.09]
- 11 And please don't answer the question; my colleague is about to
- 12 object.
- 13 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 14 Witness, please hold on.
- 15 International Co-Prosecutor, you may proceed.
- 16 MR. DE WILDE D'ESTMAEL:
- 17 Thank you, Mr. President. I'm not necessarily opposed to the
- 18 question, but rather the prologue which preceded the question,
- 19 which could possibly influence the witness. And the reference is
- 20 made -- I don't believe it is appropriate at all to introduce
- 21 such subjects which could have been made at a previous stage, had
- 22 the Defence sought to.
- 23 And, based on what has already been said, what has already been
- 24 recorded, the Defence should be in a position to tell us exactly
- 25 which extracts from the audio transcript they are referring to,

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 which ERNs are being referred to, and verify that such words were
- 2 indeed spoken at the interview before the investigators.
- 3 Thank you, Mr. President.
- 4 [10.59.30]
- 5 MR. IANUZZI:
- 6 If I could just respond, very briefly, first of all, the purpose
- 7 of the prologue was not in any way to influence the witness. The
- 8 purpose of the prologue was perhaps a futile attempt to influence
- 9 the Trial Chamber, who seems, time and again, uninterested in the
- 10 shortcomings of the judicial investigation. So, that was the
- 11 reason for that comment -- for the "prologue", as my colleague
- 12 put it.
- 13 The transcript that I'm working from was a -- well, it's a
- 14 transcript that was prepared by a member of our staff -- a member
- 15 of our team, and that individual listened to the audio record and
- 16 made a note of this.
- 17 So, perhaps I'll just ask the witness again.
- 18 [11.00.11]
- 19 BY MR. IANUZZI:
- 20 Q. Mr. Witness, do you recall and, if you don't, simply tell us
- 21 -- that the purpose of that trip -- the purpose of that trip had
- 22 something to do with the conflict in Vietnam?
- 23 And, again, I'm going to have to ask you not to answer the
- 24 question because another one of my colleagues is about to object.
- 25 MR. PRESIDENT:

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 Counsel for the civil parties, you may now proceed.
- 2 MS. SIMONNEAU-FORT:
- 3 Mr. President, once again, I need the references of the hearing
- 4 with this gentleman. The Defence's notes are not adequate, and I
- 5 would like to have the precise references. Thank you.
- 6 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 7 Counsel for Mr. Nuon Chea, you are now instructed to provide the
- 8 reference you cite from to both the Chamber and the parties to
- 9 the proceedings; that's first point.
- 10 [11.01.21]
- 11 Secondly, you may proceed putting some specific question and that
- 12 -- you are instructed to avoid making any lengthy comments that
- 13 may influence the witness. We have already received observation
- 14 from the Prosecution on this. And that -- please expedite your
- 15 line of questioning by not going into that again.
- 16 BY MR. IANUZZI:
- 17 Thank you, Mr. President. I will indeed be brief. I've already
- 18 given the indication of the reference number. It's document
- 19 E3/58. And, as we all know, on the file are audio recordings of
- 20 all of those documents. So, this would be, naturally, D125/160;
- 21 that is the previous designation given to this document before
- 22 the OCIJ -- 160R, for "Recording". I believe it's the it's the
- 23 terminology that's been used all along, since the beginning of
- 24 these proceedings. So, just to make it clear, it's the audio
- 25 recording of that statement that I read out.

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 [11.02.38]
- 2 Again, I really -- I'm just interested. I'm trying to refresh the
- 3 witness' recollection, if that's possible. If not, that's fine.
- 4 Q. So, again, Mr. Witness, let me very simply and briefly repeat
- 5 the question: Do you recall telling the investigators of the OCIJ
- 6 that the purpose of that trip, the reason for that trip was in
- 7 order to discuss something to do with the conflict between
- 8 Cambodia and Vietnam? And, again, if you don't, simply tell us;
- 9 that's fine.
- 10 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 11 Lead Co-Lawyer for the civil party, you may now proceed.
- 12 MS. SIMONNEAU-FORT:
- 13 Mr. President, I don't know if my learned friend is doing this on
- 14 purpose, but he is giving us the references of the record of the
- 15 hearing with the Investigating Judge and he is pointing out
- 16 discrepancies with what was registered.
- 17 So, perhaps he should show us what was actually recorded rather
- 18 than simply giving us the code of the document. Thank you.
- 19 [11.04.04]
- 20 MR. IANUZZI:
- 21 Well, I will just add that I, indeed, do everything on purpose
- 22 here.
- 23 That reference was in fact to page 4; I believe I said that
- 24 already. I read out I read out the ERNs of that particular
- 25 question.

- 1 Now, as we all know -- as we all know, but perhaps as the public
- 2 and commentators on this tribunal do not know, that question and
- 3 answer -- that single question and answer is actually an
- 4 amalgamation of many, many questions and answers, with portions
- 5 omitted, portions embellished, portions left out, portions
- 6 expanded upon -- all sorts of things. We're all aware of this.
- 7 We're all aware of this.
- 8 So, it's very difficult. I would have to spend the next 20--
- 9 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 10 Counsel, please hold on.
- 11 (Judges deliberate)
- 12 [11.06.28]
- 13 International Co-Prosecutor, you may now proceed.
- 14 MR. DE WILDE D'ESTMAEL:
- 15 Thank you, Mr. President. So that the Nuon Chea defence can be
- 16 fully conversant with what is normally don't in this Chamber,
- 17 normally one gives the R-letter code and also the time, minute,
- 18 and second when the exchange took place. I think the Nuon Chea
- 19 defence might like to draw on Khieu Samphan's defence practice,
- 20 which provided the parties with three extracts -- three partial
- 21 transcripts of the audio document relating to the Kham Phan
- 22 record. And so we have the translation in French and English from
- 23 Khmer, and we have a reference, and we can identify page numbers,
- 24 and times, and minutes -- hours and minutes of recordings.
- 25 Mr. President, can I also point out that once again, in its last

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 statement, the Nuon Chea defence once again began to make
- 2 comments about the quality of the transcripts and records and the
- 3 way in which they have been produced, which had been banned by
- 4 the Chamber just before. And I would request that he abstains
- 5 from making such comments in the future with a view to
- 6 influencing the thinking of the witness. Thank you.
- 7 [11.08.07]
- 8 MR. IANUZZI:
- 9 Thank you for that. I will just respond very briefly to those
- 10 points.
- 11 First of all, with respect to what normally -- what normally
- 12 transpires on this stage, I don't think what transpires on this
- 13 stage has been normalized in any sense; I think we see a
- 14 variation of procedures that change, I would say, sort of by the
- day, by the witness. However, I will move on.
- 16 I accept that the Khieu Samphan team has been submitting
- 17 transcripts of audio recordings, and I think that's an excellent
- 18 practice. We have done that in the past. Unfortunately, at times
- 19 at times -- this is cross-examination, and things move quickly,
- 20 so we listened to this we listened to this last night and this
- 21 morning in preparation for our cross-examination, based on
- 22 questions that were asked by Judge Lavergne yesterday. So, the
- 23 suggestion that we should have presented some kind of transcript
- 24 -- again, that we should behave as mind-readers, as this Chamber
- 25 likes to think sometimes -- it's -- well, it doesn't hold. I

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 didn't know I was going to use this yesterday. I decided to do it
- 2 yesterday and I asked one of my team members to helpfully produce
- 3 a transcript to assist me in the questioning of the witness.
- 4 [11.09.22]
- 5 Now, I will certainly certainly submit a request to the ITU
- 6 that that portion be transcribed and placed on the case file so
- 7 that we can then look at that later.
- 8 I'm simply asking the witness now, and informing him in good
- 9 faith, based on what my team member has told me, that the record
- 10 itself, the audio record, contains a reference to a meeting in
- 11 Vietnam. So, if the witness remembers that, fine. If the witness
- 12 doesn't remember that, then that's fine. But that's outside of my
- 13 control.
- 14 So, perhaps I could just put the question one more time to the
- 15 witness. He could give us the answer, whatever answer he's going
- 16 to give us -- I'm not trying to influence him in any way -- and
- 17 then we will make the request and have the transcript placed on
- 18 the file.
- 19 [11.10.08]
- 20 BY MR. IANUZZI:
- 21 Q. So, Mr. Witness, again, once last time and, please, don't
- 22 take anything that I've said, anything I've said to influence you
- 23 in any way -- do you remember telling the investigators of the
- 24 OCIJ that the purpose of that meeting had something to do with
- 25 the conflict between Cambodia and Vietnam?

- 1 MR. PHAN VAN:
- 2 A. No, I don't.
- 3 Q. Very well.
- 4 Thank you, Mr. Witness. I'll now move on to another topic within
- 5 -- I'm still within the communication structure. I'd like to
- 6 discuss now, for a little while, particular communications --
- 7 nothing in the abstract, nothing in general, but particular
- 8 communications, and that would include telegrams, conversations,
- 9 letters, whatever correspondence that you, yourself, engaged in.
- 10 So I'm again, as always, interested in your personal experience.
- 11 Over the course of these days, you've told us quite a bit about
- 12 some of those communications, and indeed, you told us that
- 13 members of your family -- your father, your brother, and your
- 14 sister -- were also involved in the communication structure to
- 15 various degrees. And you were also shown several telegrams by the
- 16 International Co-Prosecutor and Judge Lavergne.
- 17 [11.11.51]
- 18 So, I would like to ask you a few questions about specific
- 19 communications. And, again, please limit your answer to your
- 20 personal experience, your personal knowledge, or anything that
- 21 those members of your family that you worked with may or may not
- 22 have told you. And that is also your personal experience, in my
- 23 submission. So I will end my prologue I will end my prologue
- 24 and I would just like to say that, for my part for my part, I
- 25 will limit my questions I will limit my questions to issues of

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 prominence and actual relevance in this trial -- that is, in Case
- 2 002/01, and that is, obviously, the evacuation of Phnom Penh and
- 3 those population movements, what we refer to as the second wave,
- 4 which are said to have taken place between April -- excuse me,
- 5 late -- April 1975 and late 1976 and, in a few cases, early 1977.
- 6 So, with that as a background, let me turn to those core issues
- 7 of the case those core issues of the case--
- 8 [11.13.10]
- 9 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 10 Judge Cartwright, you may proceed.
- 11 JUDGE CARTWRIGHT:
- 12 Thank you, Mr. President.
- 13 Mr. Ianuzzi, you've been asked repeatedly to stop making comments
- 14 or, as you call them, prologues or submissions. Please ask
- 15 questions and please keep your questions brief and slow because
- 16 we will be unable to use much of what you ask the witnesses if
- 17 they can't be translated. Thank you.
- 18 BY MR. IANUZZI:
- 19 Thank you.
- 20 And, again, I do apologize to the translators if I've been
- 21 speaking too quickly.
- 22 Q. So, again, Mr. Witness, I'm going to ask you, as I've just
- 23 been instructed, some questions, and I'm going to keep them
- 24 short, and they are going to relate, as I say, to the core issues
- 25 in this case.

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 [11.14.11]
- 2 So my first question: As far as you are aware -- or did you, your
- 3 father, your brother, or your sister, as far as you know, have
- 4 any communication any communication with Nuon Chea regarding
- 5 the evacuation of Phnom Penh?
- 6 MR. PHAN VAN:
- 7 A. I don't know anything about this, but I learned that there was
- 8 contacts by my father with him.
- 9 Q. Could you be a bit more specific about that? What kind of
- 10 contact are you talking about?
- 11 A. I did not know what could have been the content of the
- 12 communication, but they did meet.
- 13 Q. Thank you, Mr. Witness. Now, I need to clarify something.
- 14 You've just said that you did not know the content of their
- 15 communication. The question was whether or not they had
- 16 communicated with respect to the evacuation of Phnom Penh, and
- 17 you said that, indeed, your father and Nuon Chea had done so.
- 18 [11.15.42]
- 19 So, just make let me make sure I've I've got this clearly. To
- 20 your knowledge, did your father and Nuon Chea communicate
- 21 specifically about the evacuation of Phnom Penh? And if so, how
- 22 do you know that?
- 23 A. I don't know anything about this.
- 24 Q. Very well. Thank you.
- 25 Let me move on now, Mr. Witness, to what we, the parties, refer

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 to as the second phase of the population movement, and that phase
- 2 that phase consists of several alleged instances of population
- 3 movement said to have taken place around around September 1975,
- 4 continuing into 1976 and, in certain outlying instances, 1977.
- 5 Did you, your father, or your brother or sister, to your
- 6 knowledge, have any communication with Nuon Chea regarding
- 7 population movements with respect to the Southwest Zones or the
- 8 Central Zones?
- 9 A. No, I don't know. I was too young to know about this.
- 10 [11.17.24]
- 11 Q. Thank you. What about the East Zone or the West Zone? Did you,
- 12 your father, your brother or your sister, to you knowledge, have
- 13 any communication with Nuon Chea regarding population movements
- 14 in those zones -- the West or the East Zone?
- 15 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 16 Witness, could you please hold on?
- 17 Madam Simonneau-Fort, you may now proceed.
- 18 MS. SIMONNEAU-FORT:
- 19 On that last question, Mr. President, I would like to make an
- 20 objection or ask that my colleague proceed differently because
- 21 he's raising a question about the father or sibling of the
- 22 witness himself. So, I want the question to be put to the witness
- 23 concerning the witness himself rather than about the members of
- 24 his family, because that could lead to confusion.
- 25 [11.18.28]

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 MR. IANUZZI:
- 2 I'm happy to do that. I'm happy to do that, but before I do, I
- 3 would just like to state that, in my estimation, 80 per cent or
- 4 more of what this witness has been telling us throughout his
- 5 testimony has related specifically to his work with his father,
- 6 and he's been telling us time and again things that his father
- 7 told him, things that he learned from his father. So, I will
- 8 happily break it up, but I don't think there's anything wrong
- 9 asking this.
- 10 This witness, in my submission, is here as an agent of his
- 11 father, in a sense. That's what he's been telling us, that's what
- 12 the record reflects.
- 13 So I will proceed.
- 14 [11.19.06]
- 15 BY MR. IANUZZI:
- 16 Q. Again, Mr. Witness, did you personally -- did you
- 17 individually, personally, yourself, engage in any communication
- 18 with Nuon Chea regarding population movements in the East or the
- 19 West Zones of Cambodia, of the country of Democratic Kampuchea?
- 20 Excuse me.
- 21 MR. PHAN VAN:
- 22 A. I don't know about this.
- 23 Q. What about your father or your brother or your sister? Did
- 24 they ever tell you that they engaged in communications with Nuon
- 25 Chea regarding population movements in the East or the West Zone?

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 A. No.
- 2 Q. Thank you. What about Sector 106? That's the Siem Reap Sector.
- 3 Did you ever engage in any lines of communication with Nuon Chea
- 4 regarding population movements into or out of Sector 106, the
- 5 Siem Reap Sector?
- 6 [11.20.34]
- 7 A. I'm afraid I don't quite understand your question. Could you
- 8 please repeat it? Because I had nothing to do with the work in
- 9 Siem Reap.
- 10 Q. That's fine, Mr. Witness, I'll I'll accept that that
- 11 answer. What about the work in the Northwest Zone, including
- 12 Battambang, Pursat, and Banteay Meanchey province? Did you engage
- 13 in any lines of communication with Nuon Chea regarding those
- 14 areas?
- 15 A. No, I was too young, again, to know anything about this.
- 16 Q. Thank you. What about Kampong Thom and Kampong Cham provinces?
- 17 Did you engage in any lines of communication with Nuon Chea
- 18 regarding those areas?
- 19 A. I'm afraid not.
- 20 Q. That's okay, Mr. Witness. Now, just for the sake of
- 21 completeness, did you engage in any lines of communication with
- 22 Nuon Chea from late 1977 up until 1978 with respect to any
- 23 population movements in the East Zone?
- 24 [11.22.32]
- 25 A. No, I didn't.

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 Q. Thank you.
- 2 Now, I'm going to ask you a question about the telegrams that
- 3 were put to you. And I believe, if I'm not mistaken, the
- 4 Co-Prosecutor the International Co-Prosecutor, I believe he
- 5 discussed five particular telegrams with you and I'm sure he
- 6 will correct me if I'm wrong and I believe Judge Lavergne I
- 7 don't remember exactly it was three or four.
- 8 Let me ask you one question and see if you can answer it, and
- 9 then, if not, we can try something else.
- 10 If you recall, did any of those telegrams that were shown to you
- 11 -- any of them -- have anything to do with population movements?
- 12 A. No, I don't understand the message to be relevant to that.
- 13 [11.23.39]
- 14 Q. Very well. Thank you.
- 15 And now, Mr. Witness, I just wonder -- I wonder if you would be
- 16 surprised to know that there is not a single allegation in the
- 17 Closing Order of any forced population movement either into or
- 18 out of Sector 105, in Mondulkiri province -- not a single
- 19 allegation in the indictment that we are trying this case on
- 20 today. Would you be surprised to know that?
- 21 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 22 Witness is now instructed to hold on.
- 23 National Co-Lead Lawyer (sic) for the civil parties, you may now
- 24 proceed.
- 25 MR. PICH ANG:

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 Thank you, Mr. President, and Your Honours.
- 2 We have observed that some questions put by counsel for Nuon Chea
- 3 to the witness, in particular the current question, is put to
- 4 confuse the public. The questions were inviting the witness to
- 5 even make comment concerning the procedural matters in this
- 6 Court, which is not relevant at all.
- 7 [11.25.14]
- 8 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 9 The Co-Prosecutor, you may now proceed.
- 10 MR. De WILDE D'ESTMAEL:
- 11 I do believe, Mr. President, that that last question should be
- 12 reworded so that no comments are made on the contents of the
- 13 Closing Order with respect to Sector 105, but rather as to
- 14 whether the witness has any knowledge on this subject -- if the
- 15 defence is interested in that, of course.
- 16 But comments on the Closing Order are not required. We should ask
- 17 him questions about what he knows about Sector 105 or about Phnom
- 18 Penh with respect to the time he spent there. Thank you.
- 19 [11.26.02]
- 20 MR. IANUZZI:
- 21 Let me respond first to my colleague from the civil parties
- 22 across the stage.
- 23 I was not intending to mislead the public in any sense; I was
- 24 intending, quite frankly, to alert the public that a good deal -
- 25 a good deal of the testimony we've been hearing is not

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 particularly relevant to the communication structures as they
- 2 relate to the underlying crimes at issue in this trial. I
- 3 personally find that strange and I wanted to know if the witness
- 4 himself found that strange, because it seems to me that if we're
- 5 interested in things like communication structure or
- 6 administrative structure, there ought to be some nexus -- there
- 7 ought to be a nexus between those structures and the underlying
- 8 crimes that we're talking about.
- 9 We're not doing a trial in theory -- what may have happened
- 10 there, what may have happened there. Everything that comes into
- 11 Court should be relevant, tied to, relating to the crimes, the
- 12 base crimes, and those crimes, the base crimes, are clearly --
- 13 and I don't think anyone can contradict me on this-
- 14 [11.27.10]
- 15 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 16 The Chamber has already heard enough.
- 17 The objections are sustained.
- 18 Witness is not here bound to make any comments concerning the
- 19 procedures in the Closing Order as to which particular facts are
- 20 at issue.
- 21 Counsels are advised to put questions relevant to the matters as
- 22 stated in the paragraphs of the Closing Order in the confinement
- of Case File 002/1, and everyone is aware of this.
- 24 BY MR. IANUZZI:
- 25 Thank you, Mr. President. I will move on to some areas which we

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 consider highly relevant to our case and which may be within this
- 2 witness's sphere of knowledge.
- 3 [11.28.06]
- 4 Q. Mr. Witness, you've told us about the various locations where
- 5 you've resided over the course of your life. If I could take you
- 6 back to the period approximately from 1969 until 1973 -- and
- 7 you've given testimony already before the Chamber about these
- 8 periods; you've told us where you lived.
- 9 During that time, did you personally experience any bombings by
- 10 the United States of America of Cambodia?
- 11 MR. PHAN VAN:
- 12 A. Yes, I did. I think everyone did.
- 13 Q. When you say "everyone", do you mean everyone in Cambodia?
- 14 A. Yes, that's correct, that's what I presume.
- 15 Q. Thank you. Are you able to describe those bombings in some
- 16 detail? Are you able to give us, based on your personal
- 17 experience, an experience, you say, that was most likely shared
- 18 with the entire country are you able to give us some
- information about the intensity of those bombings?
- 20 [11.29.47]
- 21 A. I'm afraid I don't understand the question. It would be good
- 22 if you rephrase it.
- 23 Q. Indeed, Mr. Witness; I apologize for that. For example, how -
- 24 how many bombings did you experience let's start there if you
- 25 remember?

- 1 A. I knew only what happened at my region. I could hear bombs
- 2 being dropped on -- almost on a daily basis.
- 3 Q. "On a daily basis"; is that what you said, Mr. Witness?
- 4 A. Yes, I did.
- 5 Q. Thank you. Now, do you know do you know is it within your
- 6 knowledge, either something you experienced directly or
- 7 something, perhaps, that was told to you by a member of your
- 8 family do you know whether or not those bombs those American
- 9 bombs destroyed the rice fields in Cambodia in your area?
- 10 [11.31.09]
- 11 A. Yes, they did.
- 12 Q. Thank you--
- 13 A. I did not just hear what they told me about this, but I saw
- 14 this first-hand. At that time, people had built a trench a
- 15 bunker at every home and they had to make sure they can cook
- 16 their rice early in the morning so that they could eat the rice
- 17 for the whole day when they took refuge in the bunkers.
- 18 Q. And, just so I have it clearly, they were taking refuge in
- 19 those bunkers to avoid being killed or injured by those bombs; is
- 20 that is that correct?
- 21 A. Yes, it is.
- 22 Q. Thank you, Mr. Witness. One last question on this point: To
- 23 your knowledge to your personal knowledge, did any Cambodians
- 24 die, lose their lives as a result of those bombings, those
- 25 bombings by the United States of America?

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 A. Yes.
- 2 [11.32.24]
- 3 Q. Thank you, Mr. Witness.
- 4 Now, if I may turn to something that you told us -- and I can be
- 5 very brief here -- you did mention and I believe it was on your
- 6 first day of testimony, on Tuesday -- that you encountered Ta Mok
- 7 at B-20. Did I get you correctly? Is that is that right? Did
- 8 you encounter Ta Mok during your time at B-20?
- 9 A. No, that is not correct. I did not encounter with Ta Mok.
- 10 Q. Thank you. Did you ever encounter Ta Mok?
- 11 A. No, I didn't.
- 12 Q. Thank you.
- 13 If I may turn -- and this will be the last time I refer to one of
- 14 your statements -- and this, I believe, is the most recent
- 15 statement you gave to the Office of the Co-Investigating Judges,
- 16 and I believe the civil parties made made quite a bit of use of
- 17 this one. It contains a lot of information with respect to Ieng
- 18 Thirith.
- 19 [11.33.47]
- 20 However, on one particular page of this document -- and this,
- 21 again, is E3/447. And, I apologize, I only have the English ERNs,
- 22 but I have a very, very simple question. The page I'm looking at
- 23 is English ERN 00486512.
- 24 And you said in that statement, in that statement of the 28th of
- 25 February 2010 you mention that -- and I'm quoting -- "Suon,

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 Keat Chhon, and Sar Kimlomouth also worked with Ieng Sary."
- 2 So, my question is: who is Keat Chhon?
- 3 A. That I do not know. When they went to ask -- when they visited
- 4 us, they did ask us a question about this person and that person,
- 5 and I told them that I did not know them personally. I only heard
- 6 their names, but I did not have any personal contacts or knew
- 7 them personally.
- 8 Q. Do you remember telling the investigators that Keat Chhon, as
- 9 well as those two others, worked with Ieng Sary? Do you remember
- 10 that? Do you remember any discussion of Keat Chhon with the OCIJ?
- 11 A. No, I don't.
- 12 [11.35.43]
- 13 Q. Thank you, Mr. Witness. And perhaps I'm mispronouncing their
- 14 names. So, just so it's very clear, that individual is the
- 15 current Minister of Finance in the Royal Government of Cambodia.
- 16 Does that refresh your recollection at all?
- 17 A. No, I do not recall.
- 18 Q. Thank you. And one last question on this point: Have you heard
- 19 are you familiar with the fact that the Minister of Information
- 20 in Cambodia, whose name, apparently, you don't remember, has
- 21 refused to cooperate with this tribunal? Have you have you
- 22 heard that in recent--
- 23 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 24 Witness need not respond to this question; it is not relevant at
- 25 all.

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 [11.36.53]
- 2 BY MR. IANUZZI:
- 3 Well, I believe I'm on record as saying why I believe that's
- 4 relevant, so I will move on.
- 5 Just a few more questions, Mr. Witness, and I will cede the floor
- 6 to my colleague.
- 7 Q. Let's if we could turn back just for a moment to the issue
- 8 of forced movement of the Cambodian population and you've told
- 9 us quite a bit about your experience at K-17 "Kor-Dop-Prampi",
- 10 I believe, is how that's pronounced in Khmer -- can you tell us
- 11 anything about population movements with respect to "Kor-Pram"?
- 12 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 13 Prosecutor, you may proceed.
- 14 MR. De WILDE D'ESTMAEL:
- 15 Thank you, President. I believe that the witness appreciates that
- 16 my esteemed colleague is trying to attempts speaking Khmer, but
- 17 I don't believe that for the other parties, we were not able to
- 18 understand exactly what "ka prom" (phonetic) was.
- 19 Would my colleague be so obliging as to express himself in a
- 20 language that we can all understand?
- 21 [11.38.31]
- 22 BY MR. IANUZZI:
- 23 Excuse me; I would be happy to do that. "Kor-Pram" is K-5, and I
- 24 believe that's well known to all of us here.
- 25 Q. Mr. Witness, what can you tell us about population movements

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 with respect to K 5 -- or "Kor-Pram" -- that may have occurred in
- 2 the Northwest of Cambodia in the 1980s? What can you tell us
- 3 about that, if anything?
- 4 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 5 Witness needs not answer to this line of questioning because it
- 6 is completely irrelevant.
- 7 [11.39.15]
- 8 MR. IANUZZI:
- 9 Well, I will have to insist on this point because it is relevant.
- 10 It is relevant to the number of deaths that may have been--
- 11 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 12 You are not allowed to comment any further. You may move on to a
- 13 more specific question. If we grant leave for the witness to
- 14 respond to the questions, we would not interrupt your line of
- 15 questioning, but if we find that the question is irrelevant, then
- 16 we will advise the witness accordingly. And the decision has
- 17 already been made that you are not allowed to put this line of
- 18 questioning to the witness.
- 19 You may move on.
- 20 MR. IANUZZI:
- 21 Thank you, Mr. President. I will move on to my final question.
- 22 Before I do that, I'd just like to make a request for
- 23 clarification. Is the reason that I'm not allowed to explore K 5
- 24 because many of the crimes that were committed during K 5 are
- 25 similar--

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 [11.40.22]
- 2 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 3 The issue has already been ruled upon, and the witness has been
- 4 directed not to respond to the question because the question is
- 5 irrelevant. The question is completely irrelevant to the alleged
- 6 facts concerning the co accused. And I repeat: the question is
- 7 irrelevant to the alleged facts against the co accused.
- 8 BY MR. IANUZZI:
- 9 Thank you, Mr. President. I will move on, then, to my last
- 10 question.
- 11 Q. Mr. Witness, on Tuesday -- and this is indeed my last question
- 12 -- on Tuesday, when testifying about a certain meeting that took
- 13 place at the stadium in Phnom Penh in May 1975, you indicated
- 14 that you did not attend that meeting. However, you did go to the
- 15 stadium at night to watch a play.
- 16 So, my question is: What kind of a play was it? Was it in any way
- 17 similar to the play that's been unfolding here, on this stage,
- 18 before this Trial Chamber?
- 19 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 20 Witness needs not answer to this question.
- 21 (Judges deliberate)
- 22 [11.42.36]
- 23 Counsel, you may move on to the next question. Otherwise, your
- 24 act is amounted to a contempt of the Court.
- 25 MR. IANUZZI:

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 MR. IANUZZI:
- 2 Thank you, Mr. President. I will move on. I'm I'm only trying,
- 3 in my own borish way, to suggest that if the Trial Chamber
- 4 continues to work from a script, with cues and stage directions,
- 5 these proceedings take on all the dignity of a very bad--
- 6 (Judges deliberate)
- 7 [11.43.06]
- 8 --a very bad "Gilbert and Sullivan", was the end of the quote.
- 9 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 10 Please, be seated. The Judge is now deliberating. You may sit
- 11 down.
- 12 (Judges deliberate)
- 13 [11.45.17]
- 14 MR. IANUZZI:
- 15 Mr. President, that's all I had for the witness.
- 16 Thank you, Mr. Witness--
- 17 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 18 Sit down. The Chamber has not granted you any the floor to
- 19 raise any other issue.
- 20 The Chamber needs to rule upon this issue.
- 21 (Judges deliberate)
- 22 [11.48.14]
- 23 Please rise, Counsel for Mr. Nuon Chea.
- 24 The Chamber finds that lawyer has abused the proceedings and he
- 25 has contempted the Court despite repeated warning by the Chamber

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 throughout the course of the proceedings, and today it is very
- 2 obvious that the lawyer is intending to obstruct the proceedings,
- 3 and counsel is also abusing the proceedings.
- 4 The Chamber, therefore, decides to dispel you from these
- 5 proceedings.
- 6 MR. IANUZZI:
- 7 Do you mean that I should leave, Mr. President?
- 8 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 9 Yes, you must leave the courtroom for today, pursuant to Rule
- 10 38.1 of the Internal Rules, on the misconduct of lawyers. You
- 11 must leave the courtroom now; you are not allowed to make any
- 12 comment.
- 13 MR. IANUZZI:
- 14 I believe I will remain with my client--
- 15 [11.50.07]
- 16 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 17 You must leave now.
- 18 (Short pause)
- 19 Again, the Chamber orders that counsel leave the courtroom for
- 20 today. And as for the next day, the Chamber will issue a decision
- 21 accordingly.
- 22 Security guards are instructed to ensure the order of this
- 23 courtroom and security guards are instructed to escort Mr. Andrew
- 24 Ianuzzi, the defence lawyer for Mr. Nuon Chea, out of this
- 25 courtroom.

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 MR. IANUZZI:
- 2 I will await my escort.
- 3 (Counsel Ianuzzi exits courtroom)
- 4 [11.52.14]
- 5 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 6 Counsel Son Arun, do you have any questions to put to the witness
- 7 at question now?
- 8 MR. SON ARUN:
- 9 Good morning, Mr. President. Good morning, Your Honours. I have
- 10 prepared my questions to put the witness, and it may take
- 11 approximately 40 to 50 minutes. And I look at the clock; there
- 12 remains approximately nine to 10 minutes. I await your decision.
- 13 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 14 You may proceed. And try your level best to put your question.
- 15 OUESTIONING BY MR. SON ARUN:
- 16 Good morning, Witness Phan Van. My name is Son Arun. I am the
- 17 national counsel for Mr. Nuon Chea. I would like to follow up
- 18 with the questions from my international colleague, Mr. Andrew
- 19 Ianuzzi.
- 20 [11.53.14]
- 21 Q. I would like to go back a little bit to your background. I
- 22 know that the prosecutors and other parties have asked questions
- 23 about your background, but I am not clear with certain points, so
- 24 I would like to ask for further clarification.
- 25 You said you joined the Revolution led by the Khmer Rouge forces.

- 1 I would like to know, how old were you when you joined the
- 2 Revolution?
- 3 MR. PHAN VAN:
- 4 A. As I mentioned from the start, I joined the Revolution, along
- 5 with my father, since I was very young.
- 6 Q. Yes, that's the point. I am asking you to tell me exactly how
- 7 old you were when you joined the Revolution. Can you please be
- 8 more precise?
- 9 [11.54.21]
- 10 A. I do not recall. I joined the Revolution since I was very
- 11 young. I do not recall it. I, at that time, joined my father.
- 12 Q. You then became a messenger for your father. When did you
- 13 become a messenger for your father?
- 14 A. I do not understand your question. You -- are you talking
- 15 about the -- my job as a messenger in the Revolution or for my
- 16 father?
- 17 Q. You told the Court earlier on that you joined the Revolution,
- 18 and first you served as the -- a messenger for your father. So
- 19 that is the point I would like to seek clarification: When did
- 20 you become a messenger for your father?
- 21 A. As I said earlier, I cannot recall the exact date, but after I
- 22 left from the place and I returned to work with my father, I
- 23 became a messenger; it was after the war.
- 24 Q. Prior to the war or after the war? What do you -- which period
- are you referring to? Is it after 1975 or before 1975?

- 1 A. It was before 1975.
- 2 [11.56.08]
- 3 Q. Apart from being the messenger for your father, did you have
- 4 any other portfolio?
- 5 A. No, I didn't. I worked as messenger all along, until my father
- 6 passed away.
- 7 Q. You testified in the Court earlier on that -- your relation
- 8 with Madam Ieng Thirith, and you was once the -- a driver for
- 9 Madam Ieng Thirith, and at the time Mr. Nuon Chea communicated
- 10 via telegrams with Sector 105. And you said that Mr. Nuon Chea
- 11 normally discussed security matters in those telegrams. Can you
- 12 enlighten the Court what security was all about that Mr. Nuon
- 13 Chea communicated with Sector 105? What do you mean by "security
- 14 matters"? And how were security matters handled at that time?
- 15 A. The term "security" at that time, we had to put it in context.
- 16 At that time, there were fighting between Khmer soldiers with the
- 17 Vietnamese soldiers. So, "security matters" was all about the
- 18 conflict between the two sides.
- 19 [11.58.34]
- 20 Q. I do not really get your answer. You mentioned "security
- 21 matters" was the subject of communication between Mr. Nuon Chea
- 22 and Sector 105 and you mentioned that "security" was all about
- 23 the conflict between Vietnamese troops and the Cambodian troops.
- 24 But what was -- the security entailed?
- 25 A. It's rather difficult to explain briefly. "Security" needs to

- 1 be explained. As you said just now, it encompassed the order and
- 2 general security, the killing, the fighting, so on and so forth.
- 3 There were forces who did not get along with each other, and then
- 4 they took refuge in the jungle, and they were resisting. Those
- 5 were also part of the security piece and puzzle.
- 6 And you may ask -- ask them for the details. I think that those
- 7 uncles also knew me and they knew my father as well. So, if you
- 8 wanted to find out what security matters entailed, then you had
- 9 better ask them.
- 10 [12.00.07]
- 11 Q. In documents in the hand of the Court, there were a lot of
- 12 telegrams communicating between Sector 105 and Office 870, and in
- 13 those telegrams, there were the undersigned by the name of Chhan
- 14 and other names. And those telegrams were numbered 1133 or 3, so
- on and so forth. Can you tell the Chamber, please, whether these
- 16 telegrams are the communications made from 105 all the way to
- 17 Office 870?
- 18 I believe that you also have access to these telegrams on your
- 19 desk. Now, I'll give you an example to Telegram Number 3 and
- 20 Telegram 00, and Telegram Number 2 -- there are plenty of them.
- 21 Can you say whether these telegrams were sent from Sector 105 or
- 22 from elsewhere?
- 23 A. Having looked at the telegrams, I can say that they are
- 24 genuine telegrams. However, I do not know something about the
- 25 names because at that time it was my sister who was the decoder

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 when I left the work. But the format and the telegrams are
- 2 genuine.
- 3 Q. You say that these telegrams are genuine telegrams from 105
- 4 Sector. Now, looking at the telegrams on your desk, you can see
- 5 that there are some writing and the head of Naga with writing in
- 6 Khmer, "tela". What do you understand the notes to be?
- 7 A. In my paper, there is no term "tela" as you alluded to.
- 8 (Short pause)
- 9 [12.03.48]
- 10 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 11 Counsel for Mr. Ieng Sary, you may proceed.
- 12 MR. ANG UDOM:
- 13 Pardon me, please. Mr. President and Your Honours, I have
- 14 received the report from my case manager -- case file manager
- 15 from downstairs that Mr. Ieng Sary did not observe the
- 16 proceedings from 11.49, and his heartbeat were irregular, as
- 17 reported also by the doctor.
- 18 May I ask that we adjourn the meeting rather, the hearing
- 19 before we hear update on his medical status?
- 20 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 21 Counsel Son Arun and Counsel Ang Udom, since it is now
- 22 appropriate time for adjournment we would like Counsel Son Arun
- 23 to prepare his notes, and that -- we now adjourn until 2 p.m.
- 24 By 2 p.m., the Chamber continues hearing the testimony of Civil
- 25 Party Madam Denise Affonço through video-link from Paris. We

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 believe that her testimony will be completed by the end of this
- 2 afternoon.
- 3 [12.05.27]
- 4 Mr. Phan Van, your testimony has not yet been concluded. The
- 5 Chamber wishes to summon you to come back tomorrow morning. And
- 6 this afternoon, if possible, you are also invited to come, if we
- 7 have some time left to give parties to put questions to you. And,
- 8 for the time being, we would like to ask that you remain
- 9 somewhere near the vicinity of the Court so that you can be
- 10 available for such testimony if time fits. We would like to
- 11 release you immediately after your testimony is complete because
- 12 we understand that you need to go about your daily life.
- 13 And we would like counsel for the witness to also be with us
- 14 today and tomorrow so that you can give some assistance to him.
- 15 Counsel Son Arun, you may proceed.
- 16 MR. SON ARUN:
- 17 On behalf of my client, I would like to request that my client be
- 18 allowed to observe the proceedings from his holding cell, due to
- 19 his health concerns, because he has some headache, and lack of
- 20 concentration, and some lower back pain.
- 21 The waiver will be submitted to the Chamber in due course.
- 22 [12.07.30]
- 23 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 24 The Chamber notes the request of Mr. Nuon Chea through his
- 25 counsel, in which he has asked that he be allowed to observe the

- 1 proceedings from his holding cell downstairs, due to his health
- 2 concerns.
- 3 The request is somehow appropriate and that -- it is granted. Mr.
- 4 Nuon Chea is now allowed to observe the proceedings from his
- 5 holding cell through audio-visual link.
- 6 Mr. Nuon Chea has expressly waived his right to be present in
- 7 this courtroom. The Chamber would like counsel for Mr. Nuon Chea
- 8 to submit his waiver signed or given thumbprint by Mr. Nuon Chea
- 9 as soon as possible.
- 10 AV booth officers are now instructed to ensure that the AV -
- 11 audio-visual link is well connected into the holding cell where
- 12 Mr. Nuon Chea would be observing the proceedings from.
- 13 [12.08.41]
- 14 Security personnel are now instructed to bring Mr. Nuon Chea and
- 15 Khieu Samphan to their respective holding cell and have Mr. Khieu
- 16 Samphan returned to the courtroom in the afternoon, when the next
- 17 session resumes, at 2 p.m.
- 18 And the Chamber will notify parties concerning other relevant
- 19 issues upon receiving information from the doctor who cares for
- 20 Mr. Ieng Sary.
- 21 The Court is adjourned.
- 22 (Court recesses from 1209H to 1401H)
- 23 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 24 Please be seated. The Court is now back in session.
- 25 As the Chamber already informed the parties to the proceedings

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 already, that -- this afternoon the Chamber continues hearing
- 2 Civil Party Denise Affonço through video-conference from France.
- 3 Counsels for the accused persons will have the opportunity to put
- 4 questions to her.
- 5 [14.02.51]
- 6 Good afternoon, Madam Affonço.
- 7 MS. AFFONÇO:
- 8 Good afternoon.
- 9 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 10 Next, the Chamber would like to hand over to counsels for Mr.
- 11 Nuon Chea to continue putting questions to you. So please be
- 12 informed, Madam.
- 13 MS. AFFONÇO:
- 14 Thank you. I am ready.
- 15 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 16 Thank you.
- 17 The Chamber would like to now hand over to counsels for Mr. Nuon
- 18 Chea to put some questions to Madam Affonço if they would wish to
- 19 do so.
- 20 [14.04.04]
- 21 MR. PAUW:
- 22 Thank you, Mr. President. And good afternoon to everyone in and
- 23 around the courtroom, and especially good morning to you, Madam
- 24 Affonço.
- 25 I, at the moment, do not see you in the screen, Madam Affonço.

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 Mr. President, is there a way that we could have the civil party
- 2 shown on the screen?
- 3 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 4 We will follow the same practice, and hopefully, when she
- 5 responds to your questions, then we hope to see her.
- 6 MR. PAUW:
- 7 I understand. I will proceed--
- 8 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 9 Hold on, please, Counsel. We appear to have experienced some
- 10 technical difficulties now. We hope these problems are fixed
- 11 soon, and then you may proceed.
- 12 (Short pause, technical problem)
- 13 [14.07.43]
- 14 Counsel for Mr. Nuon Chea, you may now proceed.
- 15 MR. PAUW:
- 16 Thank you, Mr. President.
- 17 Madam Affonço, good morning. My name is Jasper Pauw. I am
- 18 international counsel for Mr. Nuon Chea and I will be asking you
- 19 some questions this afternoon -- morning where you are.
- 20 Madam Affonço, I could not help but hear before the proceedings
- 21 started, when you did a sound check, that you are rather nervous
- 22 for this questioning, and I want to tell you that I understand
- 23 this and that I will be asking today straightforward questions
- 24 based on your experience. And, if you feel the questions are too
- 25 complicated or too emotional, please do let me know; then we can

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 move on to a next topic.
- 2 Is this clear to you, Madam Affonço?
- 3 [14.09.22]
- 4 MS. AFFONÇO:
- 5 Yes, Counsel. I entirely understand. I entirely understand.
- 6 QUESTIONING BY MR. PAUW:
- 7 Q. I will today first start by asking you some questions relating
- 8 to the situation in Phnom Penh before April 1975, and I will then
- 9 move to the period that you spent in the countryside.
- 10 First, the situation in Phnom Penh before April 1975.
- 11 You have testified that during the Lon Nol years, many refugees
- 12 entered Phnom Penh. Could you give us an estimate of how many
- 13 refugees entered Phnom Penh?
- 14 MS. AFFONÇO:
- 15 A. Well, you are asking this question 32 years later; I can't
- 16 give you the precise figures. All I know and all I was able to
- 17 see at the time was that every day crowds of refugees arrived in
- 18 Phnom Penh, and in the city then there were about 2 million
- 19 inhabitants. And with all of these refugees who came in towards
- 20 the end, before leaving the city, there were more than 3 million
- 21 of us. But this is not a specific calculation that I have made
- 22 myself.
- 23 [14.11.25]
- 24 Q. I understand this. But, when you were in Phnom Penh in that
- 25 period, did you see the living conditions of those refugees that

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 had entered the city?
- 2 A. Yes. On their arrival, they had practically nothing; they had
- 3 lost everything. They had left part of their lives in the
- 4 villages that they had left. They told us about the trials and
- 5 tribulations they had had before arriving.
- 6 Q. And, once they arrived in Phnom Penh, where would they live?
- 7 A. Some of them had families in Phnom Penh and lived with them;
- 8 others, who didn't have anybody at all, camped on the pavement.
- 9 Now, I can't tell you about the living conditions of each and
- 10 every one of these people because we, ourselves, were
- 11 particularly traumatized by the situation at the time. There were
- 12 shells falling and a battle was going on around the city, so we,
- 13 ourselves, were very traumatized by the living conditions at the
- 14 time.
- 15 [14.13.18]
- 16 Q. And, when you describe that these people camped on the
- 17 pavements, did they camp on the pavements all across the city, or
- 18 was that in specific areas of Phnom Penh?
- 19 A. Well, Counsel, I can't give you any accurate information on
- 20 the subject, apart from what I have just said.
- 21 Q. Madam Affonço, I of course want you to only testify as to what
- 22 you personally have seen. But in those five years of the Lon Nol
- 23 regime, I assume you moved around Phnom Penh at times, and
- 24 perhaps you have seen the refugees as they were camping on the
- 25 pavements. And, if that is true, could you describe whether these

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 refugees were all over the city or whether they were focused more
- 2 on one or several areas of the town?
- 3 A. I'm not sure I can tell you much about that.
- 4 On the other hand, what I can tell you is that we saw a lot of
- 5 the soldiers and military people from the Pension Fund, and they
- 6 were sheltering a good many of their family from outside the
- 7 city.
- 8 On some of the main boulevards, like Monivong, we saw people
- 9 living out and camping in a ramshackle way, but I can't give you
- 10 any precise account of the overall situation. Most of these
- 11 people were in fact accommodated by their friends and by their
- 12 families.
- 13 [14.15.40]
- 14 Q. Thank you. And you also, yesterday, spoke of the prices of
- 15 food products, such as rice. Could you tell us a little bit more
- 16 about the prices of food at the time, in the years of the Lon Nol
- 17 regime?
- 18 A. Well, Counsel, for the precise costs and prices, I would need
- 19 to go back to my book. Now, I am in my seventies, so, if you ask
- 20 me now to recite off the precise prices, that I can't do.
- 21 However, in my book, I did put them down, and you can base
- 22 yourself on that. If there are any mistakes, there's not much I
- 23 can do about that; it's not infallible. But what you're asking me
- 24 to tell you now, I really can't answer you.
- 25 But I do know that all of the foodstuffs' prices went shooting

- 1 up. There was a big black market. There were Chinese traders, in
- 2 the cities, who were running the black market. Even the sweetened
- 3 condensed milk that we made in the Sokilait factory went up in
- 4 price very considerably.
- 5 Now, if you're going to ask me this question again, I would have
- 6 to pick up my book and quote the prices from what I recorded
- 7 then, including the exchange rates, the riel exchange rate as
- 8 well, because in the French Embassy I was paid half in francs and
- 9 half in riel. And my Chinese partner changed the franc's into
- 10 riel so as to be able to buy enough food to eat.
- 11 [14.17.42]
- 12 Q. Thank you. I think that is already a very detailed answer, and
- 13 there is no need to refer to your book.
- 14 I will quote one excerpt from that book on this topic. And your
- 15 book has been referenced yesterday. It is the document number
- 16 E9/32.2.29, and the ERN is 00678324. And for the translators, I
- 17 will be quoting in French.
- 18 Madam Affonço, in that book you speak about [interpreted from
- 19 French] -- "an astronomical rise in the price of raw materials
- 20 such as rice, vegetables, condensed milk, gas, and so forth".
- 21 [End of interpretation from French] End of quote. And I apologize
- 22 for my pronunciation. But here, indeed, you describe this strong
- 23 increase in price of vital food products. That is indeed what is
- 24 written in your book and that is what you tell us today.
- 25 Do you know, Madam Affonço, if the refugees that came into Phnom

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 Penh and that were living in Phnom Penh sometimes on the
- 2 pavement, whether they had enough money to buy elementary
- 3 foodstuffs all the way up to April 1975?
- 4 [14.20.07]
- 5 A. Counsel, once again, let me repeat that I have not had time to
- 6 garner information so as to know if the refugees who were coming
- 7 in and who were not actually housed by friends or family had
- 8 enough to eat. I think that in those days the Lon Nol regime had
- 9 enough resources, with all the U.S. assistance they were
- 10 receiving, in order to assist those people. But I personally
- 11 didn't have the time to deal with all of these issues. My family
- 12 was quite enough worry for me as it was -- indeed, myself too.
- 13 Q. Thank you, Madam Affonço, I think that's a very clear answer,
- 14 and I hear you saying that you do not know the situation that
- 15 these refugees found themselves in.
- 16 So I will move to the next topic, and that is the situation of
- 17 the healthcare in Phnom Penh.
- 18 Is it true, Madam Affonço, that the French -- or the French
- 19 Government -- repatriated their doctors in the period before the
- 20 Khmer Rouge entered Phnom Penh?
- 21 A. Yes. From March '75 -- in other words, about a month before
- 22 the Khmer Rouge arrived -- the first military plane arrived at
- 23 the start of the month of March, and those involved in official
- 24 assistance and teachers were allowed to take those planes out.
- 25 Then a second plane arrived in mid March to take everybody else.

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 And then the final plane came in just before the city fell.
- 2 [14.22.45]
- 3 The people who left were the teachers -- all the westerners, the
- 4 people working in assistance and cooperation, and that included a
- 5 great many doctors from the hospitals in Phnom Penh.
- 6 Is that clear, sir?
- 7 Q. Thank you, that is very clear. Do you know if that also
- 8 included French nurses?
- 9 A. I don't know if there were French nurses who left, Counsel. I
- 10 was in the cultural service; I certainly wasn't in the Ministry
- 11 of Health. I wasn't working in health matters, I was working in
- 12 the cultural sphere and I saw teachers leaving.
- 13 Now, you're asking me about French nurses. No, but there were
- 14 Cambodian doctors and medical staff in the country. The wealthy
- 15 people were able to jump ship before it sank. It was the poor who
- 16 remained behind and who got killed.
- 17 Q. Thank you. And do you know, Madam Affonço, what happened to
- 18 the Vietnamese population of Phnom Penh during the Lon Nol years?
- 19 [14.24.35]
- 20 A. The Vietnamese population in Phnom Penh during the Lon Nol
- 21 regime was partly repatriated to Vietnam, but a considerable
- 22 majority were massacred on the way. I know about this because I
- 23 saw Vietnamese people being killed in pagodas, and some of them
- 24 were friends of my mother's. And there was a definite witch-hunt
- 25 for these people.

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 Now, I didn't take a tally of the numbers and I didn't follow
- 2 their travels to Vietnam. My mother stayed with me. That's all I
- 3 can tell you, Counsel, on that point.
- 4 Q. Thank you. Madam Affonço, also, in your book, you have written
- 5 about this topic, and I wanted to read that to you to excuse me
- 6 -- elicit some comments. And that is the same document number as
- 7 I gave earlier, and it's on at ERN 00678322. I again will be
- 8 quoting in French, just for the translator's benefit. And I quote
- 9 your book, Madam Affonço [interpreted from English]:
- 10 "The Vietnamese and the Cambodians of Vietnamese origin underwent
- 11 authentic pogroms ordained by Lon Nol. It was a radical cleansing
- 12 operation, a wave of barbaric and bloody terror in the history of
- 13 Cambodia between 1970 to 1975, followed by the tidal wave of
- 14 Khmer Rouge savagery. From one day to the next, all the
- 15 Vietnamese were arrested and brought together in the north of the
- 16 city, in makeshift camps, in schools, and Chinese pagodas to be
- 17 'repatriated' to Vietnam. In fact, nothing of the kind happened."
- 18 [End of interpretation from French]
- 19 [14.27.15]
- 20 And then, on the next page, your book continues -- and I quote -
- 21 [interpreted from French]:
- 22 "The camps were quickly emptied, and cholera hit the children,
- 23 and then programmed massacres were put into practice. All of
- 24 those who left on the boats towards Vietnam were executed, and
- 25 their bodies were thrown into the water without any kind of a

- 1 trial. The women were raped, and the male and female monks were
- 2 accused of complicity with the Vietcong. They were exterminated
- 3 in their pagodas, were ravaged and burned." [End of
- 4 interpretation from French] That's the end of the quote.
- 5 And to avoid any confusion, Madam Affonço, this persecution of
- 6 the Vietnamese took place during the Lon Nol years, according to
- 7 your book; is that correct?
- 8 A. Absolutely. It's quite true, Counsel, but don't forget that
- 9 the Lon Nol regime was made up of nationalists. They were
- 10 anti-Vietnamese and they said that in the Vietnamese community,
- 11 there were refugee Vietcong elements, and that is why they
- 12 brought them all together and massacred them. They were
- 13 nationalists.
- 14 [14.29.30]
- 15 And all of the disease in the pagodas that I saw, that was
- 16 entirely true, because I went to see people I knew who were
- 17 crammed into these Chinese pagodas and these Chinese schools.
- 18 Q. Thank you, and in that excerpt that I just read to read out
- 19 to you, you also speak about pagodas that were burned down. What
- 20 did you witness relating to those events?
- 21 A. It was in Kampong Speu. My mother had a friend -- she had two
- 22 friends who were nuns, and they were living in a pagoda located
- 23 in Kampong Speu, and it was located in the Province of Kampong
- 24 Speu. This is where my mother's friends were, and that was the
- 25 pagoda that was pillaged and burned down and where the nuns were

- 1 massacred. But in Phnom Penh, the pagodas were spared; they were
- 2 not burned down.
- 3 Q. So, as far as you know, this killing of the nuns took place or
- 4 was conducted by the Lon Nol troops; is that correct?
- 5 [14.31.18]
- 6 A. I believe that is correct, because at the time there were only
- 7 Lon Nol soldiers who were serving in the country. The Khmer Rouge
- 8 had yet to come to power.
- 9 Q. Thank you.
- 10 I move on to the next topic, and that is the evacuation of Phnom
- 11 Penh, the evacuation itself. And I will have only a few questions
- 12 relating to this specific topic.
- 13 But in your book you speak about the city being cut in four. And,
- 14 if you would like me to read out the excerpt, I can do that, but
- 15 maybe I can ask you like this: Do you remember the city being cut
- 16 into four sectors at the time?
- 17 A. All that I remember very clearly and to this day is that
- 18 everyone who lived in the south could not travel towards the
- 19 north end of the city; there were roadblocks everywhere. My
- 20 mother was in the western end of the city and she wasn't able to
- 21 join me, and I wasn't able to join her, either. It was impossible
- 22 for me to even get to the French Embassy, which was in the
- 23 northern end of the city, as there were roadblocks and barriers
- 24 everywhere. Everybody was being evacuated according to the sector
- 25 that they were living in. I was in the south and I had to go

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 towards the south.
- 2 [14.33.37]
- 3 THE INTERPRETER:
- 4 Last segment inaudible for the interpreter. Counsel is advised to
- 5 turn off his mic when the witness is providing her response.
- 6 BY MR. PAUW:
- 7 Q. Thank you, Madam Affonço. I will, just to, perhaps, refresh
- 8 your memory, indeed, quote the excerpt in your book in which you
- 9 speak about this division of the city. It is on -- to be found at
- 10 the ERN 00678330, and I will quote in French [interpreted from
- 11 French]: "It was impossible; the city had been divvied up into
- 12 quadrants. There were soldiers in the northern sector and they
- 13 were forcing people to go in the subsequent direction, and we
- 14 were in the south." [End of interpretation from French] End of
- 15 quote.
- 16 [14.34.35]
- 17 Madam Affonço, this corresponds to what you just told us, that
- 18 the city was divided by roadblocks, and in your book -- let me
- 19 ask you the question--
- 20 MS. AFFONÇO:
- 21 A. (No interpretation)
- 22 Q. Is this an accurate description, in your book, of what you
- 23 witnessed at the time?
- 24 A. I can tell you the following, Counsel. When I realized that I
- 25 could not go north and that, because I was located in the south

- 1 end, I was being sent southerly, I wanted to go to the western
- 2 end because I wanted to join my mother, and because of that, I
- 3 assumed that the city had been divvied up in that manner. I
- 4 simply could not go anywhere or move forward in order to verify
- 5 this. This was an assumption that I had a conclusion that I
- 6 had arrived at, given the situation. I was waiting for my
- 7 husband, who was living in the western end, and he was being
- 8 evacuated in the same direction. And that's what I'm telling you
- 9 today; she had to go to a different direction.
- 10 [14.36.21]
- 11 Q. Thank you, Madam Affonco, that is very clear.
- 12 I now want to move to the time that you spent in the countryside.
- 13 And in your book, you speak about Ta Man, and in your book you
- 14 call him a "despot". Could you explain what you mean when you
- 15 call him a "despot"?
- 16 A. Ta Man had arrived in the camps two years after our evacuation
- 17 from Phnom Penh. We met him in Loti Batran. It was in the third
- 18 camp -- it was in the last camp that we had met Ta Man. He was a
- 19 despot and he was the one who initiated the purges when he
- 20 arrived.
- 21 I cannot list to you all of the Ta's, all the uncles that I knew;
- 22 there must have been a dozen. There was Ta Chen, Ta Yem, Ta Man,
- 23 Ta Sok (phonetic), Ta Loeun (phonetic), Ta Kim (phonetic), and Ta
- 24 Soy (phonetic), the last one who was working in Loti Camp; he was
- 25 the one who told us how the husbands had been massacred.

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 [14.38.23]
- 2 Q. And just to be clear, Ta Man, what was his official position
- 3 at your village? What was his title or role?
- 4 A. Once again, if I may, I would like to consult my notes
- 5 because, 32 years after the facts, I'm unable to give you the
- 6 exact details. But in my book, I have described these facts
- 7 extensively. Therefore, Counsel, if you happen to have the
- 8 passages at hand, please consult them. Otherwise, I'm going to
- 9 have to take a few moments to look at my notes.
- 10 Q. Madam Affonço, that is no problem. I understand it is hard to
- 11 remember all these facts, and I, indeed, can read out to you the
- 12 passage in which you identify Ta Man. And I will, again, be
- 13 quoting in French, and it can be found at ERN 00678383 quote -
- 14 [interpreted from French]: "As far as we were concerned, the
- 15 village of Ta Chen, Ta Krak, and Ta Lim constituted a 'sahakar'
- 16 which was led by a chief called Ta Man; he was a ruthless
- 17 'yothea'." [End of interpretation from French] End of quote.
- 18 [14.40.20]
- 19 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 20 I think that there was an issue in translation. When you were
- 21 reading in French, I don't know if there was any implication for
- 22 the translation.
- 23 MR. PAUW:
- 24 Thank you, Mr. President. I think the complication may be that in
- 25 French there are two Khmer words, that I will read out

- 1 phonetically, maybe, to assist the translators: it is "sahakar"
- 2 and "yothea". And I--
- 3 MS. AFFONÇO:
- 4 Yes, they were "sahakars"; they were cooperatives.
- 5 [14.41.26]
- 6 BY MR. PAUW:
- 7 Q. And you then say that Ta Man was a "yothea sans pitié" -- and
- 8 you called Ta Man a merciless "yothea". Is this indeed how you
- 9 remember Ta Man?
- 10 MS. AFFONÇO:
- 11 A. Yes, absolutely.
- 12 THE INTERPRETER:
- 13 Inaudible for the interpreter. Counsel Pauw is advised to turn
- 14 off his microphone.
- 15 MS. AFFONÇO:
- 16 A. Yes, it was from that point on that disappearances began and
- 17 punishments were being meted out. If one had transgressed even
- 18 moderately from the line of Angkar, they were punished, and
- 19 people were sacked. And there were at least three or four
- 20 villages that were grouped together at Loti Batran, which was the
- 21 last camp, if memory serves me correctly.
- 22 BY MR. PAUW:
- 23 Q. And so it would be correct to say that Ta Man was the leader
- 24 of the "sahakar", as you describe it?
- 25 (Short pause)

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 [14.43.22]
- 2 MS. AFFONÇO:
- 3 A. Yes, indeed. I'm sorry; I thought you were not finished your
- 4 question.
- 5 Yes, Ta Man was indeed the person who was the chief of the
- 6 cooperative.
- 7 Q. And also in that book, two pages down, at pages 00678385, you
- 8 write -- and I will quote in French [interpreted from French]:
- 9 "Under Ta Man's authority, death penalties abounded." [End of
- interpretation from French]
- 11 Is that correct, that when Ta Man became president of the
- 12 "sahakar", the people that were condemned to die were many folds
- or were more than before?
- 14 A. Counsel, as I answered previously to your very last question,
- 15 when Ta Man arrived at the camp, there were many more
- 16 disappearances, there were many more executions or punishments
- 17 that were -- that were being handed out. Does that suffice as an
- 18 answer, Counsel?
- 19 [14.45.07]
- 20 Q. Thank you. That -- that is indeed sufficient for now.
- 21 You have also testified before the OCIJ -- and that is document
- 22 number D199/15, and ERN is 00346936 -- you testified about a
- 23 district chief and you state -- in English: "One of these
- 24 paramount chiefs judged me for stealing food from a courgette
- 25 field, and, what's more, he spared my life. Below him were the

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 village chiefs." End of quote.
- 2 Do you remember this district chief that spared your life? And do
- 3 you, perhaps, remember his name?
- 4 A. I clearly recall that episode. I didn't steal zucchinis; I
- 5 stole eggplants. And I had asked -- and I knew that the spies
- 6 that the -- I was going to be sent to the West, which was
- 7 tantamount to death. Perhaps there are a few details lacking, but
- 8 at one point there are two or three soldiers who took me to a
- 9 different village.
- 10 [14.47.11]
- 11 And from that point onwards I explained my situation to the chief
- 12 of the village, and he came on bicycle. His name was Ta Yem, and
- 13 obviously he asked me who I was, what I was doing there, why I
- 14 stole the food, and I answered all of his questions and I said,
- 15 "I stole because I was hungry." I said, "Sir, I stole because I
- 16 was hungry." And he replied, "Well, we're hungry as well. Why
- 17 don't we steal?" And yet, throughout the entire episode, in the
- 18 little straw hut, in the kitchen of the hut, there was the wife
- 19 and children of the village chief who were eating fish and rice,
- 20 and they were eating to their fill. And that's what I stumbled
- 21 upon.
- ${\tt I}$  asked for forgiveness. I said that I would never commit such an
- 23 act again and that was when he started asking me questions. "So,
- 24 you're French. Are you happy here, in Cambodia? Are you happy
- 25 here? Do you want to go back to France?" And I replied, "It

- 1 depends entirely on Angkar. If Angkar wants to send me to France,
- 2 it is its decision." He asked me, "Do you like the work here?"
- 3 And I replied, "Yes, I'm very happy to work here."
- 4 [14.48.57]
- 5 I simply told him what he wanted to hear. If I said the opposite,
- 6 well, then, I wouldn't be here today to tell you everything that
- 7 I endured, Counsel. So I hope that you understand the situation.
- 8 Q. I understand the situation. And thank you for sharing that
- 9 story.
- 10 Based on your experience, was it indeed the case that people like
- 11 Ta Man, who was the head of the cooperative, and people like Ta
- 12 Yem, who was a district chief, could decide on issues of life and
- 13 death, they could decide whether you would live or die because of
- 14 things you had done?
- 15 A. I'm sorry; I'm afraid I didn't fully hear your question.
- 16 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 17 Madam Affonço, could you please hold on?
- 18 And, Counsel for the civil parties, you may now proceed.
- 19 MR. JACOMY:
- 20 Mr. President, I would like my colleague to be specific about the
- 21 period he is referring to.
- 22 [14.50.39]
- 23 We didn't interrupt him earlier, but the evacuation of from
- 24 Tapran (phonetic) only happened as of 1976, which does not fall
- 25 within the scope of this current trial.

00871960

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

91

- 1 I, therefore, am seeking some clarifications from my esteemed
- 2 colleague with respect to the exact time period he's referring
- 3 to.
- 4 BY MR. PAUW:
- 5 Thank you, colleague for the civil parties. And I'll be happy to
- 6 specify the period, but I would be asking this question relating
- 7 to a rather broad period.
- 8 Q. If Madam Affonço can answer this, I am referring to the period
- 9 that she spent in the countryside from the evacuation of Phnom
- 10 Penh onwards, until early- to mid-1977. That is a period that she
- 11 spent time in the countryside and experienced the realities of
- 12 the life in the countryside, and I would ask her to make a -- or
- 13 give us a description of her experience at that time.
- 14 [14.52.02]
- 15 And I understand that the civil party has not heard my question,
- 16 so I will be happy to repeat the question: Madam Affonço, was it
- 17 your experience during your time on the countryside -- at the
- 18 countryside, between 1975 and 1977, that people like Ta Yem and
- 19 Ta Man could decide on who would live or who would die?
- 20 MS. AFFONÇO:
- 21 A. Counsel, in order to answer your question, I can only say that
- 22 I only saw Ta Yem once, when I had committed that offence. Ta Yem
- 23 was stationed at the island with us. He certainly wielded
- 24 discretionary power and he implemented all the orders of Angkar.
- 25 He would tell us, "You have not followed Angkar's line; you must

E1/153.1

- 1 not lie, you must not do this, you must not do that." If there
- 2 was any transgression from Angkar's line, we were told, "You will
- 3 disappear." That is all I can tell you.
- 4 Q. Thank you. And that takes me, indeed, to the next question.
- 5 You spoke about this issue yesterday, but I have a few more
- 6 questions on the topic.
- 7 Could you explain to us once again what you, at the time,
- 8 understood "Angkar" to be?
- 9 [14.54.19]
- 10 A. The first time I heard the term "Angkar", I had no idea what
- 11 it meant. I did not know who was "Angkar". I thought it was a
- 12 specific person, but it was only over the course of my cavalry,
- 13 only the course of my journey towards hell that I understood that
- 14 "Angkar" was the Party or the Organization -- I don't know how
- 15 you would call them today. But this was what everybody told me.
- 16 Everyone who was giving us orders, day after day, all of the
- 17 chiefs of the villages, all of those who abused us told us, "We
- 18 are doing this on behalf of Angkar."
- 19 The other village chiefs had pseudonyms, but we didn't know who
- 20 was "Angkar" and who was at the head of Angkar.
- 21 Q. Thank you. You testified yesterday that you also gave
- 22 testimony at the trial in 1979, and you have testified that you
- 23 were encouraged to speak the truth. Are you aware that documents
- 24 of this trial have survived to this day including your own
- 25 statements?

- 1 [14.56.14]
- 2 A. Up until a few years ago, I didn't know of the existence of
- 3 the archives for that trial. It was only until the nineties that
- 4 I realized that the sentence handed out during the first trial
- 5 had not been validated. And I only received the documents that
- 6 you may be referring to through my lawyer, Mr. Julien Rivet. Up
- 7 until this day, I've not seen certain documents nor their English
- 8 translations. And I noted that there were many deficiencies and
- 9 mistakes with the French language versions and translations.
- 10 Q. Can you tell us around when you have read those documents
- 11 relating to the 1979 trial?
- 12 A. As I've just stated, Counsel, I only consulted those records a
- 13 week ago. I did not have time to search through these archives.
- 14 You will understand that when I arrived in France at the end of
- 15 1979, I had lost everything; I simply had no time to dwell in the
- 16 past, and so I did not search through the archives. And it was
- 17 only since the beginning of this week that my lawyer, Mr. Julien
- 18 Rivet, has been able to provide me a copy of those records from
- 19 the 1979 trial.
- 20 Q. Thank you.
- 21 I would like to read you a passage from your statement at that
- 22 trial, and then later I will ask you if that is indeed a correct
- 23 reflection of what you testified to at the time, especially
- 24 because you tell us that in the French version there are a lot of
- 25 deficiencies.

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 [14.58.40]
- 2 So I want to quote from document number E3/2144R. It's called --
- 3 the book is called "Genocide in Cambodia: Documents from the
- 4 Trial of Pol Pot and Ieng Sary", and the passage can be found on
- 5 -- at ERN 00190592.
- 6 And at that page you state, according to this document, at least
- 7 -- quote:
- 8 "Only when we got to the island did I figure out just what
- 9 'Angkar' was. 'Angkar' means "the government". Anyone empowered
- 10 to direct a village or a work team can always speak in the name
- 11 of Angkar. Angkar is everywhere." End of quote.
- 12 Is that indeed what you testified to in 1979, that "anyone
- 13 empowered to direct a village or a work team can always speak in
- 14 the name of Angkar"?
- 15 A. Yes, absolutely. That is exactly what I said at the time.
- 16 [15.00.13]
- 17 In fact, I think there may have even been a translation error
- 18 because "Angkar" should not have been translated as "government",
- 19 but it should have been translated as "organization" or "Party".
- 20 But unfortunately, I wasn't there to provide advice on the
- 21 translation from Khmer into French.
- 22 Q. If I ask you the same question in slightly different form, is
- 23 it true that anyone in a position of power in those villages
- 24 could claim to speak in the name of Angkar?
- 25 A. Yes, entirely. Let me repeat: All of the people who were

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 leading these camps or these villages spoke in the name of Angkar
- 2 and they took the decisions in the name of Angkar. When they
- 3 wanted us to work a bit more, they said, "Angkar is asking for
- 4 this." When they came to collect the remaining stock of rice,
- 5 they said that it was because Angkar needed it. When they wanted
- 6 to send our children away, it was because Angkar had decided it.
- 7 So, who is "Angkar" today? Kindly explain that to me, if you
- 8 will. Today I would like to know who "Angkar" is. Is this a man,
- 9 an organization? Kindly enlighten me on that, Counsel, if you
- 10 can.
- 11 [15.02.09]
- 12 Q. I wish I could, Madam Affonço, but I'm afraid that's not my
- 13 role. I -- let's hope that this trial sheds some light on that
- 14 issue.
- 15 And I--
- 16 A. Thank you.
- 17 Q. You have described the actions of Ta Man in your village. And,
- 18 based on your experience at that village and with Ta Man, do you
- 19 think it's fair to say that the leaders of Democratic Kampuchea
- 20 in Phnom Penh did not always know what Ta Man was ordering you to
- 21 do in your village, even when he was speaking in the name of
- 22 Angkar?
- 23 [15.03.17]
- 24 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 25 Madam Affonço, please hold on.

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 International Co-Prosecutor, you may now proceed.
- 2 MR. DE WILDE D'ESTMAEL:
- 3 Thank you, Mr. President. I believe that this question goes above
- 4 and beyond what the witness can state.
- 5 She said from the very start that she had never seen the people
- 6 who represented Angkar at the central level, in particular the
- 7 Accused. So how it is reasonable to ask if Ta Man can take a
- 8 decision with or without consulting the Centre? This is not
- 9 something that the witness is able to tell us about, on the basis
- 10 of what we have heard from her so far, and I therefore think that
- 11 this civil party should not be asked to speculate on this issue
- 12 because she will not be able to respond. It's not justified.
- 13 Thank you.
- 14 [15.04.17]
- 15 MR. PAUW:
- 16 Thank you, Mr. Prosecutor, for those remarks.
- 17 I am not so much asking Madam Affonço to speculate; I'm asking
- 18 Madam Affonço to testify as to what she experienced when dealing
- 19 with Ta Man. When he was disciplining on a day-to-day basis, when
- 20 he was punishing people, when he was allegedly executing people,
- 21 how did she perceive that? Was Ta Man, indeed, a despot with
- 22 discretionary power, or was everything and every single action
- 23 directed from above?
- 24 But -- so I do think that the civil party should be able to
- 25 answer this question.

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 BY MR. PAUW:
- 2 Q. But in the interest of time, I will move on to a next topic,
- 3 and that is the last topic that I will want to ask some questions
- 4 about, and that is the tribunal in 1979 that you testified
- 5 before.
- 6 [15.05.49]
- 7 And you told us yesterday that you were not given any
- 8 instructions; the only instruction that you received was that you
- 9 had to leave out the information that your husband was a
- 10 Communist. Do you know why they wanted you to leave that part out
- 11 of your statement?
- 12 THE INTERPRETER:
- 13 Counsel, microphone off, please. Thank you.
- 14 MS. AFFONÇO:
- 15 A. Now, Counsel, I understand the decision taken at the time,
- 16 where I was asked not to talk about Mr. Phou Teang Seng's
- 17 Communist convictions. If I said this -- if I had said this then,
- 18 that would have meant that, broadly, all Communists would have
- 19 been judged quilty. I believe this when I think about this.
- 20 At the particular time, I was simply asked by Mr. Nguyen Khac
- 21 Vien, a Vietnamese writer, to not mention this fact. He -- it was
- 22 -- unfortunately, he's died now. He was a great Vietnamese
- 23 writer.
- 24 So, with hindsight, I believe I can say that I have understood
- 25 the reasons and the situation, but at that point in time I didn't

- 1 try and understand. All I wanted to do at that time was leave
- 2 that hell that I never wanted to see again.
- 3 Is that enough for you, Counsel?
- 4 [15.07.53]
- 5 Q. I think I understand slightly better now, but I may get back
- 6 to this minor topic at a -- at a later point if time permits. But
- 7 I will move on for now.
- 8 When you were attending the tribunal as a witness, did you listen
- 9 to the testimony of any of the other witnesses?
- 10 A. Yes, Counsel, I was there and I listened to the testimony of
- 11 other victims who were there; there were monks, there were Chams,
- 12 there were women.
- 13 And now, if you ask me exactly who those victims were, let me
- 14 tell you that you can find their names in the archives, all of
- 15 those people who came to testify in Court. I didn't take any
- 16 notes on that day. I was in tears. It was extremely taxing for me
- 17 to hear all of that testimony. It was extremely hard.
- 18 [15.09.03]
- 19 Q. Thank you, Madam Affonço. I will not ask you about their
- 20 statements as such, but I do want to quote a part of your book
- 21 again, an excerpt that can be found on page ERN 00678421. And I
- 22 will quote in French [interpreted from French]: "The Vietnamese
- 23 lawyers also come to assist those who want to write out their
- 24 testimony in French or in English." [End of interpretation from
- 25 French] End of quote.

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 Do you remember that, Madam Affonço, that Vietnamese lawyers came
- 2 to assist witnesses with writing up their statements?
- 3 A. Well, Counsel, in August 1975 (sic), we were in a hotel to
- 4 prepare that trial. I didn't need a lawyer; I had a hand-written
- 5 note. But I do remember that there were people who had come in
- 6 from the countryside who didn't know how to read or write, and
- 7 there were people who were there to help them. I didn't
- 8 participate in any of those interviews, on the other hand. The
- 9 only person I met was that Vietnamese writer I mentioned.
- 10 [15.10.56]
- 11 Q. Thank you.
- 12 And you testified yesterday that you had never heard of people
- 13 like Pol Pot or Ieng Sary. Yet, when I read your statement before
- 14 the tribunal in 1979, the names of Pol Pot and Ieng Sary are
- 15 mentioned by you frequently. Can you explain why those names
- 16 appeared in your statement if you did not know their names at the
- 17 time? It may not -- let me ask you the question like this: Why
- 18 did you use the names of Ieng Sary and Pol Pot in your statement
- 19 before the tribunal in 1979?
- 20 A. Counsel, Pol Pot and Ieng Sary were names that I had not heard
- 21 of until I came out of the hellish camps. The first question that
- 22 was asked to me by a Vietnamese military doctor was, "Do you know
- 23 who was behind all of your misfortune?" And I said, "I don't
- 24 know." And he told me, "He was called Pol Pot, and there was Ieng
- 25 Sary." And that was the point at which I understood that those

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 individuals were deeply involved in our wretchedness, and I
- 2 quoted their names in my testimony at that time. But, until I
- 3 came out in January 1979, for me, these soldiers were my
- 4 liberators, and if they hadn't arrived on time, I would no longer
- 5 be here to be talking to you, Counsel.
- 6 [15.13.16]
- 7 Q. Thank you, that is clear.
- 8 In the same book that I just quoted, at ERN 00190698, there is a
- 9 speech that was given at the conclusion of the tribunal, and I
- 10 will quote from the speech:
- 11 "After five days of sessions and with facts expounded clearly,
- 12 demonstrated convincingly, and analyzed objectively, this
- 13 tribunal has shed light on this truth: the crime of genocide of
- 14 the Pol Pot-Ieng Sary clique is undeniable and indefensible. The
- 15 proceedings at the tribunal have indicated that every Kampuchean
- 16 citizen is a victim and at the same time a witness to the most
- 17 horrible crimes of Pol Pot, Ieng Sary, and their associates."
- 18 A bit further down, the speech continues:
- 19 "The People's Revolutionary Tribunal of the Kampuchean People,
- 20 with probity and uprightness and following normal legal
- 21 procedure, has condemned Pol Pot and Ieng Sary to death, thus
- 22 unmasking their reactionary nature, promoting the Kampuchean
- 23 people's just cause, and affirming the role of the People's
- 24 Revolutionary Council of Kampuchea as the only authentic,
- 25 legitimate representative of the people of Kampuchea." End of

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 quote.
- 2 [15.14.57]
- 3 This was a speech that was given by then President, Mr. Heng
- 4 Samrin, in which he describes that and stresses that "every
- 5 Kampuchean citizen is a victim and at the same time a witness to
- 6 the most horrible crimes of Pol Pot, Ieng Sary, and their
- 7 associates", and it was given at a reception in honour of foreign
- 8 quests.
- 9 My question to you, Madam Affonco: Did you attend that speech
- 10 given by President Heng Samrin?
- 11 A. No, Counsel, I wasn't there for that speech. And, when I read
- 12 it out, I didn't really understand who was talking. Now that
- 13 you've told us, I understand. But I wasn't there.
- 14 I was called to testify one morning only. I told them everything
- 15 I had to say, and after that I was released. So I didn't follow
- 16 all five days of that particular tribunal's proceedings, so I do
- 17 not remember that.
- 18 [15.16.25]
- 19 MR. PAUW:
- 20 Then I will not ask you any further questions on this topic.
- 21 Madam Affonço, I have no further questions. On behalf of the Nuon
- 22 Chea defence team, also in the name of Mr. Son Arun, my Cambodian
- 23 co-counsel, I thank you very much for your answers and I wish you
- 24 good luck and strength in the future.
- 25 And I will cede the floor to my colleagues if they have further

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 questions.
- 2 MS. AFFONÇO:
- 3 Thank you, Counsel.
- 4 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 5 Thank you, Counsel.
- 6 We would like now to hand over to counsels for Mr. Ieng Sary to
- 7 put some questions to Madam Civil Party if they would wish to do
- 8 so.
- 9 [15.17.29]
- 10 MR. ANG UDOM:
- 11 Good afternoon, Mr. President. Good afternoon, Your Honours, and
- 12 good afternoon to everyone in and around the courtroom. And good
- 13 afternoon to you, Madam Denise Affonço. I am Counsel Ang Udom and
- 14 on my right-hand side, my colleague, Michael Karnavas. We are
- 15 counsels for Mr. Ieng Sary. For the moment, we do not have any
- 16 questions to put to you. Nonetheless, we thank you so much,
- 17 indeed, for your time.
- 18 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 19 Thank you, Counsels.
- 20 We would like now to proceed to counsel for Mr. Khieu Samphan to
- 21 put some questions to the civil party.
- 22 [15.18.23]
- 23 MR. KONG SAM ONN:
- 24 Thank you, Mr. President. On behalf of Mr. Khieu Samphan, we do
- 25 not have any questions to put to the civil party. We thank you.

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 2 Thank you, Counsels.
- 3 Madam Affonço, it is now the opportunity, as promised, for you,
- 4 as a civil party, to state -- or to make the statement of your
- 5 suffering, the sufferings you have endured during the Khmer Rouge
- 6 regime. If you wish to do so, the floor is now yours.
- 7 MS. AFFONÇO:
- 8 Thank you, Mr. President.
- 9 Indeed, yes, I would like to say today that throughout that
- 10 entire period, I suffered a huge amount. My life had been
- 11 proceeding happily in a peaceful country, and it suddenly
- 12 switched to hell. And from one day to the next, people were
- 13 expropriated, chased out of their houses; everything that you had
- 14 built in 30 years was demolished. I was age 30, and everything
- 15 that I lived through in those 30 years was destroyed from one day
- 16 to the next.
- 17 [15.19.53]
- 18 I have undergone an awful lot of harm as a result.
- 19 Firstly physical. From the fact that we didn't have any kind of
- 20 medical care or doctors and that we were malnourished and lived
- 21 in total absence of any hygiene, I contracted a great many
- 22 diseases. The major one was tuberculosis. If the soldiers --
- 23 invaders, if you like -- did not arrive on time, then I wouldn't
- 24 be here today. I was looked after for three months in the
- 25 Saint-Antoine Hospital in France for the tuberculosis. I also

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 caught hepatitis B and malaria. I have sequela from both still. I
- 2 still have attacks of malaria because you don't get rid of
- 3 malaria. And those are the physical kinds of harm I suffered.
- 4 When you are undergoing malaria and you're pulled out of your hut
- 5 to go and work in the rice fields under a beating sun, then -- I
- 6 would really like to ask you, Mr. President, Judges, kindly
- 7 imagine what it must have been like.
- 8 [15.21.22]
- 9 As to moral prejudice, I simply can't describe what I've been
- 10 through. We were deported, we were forced to leave our homes, we
- 11 were told lies, saying it was just for a few days. Well, in fact,
- 12 when you leave your house, you never, ever see it again; you
- 13 don't see any of your possessions again. Once you are in the
- 14 fields, you are obliged to work.
- 15 But in addition, as working back-breaking work, you are laughed
- 16 at, you're made a mockery of, your children are taken away from
- 17 you, without even telling you where they're going. They were --
- 18 they simply told you, "Angkar are looking after your children;
- 19 they're no longer your children, don't worry about them." And
- 20 when you get back to your children, in fact, they aren't your
- 21 children anymore because they've been completely indoctrinated
- 22 and changed.
- 23 When you see your daughter dying of hunger, and she says, "Mommy,
- 24 can I have a bowl of rice?", and I was never able to give her
- 25 that bowl of rice before she died, then I can tell you I have

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 undergone harm.
- 2 Everything I really want to know is, have these people been
- 3 punished?
- 4 [15.23.00]
- 5 I appear to be in reasonable health, but I can tell you inside my
- 6 head, it's not healthy at all. I have to be healthy for other
- 7 people, for my son, for his children. I have to stay in good
- 8 health for them. I'm in a world where you have to work to
- 9 survive, so imagine what it's like and ask yourselves how I
- 10 survived.
- 11 And when you ask me about harm, about all the atrocities, all the
- 12 torture scenes, for young Chinese women who stole some palm sugar
- 13 and who were stretched out and tied to the ground in the sun
- 14 while we had to watch. Do you think any kind of human rights were
- 15 respected there? Do you think we were human beings at all? We
- 16 weren't. We were totally dehumanized. We became animals. We were
- 17 utterly dehumanized. That's all I have to say today.
- 18 And let me tell you again and again, if you want to listen to me,
- 19 that famine was organized and programmed. It was a way for the
- 20 system to eliminate us while feeling they had washed their hands
- 21 of the problem, but they could say, "We didn't kill those people;
- 22 they died because they've been eating rubbish." Is that not a
- 23 technique to assassinate somebody without getting your hands
- 24 dirty? To do this without giving us any care and any medical
- 25 assistance is a way to simply kill people, and it was programmed

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 in advance.
- 2 [15.24.55]
- 3 That is why I can tell you that my nights are filled with
- 4 nightmares. That's why I no longer wish to set foot in that
- 5 country, which I do love. Thirty years have gone by, and I no
- 6 longer wish to set foot in that country because I am plaqued by
- 7 nightmares, I'm haunted by everything I went through, and in my
- 8 head, I can tell you--
- 9 How is it possible that the people of Cambodia endured all of
- 10 that? I wasn't alone. There were another 2 million Cambodians who
- 11 suffered this physically and morally. Now that they can speak, I
- 12 hope they are liberated. We have a very, very high price to pay.
- 13 I can't rebuild my life. I can't start a new family. I miss my
- 14 daughter. I only have my son, and that son was so traumatized
- 15 that he never, ever talks about this. He was tortured, he was
- 16 beaten.
- 17 And I want this Court to do its work and the people who committed
- 18 all of these acts to be duly punished.
- 19 Thank you very much, Mr. President and the entire Court.
- 20 [15.26.42]
- 21 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 22 The Chamber wishes to thank you very much, indeed, Madam Affonço.
- 23 Your testimony has now come to a conclusion. We hope the
- 24 testimony of yours will be contributing to ascertaining the
- 25 truth. And you are now excused. We wish you all the very best.

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 And at the same time the Chamber wishes to thank you, Counsel
- 2 Julien Rivet.
- 3 And the hearing on the testimony of Madam Affonço now comes to an
- 4 end. Goodbye, Madam.
- 5 Court officer is now instructed to assist with the AV booth
- 6 officers to ensure that the video-conference is disconnected.
- 7 And the Chamber would like to now hand over to parties to the
- 8 proceedings to make any observations, if any, on the statement of
- 9 suffering just made by Madam Affonço.
- 10 It appears to the Chamber that there is none.
- 11 And the Chamber wishes to also inform the parties and the public
- 12 that, next, the Chamber proceeds to hear the testimonies of
- 13 Witness Phan Van alias Kham Phan, as the Chamber already informed
- 14 the parties this morning that Kham -- this witness would be on
- 15 standby in case the testimony of Madam Affonço could be concluded
- 16 earlier -- early.
- 17 [15.28.50]
- 18 Now it is appropriate time for some break. The Court will adjourn
- 19 for 15 minutes. The next session will be resumed by five to 4.00.
- 20 Court Officer rather, quarter to 4.00.
- 21 (Court recesses from 1529H to 1546H)
- 22 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 23 Please be seated. The Court is now back in session.
- 24 And without further ado, we would like to now hand over to
- 25 counsels for Mr. Nuon Chea to continue putting questions to the

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 civil -- rather, to this witness.
- 2 MR. SON ARUN:
- 3 Good afternoon again to you, Mr. President and Your Honours. I
- 4 would like now to continue putting a few more questions.
- 5 Mr. Kham Phan, what should I call you? I call you Kham Phan or
- 6 Phan Van?
- 7 [15.48.08]
- 8 MR. PHAN VAN:
- 9 Officially, I am known as Phan Van.
- 10 MR. SON ARUN:
- 11 Mr. Phan Van, this morning I asked you a few questions already,
- 12 but I had not completed the questioning. I have a few more
- 13 questions to put to you.
- 14 In the telegrams, telegram number 40-
- 15 Before reading the content of the telegram, I would like Mr.
- 16 President's leave to bring seven telegrams -- to bring seven
- 17 telegrams to the witness for examination.
- 18 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 19 You may proceed, but please tell the Chamber the identification
- 20 of the document, for example ERN numbers.
- 21 [15.49.18]
- 22 MR. SON ARUN:
- 23 These documents include telegram 00, telegrams number 2, number
- 24 3, and another telegram number 3, but different content, and
- 25 telegrams number 10, 22, and 33.

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 2 We would like you to tell the Chamber the identification of the
- 3 document which is the ERN number or E number, for example, not
- 4 just these numbers you said.
- 5 MR. SON ARUN:
- 6 (No interpretation)
- 7 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 8 (No interpretation)
- 9 [15.50.13]
- 10 MR. SON ARUN:
- 11 Document E3/1196, which is telegram number 33; document E3/1195,
- 12 telegram 22; E3/1194, telegram number 10; E3/1189, telegram
- 13 number 3; document E3/1193, telegram number 3 as well; document
- 14 E3/1192, telegram number 2; document E3/1191, telegram 00.
- 15 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 16 You may proceed.
- 17 Court officer is now instructed to bring these documents from
- 18 Counsel Son Arun to the witness for examination.
- 19 MR. SON ARUN:
- 20 Mr. Witness, are you ready for me to put you some questions? I
- 21 think you have already obtained the documents.
- 22 [15.52.13]
- 23 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 24 Counsel Son Arun, to assist the proper conduct of the
- 25 proceedings, I think it would be best if you can put a document

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 at a time when you're putting questions to the witness, because
- 2 if you now giving him the seven documents all together, it makes
- 3 it difficult for him to focus on any particular document you
- 4 would refer to.
- 5 MR. SON ARUN:
- 6 Mr. President, I would like to ask a general question to him, not
- 7 necessarily any particular content of any of the documents. I
- 8 would like to ask him about the format of the documents.
- 9 This morning I was cut short when I was talking about the logo of
- 10 a Naga and some letters, "tela" -- like that.
- 11 [15.53.21]
- 12 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 13 You may proceed, Counsel.
- 14 QUESTIONING BY MR. SON ARUN RESUMES:
- 15 Q. Mr. Witness, you now have the documents in hand. Can I ask you
- 16 some questions, please?
- 17 MR. PHAN VAN:
- 18 A. You may, of course.
- 19 Q. You decoded the telegrams during the time you worked there.
- 20 Can you please tell the Chamber, how long had you been decoding
- 21 the telegrams?
- 22 A. I worked as a telegram decoder before Phnom Penh fell. A short
- 23 while after Phnom Penh fell, I was a driver, and my sister was my
- 24 successor in the Telegram Section.
- 25 Q. Can you give us some estimation as to how many months or years

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 you've been working at that section?
- 2 A. About two years.
- 3 Q. Thank you. Do you remember when you last decoded a telegram?
- 4 A. It was late 1975 or early 1976.
- 5 Q. You said that your sister was your successor in that section;
- 6 is that correct?
- 7 [15.55.26]
- 8 A. Yes, it is.
- 9 Q. So, in these seven documents that I plan to put some questions
- 10 to you about, in particular the form and format of the documents,
- 11 perhaps you are not in the best position to tell the Chamber
- 12 about them because you did not have knowledge of them. If so, you
- 13 can say you don't know. Is it -- is it a fair understanding of
- 14 your situation now?
- 15 A. Yes, it is. I don't know.
- 16 Q. Thank you.
- 17 Before your sister took over from you at the Telegram Decoding
- 18 Section, and during the period of two years that you had been
- 19 working in this particular section decoding all these telegrams,
- 20 do you remember that the telegrams are of the same format like
- 21 the ones you see right now?
- 22 A. Indeed, the format of the telegrams and how -- or the layout
- 23 in the -- of the telegrams are exactly the same.
- 24 [15.56.57]
- 25 Q. Now, these telegrams bear some numbers and dates and also the

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 name of the people who had had sent them, addressing to some
- 2 individuals, including Brother Nuon or Khieu. But, if you look at
- 3 the bottom of the telegrams and you would see the address and the
- 4 name like "tela" in Latin in Khmer scripts, were these the
- 5 formats of the telegrams sent out to people during the period
- 6 when you worked as a decoder?
- 7 A. During that period, there was no such script -- "tela", like
- 8 that, but indeed there were dates and names.
- 9 Q. So, the seven telegrams I showed to you, do you believe that
- 10 these are the genuine telegrams sent from Sector 105 to Upper
- 11 Echelon?
- 12 A. I believe that, as long as the originality of these documents
- 13 are concerned, it is true that they could have been sent from
- 14 Sector 105 to the Upper Echelon, but the difference in that is
- 15 that I never heard of "tela" or seen such script on any of the
- 16 telegrams before, when I worked there.
- 17 Q. You said you agreed with us that these are the formats of the
- 18 telegrams, but now you don't agree that there should be some kind
- 19 of "tela" script on the pages. What is your testimony now, then?
- 20 [15.59.04]
- 21 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 22 Co-Prosecutor, you may now proceed.
- 23 MR. DE WILDE D'ESTMAEL:
- 24 Thank you, President. Just a few points with respect to the
- 25 Defence's line of questioning.

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 This morning, prior to the interruption, the witness stated very
- 2 clearly that it was a telegram -- he validated the authenticity
- 3 of the telegram, based on its appearance and formatting.
- 4 Secondly, with respect to whether he was there or not, I think
- 5 the Defence is trying to mislead the witness. Among the documents
- 6 presented, some do bear a few common points with those that we
- 7 have presented, and in fact, they are documents that were sent to
- 8 the Centre from Sector 105; this was confirmed by the witness.
- 9 Now, where the Defence is misleading the witness is that these
- 10 documents were not sent from Sector 105, but in fact, they were
- 11 simply received by the Centre. And, as it was made very clear,
- 12 there was a process in place -- either at Sector 105 -- telegrams
- 13 were typed, written, and coded or decoded.
- 14 [16.00.41]
- 15 As far as the documents which were received by the Centre are
- 16 concerned, they do not bear the same characteristics as those
- 17 which were sent by Sector 105 or copied. These documents were not
- 18 used by Sector 105.
- 19 The Defence should enlighten the witness on which documents were
- 20 found here, in Phnom Penh.
- 21 Thank you, Mr. President.
- 22 MR. SON ARUN:
- 23 Mr. President, please allow me to respond to the prosecutor
- 24 briefly.
- 25 These pieces of evidence are precise and they are now being used

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 before the Chamber. They're genuine documents.
- 2 If the prosecutor does not agree that these documents could have
- 3 been sent from 105 to the Central Committee or if prosecutor
- 4 rules that -- or submits that these documents are fake, then we
- 5 would like witness to shed light on this. If witness says that
- 6 they are not official documents, then let it be.
- 7 MR. DE WILDE D'ESTMAEL:
- 8 (No interpretation)
- 9 [16.02.38]
- 10 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 11 Counsel, we see that the documents you've given to witness were
- 12 the documents typewritten and received in Phnom Penh, and he, the
- 13 witness, was talking about his knowledge of the formats of the
- 14 telegrams that he saw at Sector 105, which share the same format.
- 15 So, if you would like to ask question on this, it would be best
- 16 if you addressed the questions to those who decoded such
- 17 telegrams in Phnom Penh because the documents were received in
- 18 Phnom Penh. And, if you would like to put these documents to ask
- 19 him some questions, then you would ask him whether he was in
- 20 charge in Phnom Penh, receiving some telegrams from Sector 105,
- 21 because if he received the messages at 105 during his tenure,
- 22 then he would be able to understand or shed light on the format
- 23 or the documents themselves.
- 24 We already learned that the same -- or similar incident happened
- 25 in Case File 001, where annotations would be made on some pieces

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 of the documents.
- 2 So, to be clear and so that we are on the same page, the
- 3 documents here are received -- or were received in Phnom Penh,
- 4 and that -- this witness did not work in Phnom Penh, so he would
- 5 not be able to tell you anything about it.
- 6 [16.04.40]
- 7 MR. SON ARUN:
- 8 The purpose of putting such questions to Mr. Phan Van is to know
- 9 whether he has ever seen the same form of documents during the
- 10 time he worked there. So, it is -- our understanding is that he
- 11 already left the place when these documents were prepared. He
- 12 admitted that these forms of documents were familiar. And I asked
- 13 question about the dragon -- rather, Naga logo and script-
- 14 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 15 Counsel, I think it is not hard to understand. It is the format
- 16 itself that witness already confirmed to be the same format he
- 17 was knowledgeable of during that time. So your questions would be
- 18 more relevant to some more telegram decoders or those who would
- 19 have been working in Phnom Penh, who would be more familiar with
- 20 these formats than the witness before us, because additional
- 21 texts on the telegrams would be impossible for this witness to
- 22 verify.
- 23 [16.06.19]
- 24 BY MR. SON ARUN:
- 25 Thank you, Mr. President. I would like to continue to other

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 questions.
- 2 Q. On almost every telegram sent out from 105, we find that
- 3 Brother Nuon was copied. Based on your experience working as the
- 4 telegrams decoder, do you understand this message, the message
- 5 addressing to somebody, for example, and then copied to somebody?
- 6 What is the difference between addressing to and copy to?
- 7 MR. PHAN VAN:
- 8 A. I don't think I understand this very much because, as a
- 9 telegram decoder, I would be in -- tasked with decoding the text
- 10 only, and people who was in charge of typing the telegram would
- 11 be tasked with typing only.
- 12 Q. Mr. Kham Phan, you said you worked as a driver and you would
- 13 drive Madam Ieng Thirith back and forth, and at the same time you
- 14 also testified that, when you worked at B-20 for some period of
- 15 time, you got to know some senior leaders, including Pol Pot,
- 16 Nuon Chea, Ieng Sary, Khieu Samphan, Hu Nim, and Hou Youn. That's
- 17 what you said.
- 18 My question to you is: Did you know Nuon Chea very well?
- 19 [16.08.30]
- 20 A. Yes, I did.
- 21 Q. Did you ever encounter him or converse with him in your
- 22 capacity as the driver?
- 23 A. Yes, I did.
- 24 Q. If you knew him very well, can you tell the Chamber, please,
- 25 what was what is Mr. Nuon Chea like -- or what was he what

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 was he like? Was he a kind of barbaric person, unfriendly
- 2 individual, or a gentle man, a man of righteousness and
- 3 consciousness, a man who loved his own nation and countrymen?
- 4 A. I knew him very well after the Vietnamese entered Phnom Penh,
- 5 when we went to the jungle together.
- 6 Q. I do not think you have answered my question yet. Tell the
- 7 Chamber, please, about your impression concerning his character.
- 8 [16.10.04]
- 9 A. Counsel, could you repeat the question?
- 10 Q. Thank you. I would like now to put you this question again.
- 11 You said you knew Mr. Nuon Chea very well. You had opportunities
- 12 to converse with him, both officially and informally. As his
- 13 subordinate, can you describe his personality? Was Nuon Chea a
- 14 cruel person, a person who detained each and every one
- 15 arbitrarily, or was he a gentle man, a good leader, a man who
- 16 loves justice and his own country like other leaders did?
- 17 A. As I indicated, we went -- or ran away into the jungle
- 18 together for the struggle cause. However, as I knew you put this
- 19 question, you asked whether he loved his own country and
- 20 countrymen or not; I don't understand the term precisely.
- 21 I'd been fully engaged in the Movement; I noted that he did not
- 22 love his own country very much, but he was in favour of
- 23 individuals. He would implicate people for being enemies, those
- 24 he didn't like. I do not think he would be the person best
- 25 described as someone who loved his own country very much.

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 [16.12.00]
- 2 Q. Thank you.
- 3 This morning you responded to questions put by my colleague that
- 4 the Vietnamese entered the country and Sarun had been in power.
- 5 When Sarun had been in power, more and more people kept
- 6 disappearing. With that, when you said a lot of people
- 7 disappeared, did you learn about this first hand or did you hear
- 8 about it? Could you please tell the Chamber your position or
- 9 knowledge about this?
- 10 A. I knew about this. I didn't see this first hand. I learned
- 11 about this because I asked people some questions. I was
- 12 suspicious when I didn't see the people I used to see every day,
- 13 and they told me the people I asked told me that these people
- 14 had disappeared or executed.
- 15 Q. So, this means that you learned about this through other
- 16 people?
- 17 A. Yes, I did.
- 18 [16.14.02]
- 19 Q. Before the Chamber, yesterday, you also stated that Mr. Nuon
- 20 Chea sent telegrams to your father and Mr. Kham Phuon, inviting
- 21 them to go to Phnom Penh for a study session, but your uncle,
- 22 Kham Phuon, and your father died during this period, when they
- 23 were in Phnom Penh. Did you know or were you aware that the
- 24 telegram sent to your father by Nuon Chea was received by your
- 25 father personally, or was it sent through someone else?

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 A. At that time, my sister was at work and she received the
- 2 telegram on my father and uncle's behalf.
- 3 Q. Did you see that telegram?
- 4 A. No, I didn't.
- 5 Q. Since you didn't see the telegram, how could you respond to
- 6 the Chamber? Did you speculate on this?
- 7 A. I didn't speculate, I was very clear in my mind because my
- 8 father told me that Brother Number Two sent the telegram for him
- 9 and my uncle to go to Phnom Penh for work, and I also learned
- 10 that my father and my uncle prepared to go to Phnom Penh because
- 11 of the telegram.
- 12 [16.15.53]
- 13 Q. When Ta Laing, your father, came to Phnom Penh at the
- 14 beginning, did he go there alone or was he accompanied by another
- 15 person?
- 16 A. I don't recollect this.
- 17 Q. In your record of interview before the Co-Investigating
- 18 Judges, document E3/58 ERN: in Khmer, 00239937; English,
- 19 00250089; French, 00288915 -- you stated that:
- 20 "Apart from this, Nuon Chea wrote typewritten telegrams that he
- 21 sent to sector secretaries, including Ta Sophea, member of the
- 22 sector in charge of military, to my father, and to other people
- 23 so that they could be invited to attend study sessions in Phnom
- 24 Penh. My father and Kham Phuon were executed during one of the
- 25 study sessions."

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 [16.18.06]
- 2 Here I would like to seek some clarification. You said that these
- 3 people went to Phnom Penh after they received a telegram from Mr.
- 4 Nuon Chea. Your father, Ta Laing, indeed, and your uncle, and
- 5 other person, a witness, and you yourself accompanied them to
- 6 Phnom Penh. According to your best recollection, did your father
- 7 and Mr. Kham Phuon go to Phnom Penh alone?
- 8 A. I already stated clearly that we came to Phnom Penh all
- 9 together -- my uncle Kham Phuon, my father, I myself, and another
- 10 person who was their bodyguard.
- 11 Q. So, when Ta Nuon Chea wrote this letter or telegram, he wanted
- 12 to invite four people to Phnom Penh, not necessarily inviting Ta
- 13 Laing alone to Phnom Penh. Is that what we understand from your
- 14 statement?
- 15 A. Yes, it is correct. The telegram was meant to invite these
- 16 people. It invited only two individuals, my uncle and my father,
- 17 but then two people accompanied them.
- 18 Q. The telegram Nuon Chea sent to your father was not seen by
- 19 you, but when you accompanied but, indeed, you accompanied your
- 20 father on the trip. Who actually -- or who did actually receive
- 21 the telegram sent by Nuon Chea?
- 22 [16.21.05]
- 23 A. I said that clear already that it was my sister who received
- 24 the telegram.
- 25 And, again, let me emphasize on this, the letter or the telegram

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 was sent to my father and my uncle only, but two additional
- 2 people accompanied them to Phnom Penh.
- 3 [16.21.36]
- 4 MR. SON ARUN:
- 5 Thank you, Mr. Witness.
- 6 And thank you, Mr. President and Your Honours. I have no further
- 7 questions to put to the witness.
- 8 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 9 Thank you.
- 10 And we would like now to proceed to counsels for Mr. Khieu
- 11 Samphan if you would like to put some questions to him.
- 12 QUESTIONING BY MR. KONG SAM ONN:
- 13 Thank you, Mr. President. Good afternoon to members of the Bench.
- 14 Good afternoon, Witness. I am the national defence counsel for
- 15 Mr. Khieu Samphan. I have a few questions to ask you. I am
- 16 conscious of the time; we have a few minutes before we break for
- 17 the day, and I may resume tomorrow if I cannot finish my
- 18 questions this afternoon.
- 19 [16.22.51]
- 20 Q. I would like to begin my question concerning Mr. Khieu
- 21 Samphan.
- 22 You testified earlier that you know Mr. Khieu Samphan. When did
- 23 you first know him?
- 24 MR. PHAN VAN:
- 25 A. I knew him when I was very young. At that time, I was with

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 B-20 and I knew him from there.
- 2 Q. Do you recall the year when you knew him back in B-20?
- 3 A. I do not recall the year, but if you want to be clear about
- 4 that, you can ask Mr. Khieu Samphan yourself.
- 5 Q. Well, I can ask him, of course, but I am now asking you, so
- 6 please respond to my question. And, if my question is not clear,
- 7 feel free to seek clarification.
- 8 Now, when you first knew Mr. Khieu Samphan, what was what was
- 9 the position he held at the time? Do you know that?
- 10 A. I was -- I was very young at that time.
- 11 Q. How old were you back then?
- 12 [16.24.22]
- 13 A. I do not even recall my exact age at the time.
- 14 Q. Well, do you know what position Mr. Khieu Samphan held at the
- 15 time?
- 16 A. No, I didn't. I simply addressed him as "Uncle", and everyone
- 17 called him "Uncle" at the time.
- 18 Q. Who introduced you to Mr. Khieu Samphan? Or did you only knew
- 19 him by accident? Could you tell the Court the circumstance that
- 20 led you to know Mr. Khieu Samphan back then?
- 21 A. At the time, my father sent me for a training session.
- 22 Q. Could you please be more precise? Where did you receive the
- 23 training?
- 24 A. It was at B-20, as I-as I told you earlier.
- 25 Q. What did you study at the time in the training course?

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 A. I was taught how to write as well as to decode a telegram.
- 2 [16.26.11]
- 3 Q. Did you learn how to write Khmer or any other languages?
- 4 A. It was Khmer language.
- 5 Q. How about the decoding of telegrams? What what are you
- 6 talking about? Can you tell us what you really studied at the
- 7 time?
- 8 A. We learned how to decode telegrams, as well as the codes used
- 9 in radio communication.
- 10 Q. Do you recall who your trainer was at the time?
- 11 A. As I told you earlier, at the time -- and Sim, to my
- 12 recollection -- Sim was the instructor.
- 13 Q. Was she the only instructor, or there was any other
- 14 instructors?
- 15 A. I can only recall her.
- 16 Q. Thank you.
- 17 Now I would like to look at K-17.
- 18 Can you tell the Court what K-17 did at the time?
- 19 [16.28.16]
- 20 A. Back then it was called the Messenger Office, and its code
- 21 name was K-17.
- 22 Q. How long did you work at K-17? And, if you can, please tell
- 23 the Court from which year to which year.
- 24 A. Are you asking me about K-17 attached to Sector 105 or K-17 at
- 25 the Centre? Because I myself was working at K-17 at Sector 105.

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 Q. Of course, I am asking you about K-17 at Office -- or Sector
- 2 105.
- 3 A. At Sector 105, K-17 was called the office of the sector. Now,
- 4 it was -- in the present day, the equivalent structure of this
- 5 office was the provincial hall.
- 6 Q. Can you tell the Court the general structure of Sector 105,
- 7 particularly K-17?
- 8 A. I do not recall it well; at the time, I was too young. I could
- 9 only recall some basic structure. But in terms of the overall
- 10 structure of this office, I do not recall completely.
- 11 Q. Can you specify the year when you started your work at K-17
- 12 and the time you departed or you left this office? What year was
- 13 it?
- 14 [16.30.28]
- 15 A. K-17 was set up before the liberation of Phnom Penh,
- 16 approximately a year prior to the fall of Phnom Penh, and I
- 17 stayed there up until the day my father died.
- 18 Q. Is it fair to say that you started working there from 1974 up
- 19 until 1977? Is that a fair summary of that event?
- 20 A. That is correct; it was about this many years.
- 21 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 22 The time is now appropriate for the day's adjournment. Thank you,
- 23 Counsel. The time is appropriate for adjournment.
- 24 I note that defence counsel is on his feet. You may proceed,
- 25 Counsel.

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 [16.31.53]
- 2 MR. PAUW:
- 3 Thank you, Mr. President. I will be very, very brief and
- 4 conscious of the time.
- 5 I simply wanted to inform you that today will be the last day
- 6 that I appear before your Chamber. My first appearance before you
- 7 was almost exactly two years ago, and they have been memorable
- 8 years.
- 9 And as a lawyer, I simply want to stress that I feel that this
- 10 tribunal can do more to promote the rule of law in Cambodia
- 11 today, and it can do more to promote the accountability before
- 12 the courts of anyone, regardless of their position, and it can do
- 13 more to stress the importance of the independence of the courts
- 14 in Cambodia.
- 15 I believe that should be part of the legacy that the ECCC leaves
- 16 behind. I think it is in your hands and the hands of the Trial
- 17 Chamber and I think it is not too late to start.
- 18 I thank you all, Prosecution, civil parties, my colleagues from
- 19 the Defence and--
- 20 [16.33.10]
- 21 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 22 Lead Co-Lawyer for the civil parties, you may proceed.
- 23 MR. PICH ANG:
- 24 With all due respect, Mr. President, I think that it is not
- 25 appropriate to make this statement at this juncture, and I

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

- 1 believe that this is a statement that the parties may wish to
- 2 make, but it may unnecessarily affect the Chamber as a whole.
- 3 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 4 Mr. Jasper Pauw, you are not granted the floor to make any
- 5 further statement.
- 6 And the time is now appropriate for the day's adjournment. The
- 7 Chamber will adjourn now and will resume tomorrow, at 9 o'clock
- 8 in the morning.
- 9 And tomorrow the Chamber will hear the testimony of Mr. Phan Van.
- 10 And, following the completion of the testimony of the current
- 11 witness, the Chamber will hear another witness, TCW-665.
- 12 [16.34.27]
- 13 Mr. Phan Van, your testimony has not yet come to an end. The
- 14 Chamber will resume hearing you tomorrow morning, so the Chamber
- 15 wishes to invite you once again to come to the Court tomorrow
- 16 morning, at 9 o'clock.
- 17 And, Duty Counsel, please be also advised that we will resume the
- 18 hearing of the testimony of your client tomorrow, and you are
- 19 also invited to attend tomorrow's hearing.
- 20 And court officer is instructed now to facilitate the
- 21 transportation and accommodation for the witness and have him
- 22 back to this courtroom before 9 o'clock in the morning.
- 23 And, the Duty Counsel, please also come to the Court by the
- 24 scheduled time.
- 25 Security guards are instructed to bring the co-accused back to

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 140 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 13/12/2012

1	the detention facility and bring them back to the courtroom
2	before 9.00 tomorrow morning. And as for Mr. Ieng Sary, he is
3	going to be brought to the holding cell downstairs, where the
4	audio-visual equipment is connected to him to follow the
5	proceedings remotely.
6	The Court is now adjourned.
7	(Court adjourns at 1635H)
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	