

# **អ**ត្ថដ៏ផុំ៩ម្រៈទិសាមញ្ញតូខតុលាការកម្ពុជា

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Chambres Extraordinaires au sein des Tribunaux Cambodgiens

# ් ලාංගන ක්රියා දැසියි ලාංගන දැසියින් දැසි

Kingdom of Cambodia Nation Religion King Royaume du Cambodge Nation Religion Roi

# ងអាសារដើម

ORIGINAL/ORIGINAL

ថ្ងៃខែ ឆ្នាំ (Date): 28-Jan-2013, 14:43 CMS/CFO: Sann Rada

# អនិត្តម៉ូត្តនៃះមារបន្តធំទ

Trial Chamber Chambre de première instance

# TRANSCRIPT OF TRIAL PROCEEDINGS PUBLIC

Case File Nº 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC

22 January 2013 Trial Day 149

Before the Judges: NIL Nonn, Presiding

Silvia CARTWRIGHT

YA Sokhan

Jean-Marc LAVERGNE

YOU Ottara

THOU Mony (Reserve) Claudia FENZ (Reserve)

Trial Chamber Greffiers/Legal Officers:

SE Kolvuthy Matteo CRIPPA DAV Ansan Faiza ZOUAKRI

For the Office of the Co-Prosecutors:

CHAN Dararasmey

Vincent DE WILDE D'ESTMAEL

SENG Bunkheang Dale LYSAK VENG Huot Keith RAYNOR

For Court Management Section:

UCH Arun SOUR Sotheavy The Accused: IENG Sary

Lawyers for the Accused:

SON Arun Victor KOPPE ANG Udom

Michael G. KARNAVAS KONG Sam Onn

Anta GUISSÉ

Lawyers for the Civil Parties:

PICH Ang

Élisabeth SIMONNEAU-FORT

HONG Kimsuon LOR Chunthy SAM Sokong VEN Pov

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 149 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 22/01/2013

# List of Speakers:

Language used unless specified otherwise in the transcript

Speaker	Language
JUDGE CARTWRIGHT	English
MR. DE WILDE D'ESTMAEL	French
MS. GUISSÉ	French
MR. KARNAVAS	English
JUDGE LAVERGNE	French
MR. LYSAK	English
THE PRESIDENT (NIL NONN, Presiding)	Khmer
MR. RAYNOR	English
MS. SIMONNEAU-FORT	French
MR. SON ARUN	Khmer

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 149 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 22/01/2013

- 1 PROCEEDINGS
- 2 (Court opens at 0906H)
- 3 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 4 Please be seated. The Court is now in session, and as we
- 5 scheduled and informed the parties yesterday, today the Chamber
- 6 will continue the document hearing.
- 7 [09.07.38]
- 8 Ms. Se Kolvuthy, could you report the attendance of the parties
- 9 to this case?
- 10 THE GREFFIER:
- 11 Mr. President, for today's proceeding all parties are present,
- 12 except the accused, Ieng Sary, who is present in the holding cell
- downstairs due to his health reason.
- 14 The accused Nuon Chea and Khieu Samphan are absent due to health
- 15 reason and they are being treated at the Khmer-Soviet Friendship
- 16 Hospital. The two Accused submitted their waiver for this
- document hearing -- that is, document 258/2 and 223/4.
- 18 Thank you.
- 19 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 20 Thank you.
- 21 The Chamber already ruled yesterday regarding the absence of the
- 22 accused, Nuon Chea and Khieu Samphan, who have health issues and
- 23 are being treated at the hospital, and they submitted their
- 24 waiver to participate in the document hearing. So we can proceed
- 25 with the document hearing in their absence.

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 149 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 22/01/2013

- 1 [09.09.22]
- 2 We would like now once again give the floor to the Prosecutor to
- 3 present their key documents regarding the military structure of
- 4 the Khmer Rouge regime.
- 5 You may proceed.
- 6 MR. LYSAK:
- 7 Thank you, Mr. President. Good morning to all.
- 8 I would like to turn, now, to some documents from the period of
- 9 June to December 1976. This is a period for which there are a
- 10 number, significant number of surviving minutes of meetings
- 11 between Son Sen and the division secretaries that showed the
- 12 detailed reporting by the divisions as well as the communication
- 13 and implementation of Party policies and lines by the military.
- 14 The first is document E3/814 -- E3/814 -- which is the minutes of
- 15 a meeting of all division committees held on the 1st of June
- 16 1976. This meeting primarily concerned agricultural production,
- 17 and it records the communication of the Party line or plan on
- 18 agricultural production to the Centre military divisions.
- 19 [09.11.06]
- 20 Item 3 of the agenda for the meeting is -- quote: "A number of
- 21 specific discussions related to the offensive to achieve three
- 22 tons per hectare in the strategy of 100 per cent self-support and
- 23 30 per cent support of Angkar." End of quote.
- 24 And in the report of Brother 89 on the second page in paragraph
- 25 2B, which is titled "Nation building", Son Sen instructed the

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 149 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 22/01/2013

- 1 divisions as follows -- quote:
- 2 "Our task is to increase production to three tons per hectare and
- 3 to expand dyke systems by 30 per cent. The great leap movement is
- 4 strong in the countryside already, and the movement to make the
- 5 canals, the movement to build dykes, all these are very strong."
- 6 End of quote.
- 7 More detailed plans for rice production were provided by Son Sen
- 8 to the division secretaries in a meeting held on the 18th of
- 9 August 1976, which meeting is recorded in document E3/797; that
- 10 meeting specified the amount of land to be cultivated each year
- 11 and the goal of earning \$4.8 million in capital from rice yields
- 12 over a four-year period.
- 13 [09.12.59]
- 14 The next document from this period is document E3/790 -- that's
- 15 E3/790 -- which is the "Decisions of a Party Committee Conference
- of All Divisions" that was held from the 10th to 14th of July
- 17 1976. And this was the second such conference of division
- 18 committees, and the document refers to the first conference as
- 19 having taken place in April 1976. And the document that resulted
- 20 from this July 1976 conference is divided into a number of
- 21 sections that discuss in detail the following duties of the RAK.
- 22 First, the duty to continue the socialist revolution;
- 23 Second section of the document is titled "The duty to defend the
- 24 nation and build a revolutionary army to become a party's radical
- 25 proletariat class dictatorship apparatus."

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 149 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 22/01/2013

- 1 The third section is titled "The duty to launch a storming attack
- 2 in constructing socialism, especially a storming attack in
- 3 production of three tons per hectare."
- 4 Fourth is, "Duty to Build the Party";
- 5 And fifth is, "Duty to resist and eradicate all enemy's
- 6 devastating intelligence infiltration."
- 7 [09.14.53]
- 8 Now, in section 2 of this document that discusses the duty to
- 9 defend the nation -- and this is at Khmer ERN 00441999 through
- 10 442000, English 00714788 through 714789, and French 00752245 --
- in this part of the document there is a list of five measures
- 12 that were decided.
- 13 The first is -- quote: "Must pay special attention to the acts of
- 14 enemy infiltration within our revolutionary army and ranks." End
- 15 of quote.
- 16 And the fourth measure listed is -- quote:
- 17 "Must grasp-hold biographies of cadres and combatants strictly by
- 18 starting to examine at their birthplaces and completely screening
- 19 all disastrous elements against the revolution from the
- 20 revolutionary ranks in order to make our army a proletariat class
- 21 apparatus loyal to the party, socialist revolution lines,
- 22 construction of socialism and party's national defence
- 23 radically." End of quote.
- 24 [09.16.35]
- 25 Section 4 of the decisions from the July 1976 division conference

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 149 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 22/01/2013

- 1 states in paragraph 1 titled "Political Ideology", and this may
- 2 be found at Khmer page 00442011, English 00714793, and French
- 3 00752251, which reads as follows -- quote: "In the next three
- 4 months, must educate and disseminate the statues of the Communist
- 5 Party of Kampuchea widely."
- 6 And also: "Must educate and disseminate widely the decisions made
- 7 in this second division conference among the party, Communist
- 8 Youth League of Kampuchea, and male and female combatants of the
- 9 revolutionary army." End of quote.
- 10 And in regards to biographies, this document further instructs in
- 11 paragraph 2A.2 of section 4 -- quote: "Must grasp-hold the
- 12 biography of all old party members by assigning certain people to
- 13 follow up the biography at the base." End of quote.
- 14 [09.18.27]
- 15 The last quote from this document I would like to present is
- 16 paragraph 2E.2 of section 4 -- which is at Khmer page 00442014,
- 17 English 00714795, and French 00752253 -- and this paragraph
- 18 includes the following statement quote:
- 19 "...it is necessary to have assigned study of the Party's documents
- 20 every month" -- end of quote -- with a specific reference made to
- 21 "documents from the 'Revolutionary Flag' or 'Revolutionary Youth'
- 22 magazines."
- 23 Mr. President, the decisions of the July 1976 divisions
- 24 conference are referenced in the next document I would like to
- 25 present -- which is E3/795, E3/795 -- which is the minutes of a

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 149 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 22/01/2013

- 1 meeting of the secretaries and deputy secretaries of the brigades
- 2 and regiments that was held on the 2nd of August 1976. In this
- 3 meeting, each of the divisions and independent regiments reports
- 4 to Son Sen, Brother 89, on their completion of education or study
- 5 sessions to instruct the cadres both on the Party statutes and on
- 6 the decisions from the division conference that had taken place
- 7 the prior month.
- 8 [09.20.31]
- 9 At the end of this meeting -- in section 3.1 of his concluding
- 10 remarks -- Son Sen emphasizes the importance of continuing such
- 11 political education on the Party lines, stating -- and I quote:
- 12 "We must continue teaching the statue and the decision of the
- 13 brigade conference further. There must be a plan once a month to
- 14 study statute documents, brigade conference decisions, and
- 15 various instructions of the General Staff. We must pay attention
- 16 on how to organize class for cadres and male and female
- 17 combatants to study the 'Revolutionary Flag' journal,
- 18 'Revolutionary Youth' journal, and 'Revolutionary' newspaper
- 19 continuously." End of quote.
- 20 The next document I would like to present is E3/798, E3/798 --
- 21 which is the minutes of a meeting of the division and regiment
- 22 secretaries and deputy secretaries that was held on the 30th of
- 23 August 1976. And at this meeting, on the first page of the
- 24 minutes, Son Sen or Brother 89 reported on -quote -- "enemy
- 25 situations in the grassroots and in troop units or

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 149 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 22/01/2013

- 1 organizations". He describes the arrest of 100 persons who had
- 2 engaged in unrest on the border of Kandal Steung district in
- 3 Sector 33, and the arrest of 60 persons in Sector 25, whose
- 4 conduct he describes as follows -- quote:
- 5 [09.22.44]
- 6 "They raised a white banner with the slogans, 'Love Live
- 7 Buddhism', 'Long Live the White Khmer Front of Liberation from
- 8 Rice by the Can.' They were getting ready for major unrest on 20
- 9 August." End of quote.
- 10 Son Sen states in this part of the meeting that there was a --
- 11 quote -- "nexus between this situation and our army", and he
- 12 indicates that some of the arrested people said in their
- 13 responses that their leader was Chakrey, a reference to the
- 14 former Secretary of Division 170, Chan Chakrey, who had been
- 15 arrested earlier that year.
- 16 [09.23.42]
- 17 The minutes record five measures proposed by Son Sen in response
- 18 to this situation -- which may be seen at Khmer page 00052380
- 19 through 52381, English 00183966, French 00386196 through 97 --
- 20 and the first measure proposed by Son Sen was quote: "Give
- 21 additional education about the spirit of vigilance. Do not allow
- 22 pacifism." End of quote. The third measure was quote:
- 23 "Divisions are to examine and keep track of no-good elements.
- 24 Organize for them to be administered separately."
- 25 Later, in this same meeting in his concluding remarks -- which

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 149 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 22/01/2013

- 1 can be seen at Khmer, 00052382; English, 00183968; French,
- 2 00386199; Son Sen states -- quote:
- 3 "The enemy would like to take the opportunity to gather up
- 4 no-good elements, the status and rank-conscious, those whose
- 5 families we have swept out, those whom we have removed from their
- 6 positions, and those who have not internalized the revolutionary
- 7 movement and can't keep up with the rest, and, at the same time,
- 8 the New People who don't yet understand things, whom we are
- 9 putting in difficulty and temporarily lack food." End of quote.
- 10 Continuing a few paragraphs later, proposed measure 2B states:
- 11 "It is imperative to conduct further purges of no-good elements.
- 12 It is imperative to be absolute."
- 13 [09.26.25]
- 14 Next document is E3/1133 -- that's E3/1133 -- this is an example
- of the detailed reports regularly provided by divisions,
- 16 including matters relating to arrests and interrogations of
- 17 enemies. It is a September 1, 1976 report from Division 502
- 18 Secretary, Sou Met, which describes in detail the arrests of two
- 19 soldiers who had stolen chickens, rice, and weapons and reports
- 20 on their confessions, which identified other enemies in their
- 21 network who were subsequently arrested.
- 22 Document E3/813 -- E3/813 -- is the minutes of a meeting between
- 23 Son Sen and Division 164 that was held on the 9th of September
- 24 1976. In this meeting, Division 164 provided a detailed report on
- 25 the enemy situation in its area, including the capture of a small

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 149 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 22/01/2013

- 1 boat with five Thai and one Khmer person at Koh -- Rong Sanlem
- 2 Island.
- 3 In response to this incident, Son Sen proposed the following
- 4 measure in section 4.1 of the minutes quote: "Would like to ask
- 5 the C Unit to be more vigilant. Please send the group of boats
- 6 that came in Koh Rong Sanlem to Angkar for interrogation." End of
- 7 quote.
- 8 The report from Division 164 at the same meeting also included
- 9 the following statement at the end of section 3 of the minutes --
- 10 quote: "Mostly, the civilians are good, but there are bad
- 11 movements in the military. Recently, one soldier lieutenant of
- 12 the former regime was discovered and arrested." End of quote.
- 13 [09.29.18]
- 14 On that same day, 9 September 1976, Son Sen also participated in
- 15 a meeting with Division 703 Secretary, Pin; S 21 chairman, Duch;
- 16 and S 71 chairman, Pang -- which was recorded in document E3/811
- 17 -- E3/811 -- and this meeting concerned leaflets criticizing the
- 18 regime that had been found near Wat Botum in Phnom Penh two days
- 19 earlier. In this meeting, S 21 chairman, Duch, notes that cadres
- 20 from Division 170 -- Chakrey's division -- had been arrested in
- 21 relation to a prior incident involving similar leaflets. Son Sen
- 22 identifies two networks of enemies that could be responsible --
- 23 quote: "Links connected to Division 170" -- or -- quote -- "703's
- 24 coming from Sector 25".
- 25 [09.30.42]

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 149 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 22/01/2013

- 1 The measures decided at this meeting and recorded at the end of
- 2 the minutes are noteworthy -- I quote:
- 3 "In terms of organizational problems, Comrades Pang and Kham My
- 4 must recognize their heavy duties and go all out in doing
- 5 constant political and ideological education. They must firmly
- 6 grasp biographies." End of quote.
- 7 In relation to Division 703, Chairman Phim was directed to --
- 8 quote -- "re examine his unit of organization", and the last
- 9 measures recorded in the minutes are as follows -- quote: "As for
- 10 security, I suggest that it increase its surveillance of enemy
- 11 situations. I suggest Comrade Pang liaise with the various
- 12 ministries. The 170s should be rounded up in one place." End of
- 13 quote.
- 14 [09.31.56]
- One week later, on the 16th of September 1976, a meeting was held
- 16 between Son Sen; Duch; Division 170 Secretary, Sok; and Division
- 17 290 Secretary, Tal; which is recorded in document E3/822 --
- 18 that's E3/822. This meeting discussed the recent arrest of Sector
- 19 24 Secretary, Chhouk, who had been implicated by Chakrey. The
- 20 minutes expressly refer to a -- quote "plan that Angkar had
- 21 sent out pursuant to which" -- quote -- "all Chakrey connections
- 22 have to be arrested." The meeting thus agreed on the arrest of
- 23 four cadres from Division 290, 29 cadres from Division 170, whose
- 24 names are recorded in the document, and the wife and niece of
- 25 former division secretary, Chakrey. The minutes also note that in

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 149 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 22/01/2013

- 1 a meeting held the previous day, the arrest of 11 additional
- 2 people from Division 170 had been decided.
- 3 [09.33.36]
- 4 Document E3/800 is the next I will present -- E3/800. It is the
- 5 minutes of a meeting of the division and independent regiment
- 6 secretaries and deputy secretaries that was also held on the
- 7 evening of 16 September 1976. In paragraph 3 of the concluding
- 8 remarks by Brother 89, titled "Examination of our Army", Son Sen
- 9 draws attention to the fact that the army includes no-good
- 10 elements, deserters, and some 17 April People from Phnom Penh,
- 11 and he proposes the following measure -- quote:
- 12 "Must keep a trace and have a good and thorough grasp of the
- 13 biographies of the army, especially of those who have just been
- 14 included by beating the drum after the day on which the whole
- 15 country was liberated." End of quote.
- 16 Another good example of the structured and detailed reporting by
- 17 division secretaries at joint meetings with Son Sen is document
- 18 E3/810 -- that is E3/810 -- the minutes of a division secretaries
- 19 meeting held on the 19th of September 1976. In these minutes, it
- 20 can be seen how each of the divisions and independent regiments
- 21 reported on the situations in their organizations, covering each
- 22 of the following subjects in order. First, the enemy situation;
- 23 second the food production situation; followed by the health
- 24 situation; the food supply situation; and concluding with the
- 25 Party situation.

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 149 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 22/01/2013

- 1 [09.36.02]
- 2 The reports in this document show serious limitations in food
- 3 supplies and significant health problems in the military.
- 4 Division 170 Secretary, Sok, reported -- quote: "Forty per cent
- 5 of the brothers and sisters are sick with swelling, diarrhoea,
- 6 and malaria. Ten have died this month."
- 7 Division 310 Secretary, Oeun, reported -- quote: "Two thousand
- 8 and six hundred brothers and sisters are sick, of whom 400 are
- 9 seriously ill and cannot work."
- 10 He also reported -- quote: "All food supplies will have been
- 11 eaten during this September."
- 12 [09.37.01]
- 13 Division 450 Secretary Suong reports -- quote: "There are 300
- 14 people sick at the division hospital. Including those at the
- 15 regiments, there are 1,000 sick."
- 16 Continuing on: "During September, all [food supplies] have been
- 17 drawn from General Staff Logistics; there are no food supplies of
- 18 our own." End of quote.
- 19 Documents E3/1024 and E3/1101 -- let me repeat the two documents,
- 20 E3/1024 and E3/1101 -- are examples of written instructions or
- 21 orders communicated by Son Sen by telegram to divisions under the
- 22 command of the Centre. These two documents are largely identical
- 23 telegrams that were sent out by Son Sen under his alias Khieu, on
- 24 the same day, the 23rd of September 1976: one of the telegrams
- 25 going to Division 810 Secretary, Roeun, and the other going to

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 149 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 22/01/2013

- 1 Division 920 Secretary, Chhin.
- 2 The instructions sent by Son Sen to these two divisions concerned
- 3 revisionist enemies, in particular, Vietnamese who were
- 4 identified as "the Sevens" or "Group Seven" who were quote -
- 5 "conducting liaison activities in order to go undercover and bore
- 6 from within our army and grassroots" and who were encouraging the
- 7 people to quote -- "oppose cooperatives and oppose our line of
- 8 socialist revolution".
- 9 [09.39.30]
- 10 In these telegrams, Son Sen instructs -- quote:
- 11 "It is imperative to maintain surveillance of any elements who
- 12 have had contact with the Sevens or tendencies to prefer the
- 13 Sevens to ensure they do not hold leadership positions in the
- 14 army at any level whatsoever."
- 15 For such individuals, Son Sen further orders Divisions 801 and
- 16 920 to quote "absolutely not allow them to bore from within
- 17 among either cadres or combatants and in particular absolutely
- 18 not to allow them to have any contact whatsoever with the
- 19 divisions along the border". End of quote.
- 20 Document E3/801 is the minutes of a 30 September 1976 meeting of
- 21 the divisions and the logistics office of the General Staff, also
- 22 referred to as Office 62. For this document, I would refer the
- 23 Chamber to the discussion of arrests, including S 21, that can be
- 24 found in the first section of the minutes where all divisions
- 25 reported on the enemy situation in their units.

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 149 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 22/01/2013

- 1 [09.41.03]
- 2 For example, Division 310 reports on ill-disciplined elements who
- 3 had not changed after repeated re education and sought Angkar's
- 4 advice on those individuals. Division 170 reported that a person
- 5 had been quote -- "arrested and sent to S 21 on the 24th of
- 6 September".
- 7 Document E3/820 -- E3/820 -- is a 1 October 1976 report regarding
- 8 Division 170 that was written by witness, Ung Ren while on
- 9 assignment at the General Staff office. Division 170, as noted in
- 10 prior documents, is the division that had been commanded by
- 11 Chakrey until his arrest earlier that year.
- 12 In section 1 of Ren's report, which consists of a review of the
- 13 past month's work of the division, paragraph E states as follows
- 14 -- quote: "The Party's discipline has been implemented in
- 15 accordance with the Party's decision. This includes the removal
- of the cadres who have had political affiliation." End of quote.
- 17 Section 3 of this report describes a criticism and self-criticism
- 18 meeting in which division secretary, Sok, is criticized for
- 19 failing to fully grasp biographies, especially -- quote: "The
- 20 contemptible Chakrey's associates" -- and near the end of this
- 21 report there is a description of various cadres from the division
- 22 who were -- quote -- "sent to the division education site".
- 23 [09.43.22]
- 24 Document E3/1225 -- that's E3/1225 -- is a 6 October 1976
- 25 telegram that was sent from Dim, the Deputy Secretary of Division

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 149 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 22/01/2013

- 1 164. It is addressed to Brother Muth, the division secretary, and
- 2 cc'd or copied to Brother Nuon and Brother Khieu. Paragraph 3 of
- 3 that telegram discusses the use of children to search for bandits
- 4 and concludes -- quote: "If we fail to meet those bandits, at
- 5 least we will meet contemptible traitors burrowing within the
- 6 village who would come to contact those bandits." End of quote.
- 7 I would now like to turn to document E3/13 -- E3/13 -- which is a
- 8 document I would like to cover in some detail. This document is
- 9 the minutes of a 9 October 1976 meeting of the secretaries and
- 10 deputy secretaries of the divisions and independent regiments.
- 11 [09.45.00]
- 12 Pursuant to the agenda for that meeting, the first item discussed
- 13 was the upcoming ceremony for the Party anniversary that was to
- 14 take place on the 11th of October, and the minutes note that the
- 15 commemoration of the Party anniversary, whose date was actually
- 16 the 30th of September, had been delayed that year because --
- 17 quote -- "the organization has been busy" -- end of quote.
- 18 And, in order to understand the context of the delay in the Party
- 19 anniversary celebration that year, I would like to step back for
- 20 a moment and present two other documents recording events that
- 21 took place in the weeks leading up to the Party anniversary.
- 22 The first of those documents is D288/6.5/2.22 -- let me repeat,
- 23 D288/6.5/2.22, which is the S-21 confession file of Sector 24
- 24 Secretary, Chhouk, who had been arrested on the 31st of August
- 25 1976, and whose interrogation at S-21 was on-going in the month

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 149 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 22/01/2013

- 1 of September 1976.
- 2 [09.46.41]
- 3 That file at Khmer 00038515, contains a 19 September 1976
- 4 document, whose cover page is titled: "First Step of 8's
- 5 Confession and Plans to Smash Brother No. 1, and Brother Number
- 6 2, while travelling during a party assembly, the party
- 7 anniversary or other celebrations during 1976".
- 8 And the document I would like to focus on is a 26 September 1976
- 9 report written by Duch, which is addressed "To Respected
- 10 Brother", and this report by Duch, can be found at Khmer pages
- 11 00038660 through 38662; English pages 00831531 through 33.
- 12 The first paragraph of Duch's report stated that: "Brother Pho
- 13 did act as an active mastermind and orchestrator of the plot to
- 14 get rid of Brother I, Brother II, yourself, and some other
- 15 leaders with intellectual background."
- 16 The second background document to help understand the events of
- 17 this period is E3/192 -- that is E3/192. On the 27th of September
- 18 1976, following the date of the document I just presented in
- 19 which Duch reported to his superior on a purported assassination
- 20 plan, a statement was issued by Khieu Samphan announcing that Pol
- 21 Pot, premier of Democratic Kampuchea, was taking temporary leave
- 22 from his task in order to take care of his health.
- 23 [09.49.19]
- 24 It also announces that Nuon Chea has been appointed to
- 25 temporarily replace Pol Pot, as acting premier effective from the

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 149 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 22/01/2013

- 1 27th of September 1976. And I present these two documents in
- 2 order to understand the context of the time period during which
- 3 the Party anniversary ceremony was delayed from the 30th of
- 4 September, to the 11th of October 1976.
- 5 Returning now to E3/13, the minutes of the 9 October 1976
- 6 division secretary's meeting, and in the middle of these minutes,
- 7 beginning at Khmer 00052405; English 00183984; and French
- 8 00334974 -- Son Sen provides a detailed report to the division
- 9 leaders on quote -- "a number of traitors in the Party whom we
- 10 have been able to arrest" and on plans that were learned through
- 11 their responses to interrogations.
- 12 [09.50.53]
- 13 And I will now read a number of excerpts from this part of Son
- 14 Sen's report quote: "First, we arrested the traitorous links in
- 15 Division 170. You must take note with regard to this problem to
- 16 maintain secrecy and not to disseminate to the lower levels".
- 17 Continuing a few paragraphs below -- quote:
- 18 "Previously there were incidents of guns being fired near the
- 19 Fine Arts School, and leaflets being thrown near the Palace. Then
- 20 in early April 1976, they threw grenades and threw leaflets
- 21 again. We felt these were enemy activities. Those implicated in
- 22 the answers of those we were able to arrest went right up to
- 23 Chakrey."
- 24 And I would note here, that the initial person arrested following
- 25 the grenade explosion at the Royal Palace that is described here,

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 149 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 22/01/2013

- 1 was a cadre named Yim Sambath. His S-21 file, document
- 2 D288/6.5/2.14 -- let me repeat, D288/6.5/2.14 -- includes a
- 3 report by Duch dated the 6th of August 1976.
- 4 [09.52.41]
- 5 This report which can be found at Khmer, 00245206 through 245211;
- 6 English, 00284003 through 08; and French, 00800759 through 64;
- 7 this is a report written by Duch on August 6th, 1976 that
- 8 describes in detail the history of arrests and confessions that
- 9 eventually led to the arrest of Division 170 Secretary, Chakrey.
- 10 It also, in this document, Duch forwarded to his superiors,
- 11 letters that had been found in Chakrey's room after his arrest on
- 12 the 20th of May 1976; and the information in this report is
- 13 consistent with what is reported by Son Sen to the division
- 14 secretaries at the 9th of October 1976 meeting.
- 15 And returning, again, to the minutes of that meeting, E3/13, Son
- 16 Sen provides a report regarding the arrest of Chakrey, which
- 17 continues as follows at Khmer page 00052405 through 52406;
- 18 English page 00183985; French page 00334975, and in this part of
- 19 the minutes, Son Sen's statements are recorded as follows quote
- 20 -- these are Son Sen's statements regarding -- describing the
- 21 arrest of Chakrey -- quote:
- 22 [09.55.08]
- 23 "Upon arrest, he responded clearly that he was a Seri link and
- 24 that his boss was Chhouk, the Secretary of Sector 24. We arrested
- 25 Chhouk and he responded that he had contacts with a Vietnamese to

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 149 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 22/01/2013

- 1 make arrangements to attack our Party's leading apparatus. They
- 2 would attack from the inside while Vietnam attacked from the
- 3 outside. The Yuon was named Bai Map. Chhouk's responses
- 4 ultimately implicated Ya. We arrested Ya, and he responded that
- 5 he had been a traitor since 1962, along with somebody else named,
- 6 Kev Meah. This network had created a new party back in 1962, and
- 7 was linked with Eum Ovrai and Keum Saet. We could then see
- 8 clearly what had been going on with the unrest in Koh Kong and
- 9 the problem of contradictions between Sector 25 and Sector 33.
- 10 "We have basically smashed the leadership links, but their
- 11 henchman still exists..." End of quote.
- 12 On the next page of this document, at the bottom of Khmer 52407,
- 13 Son Sen makes a statement regarding the forced movement of the
- 14 Cambodian population from urban areas and I quote:
- 15 "If we had left the people in and not evacuated them from cities
- 16 and towns, we would not have the peace and quiet we enjoy today.
- 17 If we had not been absolute about making cooperatives, not been
- 18 absolute about making socialism, we would not be victorious."
- 19 [09.57.23]
- 20 And it is revealing in these minutes to look at the remarks of
- 21 the division and regiment secretaries that followed Son Sen's
- 22 announcement of the arrests of Chhouk and Ya, starting on Khmer
- 23 page 00052408; English, 00183987; French, 00334978. In this part
- 24 of the minutes, Division 170 Secretary, Sok, after this
- 25 announcement noted -- quote: "Division 170 has purged 70

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 149 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 22/01/2013

- 1 no-goods, and is keeping them in one place."
- 2 Division 290 Secretary, Tal, reports -- quote: "Company cadre
- 3 manifested opposition activities by not disseminating the Party
- 4 line within the unit of organization or not distributing the
- 5 Banner's magazine".
- 6 [09.58.47]
- 7 On the next page of this document, Khmer, 52409; Division 703
- 8 Secretary, Pin, states -- ERN is 00052409. And at this part of
- 9 the minutes, Division 703 Secretary, Pin, states -- quote:
- 10 "As regards the problem of traitors and the Party's measures, I
- 11 agree completely. The reason for the treason is these guys'
- 12 contradictions about status and rank [...] even though we've
- 13 arrested their bosses, they are continuing with their activities.
- 14 "As for the problem of a grasp on the unit of organization, after
- 15 repeated study and purges, it is possible to guarantee the
- 16 defence of the Party." End of quote.
- 17 Division 450 Secretary, Suong, reports -- quote: "The no-good
- 18 elements have been rounded up, but not yet entirely purged. I
- 19 have a grasp on those who are liberal to a certain degree."
- 20 And on the next page, Khmer, 00052410; Division 310 Secretary,
- 21 Oeun, makes the following statement -- quote:
- 22 [10.00.45]
- 23 "In the past, the Party gave repeated education about events
- 24 taking place inside the Party and inside leading units of
- 25 organization, about the enemies boring from within [...] However,

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 149 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 22/01/2013

- 1 I never previously imagined that there was treason at such an
- 2 important level as in the information that the Organization has
- 3 gotten today."
- 4 Continuing later -- quote:
- 5 "...a number of cadres' biographies are not yet clearly grasped,
- 6 and it's not known whether they are clean, reliable and
- 7 enthusiastic, or not clean. There is the phenomenon of those who
- 8 are concealing their biographies, all the way up to the company
- 9 cadre level, those who originally were White Khmer or who have
- 10 lived with the Vietnamese. In total, we have got 36 no-goods."
- 11 End of quote.
- 12 [10.01.50]
- 13 On the next page, at Khmer, 00052411; Division 502 Secretary, Sou
- 14 Met, comments as follows -- quote: "After the Party revealed the
- 15 upper traitorous links belonging to American imperialism and the
- 16 revisionists, I was happy and had more faith in the Party."
- 17 Continuing later: "With regard to this problem, it can be
- 18 stipulated that the enemies have been basically eliminated, but
- 19 it is imperative to take further measures to prevent this from
- 20 happening a second, a third, and a fourth and so on again time.
- 21 "It is imperative to dare absolutely to conduct purges." End of
- 22 quote.
- 23 [10.02.51]
- 24 On this same page, Division 164 Secretary, Meas Muth, states --
- 25 quote:

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 149 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 22/01/2013

- 1 "I would like to say about the concern with activities of the
- 2 traitors within the Party, that this has been a great victory for
- 3 our Party. This lesson has strengthened another degree the
- 4 standpoint of revolutionary vigilance.
- 5 "As for the problem of the grasp on the unit of organization,
- 6 cadre and combatants, it is not yet firm. No-good elements or
- 7 enemies are still camouflaged and infiltrated in the
- 8 rank-and-file." End of quote.
- 9 And in Son Sen's concluding statements, at this meeting held on
- 10 the 9th of October 1976, he makes the following remarks in
- 11 section 1, which can be seen commencing at Khmer, 00052412
- 12 through 52413; English, 00183991; French, 00334981. At this part
- of the meeting, Son Sen states and I quote:
- 14 "Those present at the meeting are in unity with the Party in
- 15 considering that the arrest of these traitors is a great victory
- 16 over the revisionists who were following the secret road and had
- 17 been infiltrating for more than 10 years already."
- 18 Continuing a couple of paragraphs below -- quote: "Another
- 19 lesson results in our realizing that trivial activities attacking
- 20 the revolution, such as stealing and speaking in hints that
- 21 attack the revolution, all issue forth from such traitorous
- 22 links." End of quote.
- 23 [10.05.17]
- 24 And the measures set forth in section 3 of Son Sen's concluding
- 25 statements, include the following operational methods, which you

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 149 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 22/01/2013

- 1 may find at Khmer page 00052414; proposed "Measures" reads and
- 2 I quote:
- 3 "It is imperative to purge no-good elements absolutely in the
- 4 sense of an absolute class struggle. "The purge is premised on
- 5 three principles:
- 6 "Category 1: The dangerous category: They must be absolutely
- 7 purged.
- 8 "Category 2: The ordinary liberal category: They must be educated
- 9 again and again in our education schools.
- 10 "Category 3: The category of those who have merely been incited
- 11 by the enemy, merely believed the enemy incitement. As a first
- 12 step, they should undergo refashioning to get them to no longer
- 13 believe the enemy..." End of quote.
- 14 [10.06.34]
- 15 The next document I would like to turn to is document E3/815 --
- 16 that is E3/815, which is the minutes of a meeting with the
- 17 division secretaries and deputies that was held on the 18th of
- 18 October 1976. At this meeting, Son Sen makes yet another
- 19 presentation on the treasonous events in the army and in the base
- 20 areas, which are attributed to two groups; first, the CIA; and
- 21 second, the revisionist group, led by the Soviet Union and
- 22 Vietnam.
- 23 The meeting also agreed on the following measure, which you can
- 24 see at Khmer page 00095529 through 95530; English, 00877017; and
- 25 French, 00623945 through 46. And the measure that is stated in

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 149 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 22/01/2013

- 1 the minutes here reads as follows -- quote:
- 2 "With the entire country, let the military staff have discussion
- 3 with the Zones. Wherever the Centre Army is located, we will take
- 4 measures, especially in the defence of Phnom Penh. One division
- 5 must prepare one battalion of forces weapons with ammunition and
- 6 vehicles to be constantly on standby. This battalion specifically
- 7 must prepare one company with the objective of defending the
- 8 radio station, Angkar's location, and the Military Staff
- 9 locations. Select people that are clean in terms of politics,
- 10 ideology, and organization. Arm them with light weapons: AKs,
- 11 light machine guns, M-79s, B-40s, B-41s. Deploy this force at the
- 12 city's important target areas, and maintain constant radio
- 13 contact with the Military Staff." End of quote.
- 14 [10.09.25]
- 15 Next document is E3/1135 -- that's E3/1135, which is another
- 16 example of a military division report to Son Sen, which was then
- 17 forwarded by Son Sen to other party leaders, in this case to the
- 18 accused, Nuon Chea. This is a 19 October 1976 report that
- 19 originates from Division 164 Secretary, Muth, to Brother 89,
- 20 regarding certain individuals who had disappeared from the
- 21 Division 164 hospital. And on the left margin of the document --
- 22 if you would look at the left margin at the document -- there is
- 23 a handwritten note sent the following day from Son Sen alias
- 24 Khieu, to Bong Nuon, making a request for approval to search for
- 25 two of the individuals listed in Meas Muth's report.

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 149 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 22/01/2013

- 1 [10.10.45]
- 2 Document E3/1151, E3/1151, is an example of a telegram sent from
- 3 Son Sen to Division 164 Secretary, Muth, communicating approval
- 4 for measures that had been proposed. And this is a telegram from
- 5 Brother 89 to comrade Muth, dated 4 November 1976, which states
- 6 in the upper left hand corner, "Instruction for 164". And in the
- 7 first sentence of the telegram, it identifies the specific
- 8 telegram from Division 164 Secretary, Muth, to which it was
- 9 responding.
- 10 In paragraph 3, Son Sen conveys approval for the measures that
- 11 had been proposed by Muth, and then lists further measures
- 12 relating to the issue of vessels entering Cambodian waters.
- 13 Documents E3/1585 -- that's E3/1585, is the attendance list for
- 14 the First General Staff study session that began on the 20th of
- 15 October 1976.
- 16 And documents E3/847 and E3/1142 are attendance records for the
- 17 Second General Staff study session that commenced on the 23rd of
- 18 November 1976. I will not discuss these documents further today,
- 19 other than to note that they provide a useful record for the
- 20 Chamber, by which to identify the various divisions and
- 21 independent regiments and the individuals who served on the
- 22 division regiment and battalion committees that formed the RAK in
- 23 this time period.
- 24 [10.13.17]
- 25 The next document I would like to discuss is document E3/1164 --

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 149 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 22/01/2013

- 1 that's E3/1164. This is a report dated 25 November 1976, from
- 2 Division 801 Secretary, Roeun, to Brother 89. And at Khmer page
- 3 00052327; English, 00516711; French, 00532754; the report
- 4 proposes a number of organizational measures relating to enemies
- 5 who had infiltrated the division including that -- quote: "Anyone
- 6 who is suspicious of being an enemy must absolutely be arrested."
- 7 End of quote.
- 8 And, that temporary arrests should be made of persons implicated
- 9 in documents.
- 10 At the end of the document, the Division 801 Secretary states --
- 11 quote:
- 12 "This is a report of Committee 801 regarding enemy activities and
- 13 measures as stated above and we request that Uncle make remarks
- 14 and comments. We look forward to receiving the Party's
- 15 recommendations." End of quote.
- 16 [10.15.03]
- 17 Document E3/804, E3/804, is the minutes of a meeting of the
- 18 secretaries and logistic officers of the divisions and
- 19 independent regiments that was held on the 15th of December 1976.
- 20 And at paragraph 2a, of the concluding opinions of Brother 89
- 21 regarding Party work, Son Sen discusses the result of efforts to
- 22 date to screen biographies of military cadres and notes -- quote:
- 23 "The results of grasping the biographies this time were good, but
- 24 there are still some comrades who are hiding their histories. Be
- 25 most careful about those whose mothers and fathers were purged or

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 149 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 22/01/2013

- 1 whose siblings were purged."
- 2 And in paragraph 4, regarding military installations, Son Sen
- 3 instructs -- quote: "Must prepare, especially for the
- 4 intervention unit. Must screen it clean. Only when the General
- 5 Staff sends orders to the division and the division give the
- 6 order, can they go out on operations." End of guote.
- 7 [10.16.48]
- 8 Son Sen also discusses in Section 3 of these minutes, a number of
- 9 Party circulars that had been received in which Angkar
- 10 communicated decisions that pistols were not to be carried in
- 11 general, and that the use of telephones was to be avoided for
- 12 secrecy reasons.
- 13 An example of how information was reported up the chain of
- 14 command can also be seen in documents E3/1079 and E3/1132. The
- 15 first of these documents, E3/1079, is a report that was sent by
- 16 Division 801 Secretary, Roeun, to Brother 89 on the 25th of
- 17 December 1976.
- 18 The second document, E3/1132, is a report prepared by the General
- 19 Staff, which is titled quote: "Overall Situation in the Country
- 20 and Along the Border Via Telegrams from the 01 to 31 December
- 21 1976."
- 22 And in comparing these two documents, it can be seen that the
- 23 information that was reported by the Division 801 Secretary in
- 24 the first document, in paragraphs 2, 3, and 4 of his report, were
- 25 then taken by the General Staff and included as part of their

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 149 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 22/01/2013

- 1 overall report regarding the situation for that month, which you
- 2 will see in the section for Division 801 in the General Staff
- 3 report.
- 4 [10.18.53]
- 5 I will now turn to a few examples of documents -- military
- 6 documents -- from 1977.
- 7 E3/807, I repeat E3/807 is the minutes of a division secretaries'
- 8 meeting that was held on the 1st of March 1977. In section 1 of
- 9 these minutes, there is extensive reporting of the on-going
- 10 purges in the military. For example, Division 502 Secretary, Met,
- 11 reports -- quote:
- 12 "It's obvious that a number of elements whom we had previously
- 13 arrested really are enemy elements. More than 50 no-goods have
- 14 been sent to S-21.
- 15 "There can only be reliability if five more platoon secretaries
- 16 are removed." End of quote.
- 17 [10.20.04]
- 18 Secretary Chhin of Division 920, who, himself, would be arrested
- 19 and sent to S-21 two weeks later, reports -- quote: "...those who
- 20 came to us from the Vietnamese and the children of soldiers,
- 21 sub-district chiefs and police were purged and sent to do
- 22 production in one place." End of quote.
- 23 And Comrade Yan, from Division 450 reports: "Maybe 600 persons
- 24 are elements who must be removed."
- 25 In this same meeting; and I would refer you to Khmer pages

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 149 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 22/01/2013

- 1 00052306 and also 52308 through 09; English pages, 00183951
- 2 through 53; and French pages, 00323925 through 27, Brother 89,
- 3 Son Sen, advises the divisions as follows -- quote: "After we
- 4 eliminated the Chhouk and Ya treasonous networks, we discovered
- 5 another treasonous network which we have basically eliminated."
- 6 Later, Son Sen continues to provide another detailed history of
- 7 the purges within the Party, and his proposed measure states --
- 8 quote: "Mere education is not enough. It is imperative to
- 9 continue further with absolute purges."
- 10 [10.22.12]
- 11 Son Sen also instructs at this meeting that the duty of defending
- 12 the country was now to take precedence over all other duties of
- 13 the RAK.
- 14 And at Khmer page 00052310, Son Sen notes the distinction between
- 15 antagonistic contradictions and internal contradictions, stating
- 16 -- quote:
- 17 "It is imperative to grasp the antagonistic contradictions to the
- 18 utmost degree. In the past, we have eliminated a lot of important
- 19 traitorous links, but it is imperative to continue with further
- 20 revolutionary vigilance because remnants still remain, and new
- 21 traitors will continue to be born.
- 22 "Internal contradictions require education, whereas antagonistic
- 23 contradictions require absolute organizational methods." End of
- 24 quote.
- 25 [10.23.30]

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 149 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 22/01/2013

- 1 Documents E3/1061 and E3/1060 are reports from Division 801 to
- 2 Brother 89, dated the 24th of March 1977, and the 29th of March
- 3 1977, both of which contain handwritten annotations forwarding
- 4 those reports to Angkar.
- 5 In Section 3 of the 24 March 1977 report, which is document
- 6 E3/1061, Division 801 Secretary, Roeun, reports on the capture of
- 7 seven Vietnamese prisoners at the border, and on the results of
- 8 the interrogation of those prisoners.
- 9 And in his 29 March 1977 report -- document E3/1060 -- he
- 10 describes the enemy situation throughout the entire Northeast
- 11 region, including the base.
- 12 [10.24.54]
- 13 The handwritten annotation in the upper left side of the first
- 14 page of E3/160 -- I'm sorry; E3/1060. The handwritten annotation
- 15 on the first page of that report forwards the document to Angkar
- 16 and makes reference to Tuol Sleng.
- 17 And paragraph 5 at the very end of this report sums up the
- 18 situation in the unit as follows -- quote: "We were following the
- 19 trail of both new and old elements destroying the revolution.
- 20 Those targets included those going against the revolutionary line
- 21 and those newly and previously implicated by the enemy." End of
- 22 quote.
- 23 [10.25.53]
- 24 In regards to how division secretaries were informed of persons
- 25 in their divisions who had been implicated, I would like to now

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 149 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 22/01/2013

- 1 present a few examples of annotations on S-21 confessions which
- 2 reflect how division secretaries were informed by the Centre of
- 3 people implicated.
- 4 First is document D43/4 Annex 22, we repeat D43/4 Annex 22, and
- 5 this is a S-21 confession of a cadre from Division 502 named Sour
- 6 Tuon alias Mao, and I would like if we can show on the screen
- 7 please, Khmer page 00173999, 173999, which is English page,
- 8 00224628; French, 00271447. And there is a handwritten note on
- 9 the cover page of this confession from Son Sen to Division 801
- 10 Secretary, Roeun, which reads as follows:
- 11 "Dear Comrade Roeun, please read this report of Mao and pick out
- 12 the relevant names of Unit 801.
- 13 "I will help you tomorrow, as I am busy this afternoon.
- 14 "May you keep this confidential."
- 15 [10.28.02]
- 16 This note, which is in red, is signed by Khieu and dated the 2nd
- 17 of June 1977.
- 18 Another example is document E3/150 -- that's E3/150 -- which is
- 19 the S-21 confession of Division 164, Deputy Secretary Hang Doeun
- 20 alias Dhoem, and the annotation I would like to present on this
- 21 confession is at Khmer page 00174375 -- that's 174375; English,
- 22 00224085; French, 00235668. And if you would look at this
- 23 annotation, it includes the following statement -- quote: "To
- 24 brother to be informed. About the plan, it is followed. Though
- 25 some are the right people, some others, whom I have known, are

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 149 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 22/01/2013

- 1 not. I will invite comrade Mut to check this together." End of
- 2 quote.
- 3 [10.29.35]
- 4 Another example of the coordination between the Centre and
- 5 divisions relating to persons implicated in S-21 confessions is
- 6 document D43/4 Annex 99 -- that is, D43 Annex -- I'm sorry, D43/4
- 7 Annex 99. And this is another confession of a Division 164 cadre,
- 8 Khuon Dim (phonetic), and I would refer to the cover page, which
- 9 is Khmer 00175293; English, 00822359; French, 00289872.
- 10 This page contains a handwritten note dated 10 September 1977,
- 11 signed by Son Sen under his alias Khieu, and paragraph 2 of Son
- 12 Sen's note states -- quote: "...22 as well as Division 164 of
- 13 Comrade Muth are mentioned."
- 14 And in paragraph 3b of the note -- quote: "Contact Comrade Muth
- 15 so that he can take measures. We have already basically removed
- 16 all those on Comrade Muth's side."
- 17 And I would also note that at the top of the same page there is
- 18 another annotation indicating that a copy of this confession was
- 19 sent to Brother Nuon on the 10th of September 1977.
- 20 [10.31.47]
- 21 In addition to substantive annotations, like the ones just
- 22 presented, there are other S-21 confessions that contain more
- 23 basic annotations, simply recording that a copy of the confession
- 24 was sent to the relevant division secretary. For example, D43/4
- 25 Annex 91, is the confession of Chia Sun, a regiment secretary in

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 149 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 22/01/2013

- 1 Division 703, and referring to the top of Khmer page 00174986,
- 2 there is an annotation that reads quote: "Copy for Comrade
- 3 Pin." Similarly, document D302.5 -- that's D302.5, is the S-21
- 4 confession of a Division 502 cadre, Srei Saroeun, and underneath
- 5 the confession title at Khmer page 00235162, you will see the
- 6 annotation -- quote: "One copy sent to Comrade Met." End of
- 7 quote.
- 8 [10.33.25]
- 9 Before I conclude, Mr. President, I have a few more documents to
- 10 present relating to the military structure from the 1977 time
- 11 period. I have about five to 10 more minutes, so I can either
- 12 continue now or finish after the break, at your discretion.
- 13 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 14 Thank you.
- 15 The time is now appropriate for adjournment. The Chamber will
- 16 adjourn for 20 minutes, and we will resume at five to 11.00.
- 17 (Court recesses from 1034H to 1101H)
- 18 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 19 Please be seated. The Court is now back in session.
- 20 And the floor is once again given to the Prosecution to continue.
- 21 MR. LYSAK:
- 22 Thank you, Mr. President. I have just a few more documents left
- 23 that relate to the military during the 1977 time period.
- 24 First, document E3/1168, that's E3/1168. It is a 30 March 1977
- 25 report from Division 801 Secretary, Roeun, to Uncle 89. In this

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 149 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 22/01/2013

- 1 document, the division secretary writes to seek approval to -
- 2 quote:
- 3 "...remove a number of regimental and battalion cadre because these
- 4 comrades' implementation of the line is mostly contrary to it,
- 5 the masses have no faith in them, they do not improve through
- 6 education and the direction of their evolution is backwards." End
- 7 of quote.
- 8 [11.02.59]
- 9 Next, document E3/849, E3/849. This is a report prepared by the
- 10 General Staff for March 1977 titled "Joint Statistics of Armed
- 11 Forces." And it shows the number of forces in each RAK division,
- 12 independent regiment and office, recording a grand total of
- 13 61,189 persons in the RAK Armed Forces, as of that date.
- 14 Document E3/1199, E3/1199, is a telegram from Division 920
- 15 Secretary, San, to Brother 89, dated the 6th of April 1977. And
- 16 this telegram reports that after education of the division
- 17 cadres, there was quote: "More and more awareness and unmasking
- 18 of traitors."
- 19 This telegram contains a handwritten annotation by Son Sen alias
- 20 Khieu, sending the report to Angkar the following day. In
- 21 addition, there is an annotation on the report that states -
- 22 quote: "Arrest them."
- 23 [11.04.54]
- 24 Next, a document E3/1202, E3/1202, is a 4 June 1977 report to
- 25 Brother 89 from the Division 170 Committee Secretary, Sok. In the

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 149 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 22/01/2013

- 1 first section of this report regarding enemies, the report
- 2 identifies 11 internal enemies of concern whose acts included
- 3 that they quote: "Talked, travelled and communicated freely."
- 4 End of quote.
- 5 The report continues later on, on Khmer page 00033309, and this
- 6 is English page 00828147; French, 00623394. And I would note here
- 7 as well that it appears that the pages of the document are out of
- 8 order, as they have been copied in the case file.
- 9 The report continues at this page quote:
- 10 "The Committee agreed to request sending them to S-21. Some
- 11 people among them are still in Kampong Chhnang, and we just had
- 12 our people go get them. The details of the biographies and
- 13 activities of each of them will be done later and sent along with
- 14 them."
- 15 Concluding later quote: "I request Brother's opinion in this
- 16 regard." End of quote.
- 17 [11.07.09]
- 18 Next, document E3/1082 -- that's E3/1082, is a record of a 12
- 19 August 1977 telephone report from Division 164 Secretary, Muth,
- 20 regarding the capture of a Thai boat two kilometres from Koh
- 21 Kong. The report indicates that four Thai and one Khmer person
- 22 were arrested and being questioned. And in the left margin of the
- 23 document, you will see an annotation from Son Sen alias Khieu, to
- 24 Angkar requesting approval to quote "find inside networks" -
- 25 end of quote.

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 149 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 22/01/2013

- 1 [11.08.10]
- 2 Mr. President, the last document I would like to present today
- 3 relates to the last quarter of 1977, the time period during which
- 4 the Closing Order alleges that Son Sen had been relocated to the
- 5 East Zone to oversee the conflict with Vietnam. And this is
- 6 document E3/915, E3/915, which is a telegram from Division 164
- 7 Secretary, Muth, dated the 31st of December 1977. Notably, this
- 8 telegram from the division secretary is not addressed to Brother
- 9 89 but instead is directly addressed to Committee 870, and it is
- 10 copied to Uncle, Uncle Nuon, Brother Van, Brother Vorn, Brother
- 11 Khieu, Office, and Documentation.
- 12 [11.09.25]
- 13 In his telegram to Committee 870, Division Secretary Muth states
- 14 as follows quote:
- 15 "We have received the guiding view and the declaration of the
- 16 Party about the aggression of the Yuon who have come to swallow
- 17 the territory of our Motherland.
- 18 "We, who have the duty to defend the maritime spearhead would
- 19 like to:
- 20 "1. Be in total unity within the Party;
- 21 "2. Vow determination to fashion forces who are a tool absolutely
- 22 to defend the Party, to defend the state power of the collective
- 23 worker and peasants, and to defend the socialist Kampuchean
- 24 motherland by sweeping cleanly away and without half-measures the
- 25 uncovered elements of the enemy, whether the Yuon or other

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 149 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 22/01/2013

- 1 enemies." End of quote.
- 2 [11.10.29]
- 3 Mr. President, that concludes our presentation of documents. We
- 4 appreciate the time to present these documents relating to the
- 5 military structure issues of the Closing Order. We are prepared
- 6 to do additional presentations regarding force movements, but I'm
- 7 not sure whether you want us to proceed now or whether the floor
- 8 will be turned over to the other parties. That concludes our
- 9 presentation on military structure.
- 10 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 11 Thank you.
- 12 Let we deal with one topic at a time, so that other parties would
- 13 also have the opportunity to comment or to make their remarks.
- 14 The floor is now given to the Lead Co-Lawyers for the civil
- 15 parties, if they wish to make any comment or to add to what has
- 16 been presented by the Co-Prosecutor regarding the military
- 17 structure of Democratic Kampuchea's army.
- 18 You may proceed.
- 19 [11.11.54]
- 20 MS. SIMONNEAU-FORT:
- 21 Good morning, Mr. President. Good morning, Your Honours, and good
- 22 morning everyone.
- 23 We are not ready to present our documents now, because we thought
- 24 that the prosecutors were going to present all their documents
- 25 regarding the forced transfers and the military structure today.

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 149 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 22/01/2013

- 1 We are not in a position to present today. We thought the
- 2 prosecutor was going to present everything in one go.
- 3 We would request that the prosecutor should continue making their
- 4 presentations, and we will present ours subsequently. Thank you.
- 5 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 6 I just gave the instruction to the prosecutor that we deal with
- 7 one theme at a time.
- 8 We would like now to give the floor to the Defence teams,
- 9 starting from Nuon Chea's defence, so that you have the
- 10 opportunity to make a comment or to object to the documents
- 11 presented by the Prosecution regarding the military structure of
- 12 the Democratic Kampuchea's army.
- 13 [11.13.45]
- 14 MR. SON ARUN:
- 15 Good morning, Mr. President, Your Honours. In the presentation by
- 16 the Prosecution regarding the documents to be discussed before
- 17 this Chamber, on behalf of Nuon Chea's defence, I would like to
- 18 express our objections to one particular document, and that
- 19 document is a key leading to several other documents, up to the
- 20 listed number 67. That document has been discussed previously as
- 21 well -- that is, since 15 December 2011. The document is E3/5
- 22 dated August -- in the transcript of the hearing, the document
- 23 was debated on the 15th of December 2011 around 12 o'clock, at
- 24 noon.
- 25 Let me repeat; the document number is E3/5 -- that is the

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 149 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 22/01/2013

- 1 "Revolutionary Flag". The ERN is 000633244 -- that's the Khmer
- 2 ERN; English -- the French is 00538963.
- 3 [11.16.26]
- 4 In 2011, my client, Nuon Chea, himself made his statement and
- 5 expressed his stern objection to this document, objecting to the
- 6 document which is not the original document, and that is the very
- 7 document we are discussing here today.
- 8 Nuon Chea stated, in paragraph 22 in the transcript, that: "Mr.
- 9 President, the 'Revolutionary Flag' was not in this format. And
- 10 this is a document which is not a book, and I do not know where
- 11 it came from. This is not the format of the book format of the
- 12 'Revolutionary Flag'. And if you have it, please show me.
- 13 Otherwise, anybody can manufacture this kind of document."
- 14 [11.17.38]
- 15 Also, on the 15 December 2011, a little bit after that statement,
- 16 Nuon Chea added that in paragraph 2 on page 66 of the
- 17 transcript, that:
- 18 "In order for everybody to clear on this matter, pursuant to the
- 19 principle of this Chamber that is, to ascertain the truth and
- 20 justice and, of course, I'd like to add that it is also for the
- 21 interest of the people. Anybody can manufacture this kind of
- 22 document. So that I repeatedly insist for the original document
- 23 so that I can examine it, then I would know who the author was
- 24 and how it was put into the form of the 'Flag' so that we can be
- 25 sure that this is a Court which try to ascertain the truth and

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 149 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 22/01/2013

- 1 justice and not just a show trial. And, if the Court cannot
- 2 afford to give me the original document, I cannot accept this
- 3 kind of document."
- 4 Also, on that same day, at 12.36 in paragraph 22, Nuon Chea also
- 5 stated the following: "However, some words were left out. For me,
- 6 I don't understand because there were only  $[\dots]$  to that
- 7 sentence."
- 8 [11.19.52]
- 9 These statements from my client, Nuon Chea, indicate that Nuon
- 10 Chea objects to this kind of document and that he refused to
- 11 recognize that kind of "Revolutionary Flag" alleged to be written
- 12 by himself and Pol Pot, and instead of that, the Chamber and the
- 13 Prosecution insist on putting this kind of document on the case
- 14 file in order to prosecute my client.
- 15 Nuon Chea also objects to any of the copied documents without its
- 16 original version unless there is a concrete argument stating that
- 17 it is an authenticated document or original document.
- 18 And on the 7 January 1979, and prior to that date, the Vietnamese
- 19 troops intervened and had -- or engaged in a fierce attack
- 20 against the Communist Party of Kampuchea and we all could not
- 21 know for sure whether these foreigners manufactured any kinds of
- 22 document from that date until the time that the Court was
- 23 established to prosecute the Khmer Rouge leaders.
- 24 [11.21.52]
- 25 And since the opening of the Case 002, the -- does the

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 149 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 22/01/2013

- 1 Prosecution still insist on using this kind of document, claiming
- 2 that it is a reliable source of document to be put before this
- 3 Chamber and any other similar documents submitted by the
- 4 Prosecution in order to prosecute my client, Nuon Chea? I, on
- 5 behalf of the Defence team, would strongly object to any kind of
- 6 document without its original version for its use before this
- 7 Chamber. And if the Chamber wishes our team to make such
- 8 submission in writing, we will follow the instruction, and if the
- 9 Chamber refuses to deny our request then we will appeal such a
- 10 decision.
- 11 As for the books written about Democratic Kampuchea, with the
- 12 names of the authors to be discussed before this Chamber, as well
- 13 as media reports and articles presented by the Prosecution in
- 14 order to prosecute my client, I, on behalf of Nuon Chea's
- 15 defence, would like the Chamber to summon those authors of the
- 16 books to be -- to testify before this Chamber. Otherwise, the
- 17 effort that we have put in together in this Court is of no value
- 18 and then the allegation by the Prosecution is extremely vague.
- 19 And that leads to the serious violation of my client's right in
- 20 that his right has been violated and continue to be violated in
- 21 the future if that is the case.
- 22 For that reason, I urge the Chamber to consider our request and
- 23 to dismiss these kinds of documents as proposed by the
- 24 Prosecution.
- 25 [11.24.34]

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 149 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 22/01/2013

- 1 So I, basically or, our team basically objects to this
- 2 particular document -- that is, E3/5 and, of course, the
- 3 subsequent documents are of a similar kind.
- 4 I'm grateful, Mr. President.
- 5 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 6 Thank you, Counsel.
- 7 The floor is now given to Ieng Sary's defence.
- 8 MR. KARNAVAS:
- 9 Good morning, Mr. President. Good morning, Your Honours, and good
- 10 morning to everyone in and around the courtroom.
- 11 [11.25.15]
- 12 Let me just begin with some preliminary remarks, because I think
- 13 it is necessary to keep something in mind, and that is, over the
- 14 course of the last day or so, the Prosecution has begun, as they
- 15 have in prior occasions when we deal with these issues, to give
- 16 their closing argument. They provide not just a document and what
- 17 the document contains but also their spin and how it connects or
- 18 how it is linked to the indictment and to the events and to the
- 19 Accused.
- 20 So, to that extent, while far be it for me to advise the Trial
- 21 Chamber on how to proceed in conducting this trial, it is my
- 22 obligation to point out that these remarks are only remarks by
- 23 the Prosecution, they are not evidence, and as a consequence,
- 24 little or no value should be given to those remarks.
- 25 Also, because the Prosecution seems to be intent on providing its

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 149 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 22/01/2013

- 1 closing argument at this point in time, the Trial Chamber should
- 2 be very mindful when it decides at the end of the case as to how
- 3 much time it will give the Prosecution to argue its case, because
- 4 that is exactly what they're doing on each and every one of these
- 5 occasions.
- 6 [11.26.45]
- 7 That being said, yesterday, I made some very general remarks
- 8 concerning these sorts of documents, and let me just repeat what
- 9 I said yesterday to some extent, and this afternoon, I will go
- 10 into some details with the 54 or 56 documents that we object to,
- 11 which we feel have not been addressed. And, as I understand, the
- 12 Trial Chamber is setting aside some time for me to make those --
- 13 that presentation. I will only need about 15 or 20 minutes this
- 14 afternoon.
- 15 It is our position that documentary evidence has to be admitted
- 16 with great reservation. Authenticity and reliability is
- 17 necessary. This documentary evidence should come in through
- 18 witnesses in order to test the witnesses' knowledge of the
- 19 content or at least to verify how the documents were produced. To
- 20 the extent in any of these documents that are being submitted,
- 21 without any testimonial evidence, we object, recognizing,
- 22 however, that the Trial Chamber will indeed, as we are in the
- 23 civil law system, admit everything, more or less, and that it is
- 24 based on this tradition, this legal tradition, for it to review
- 25 it at the end of the trial, under the free evaluation of the

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 149 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 22/01/2013

- 1 evidence, that it be very circumspect as far as weight to be
- 2 given to documents where the foundation has not been established
- 3 for authenticity and reliability.
- 4 [11.28.31]
- 5 And that's all I have to say at this point in time. And I thank
- 6 you for giving us this opportunity to respond very briefly to
- 7 what has been going on thus far with the Prosecution in respect
- 8 to this presentation. Thank you.
- 9 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 10 Thank you.
- 11 The defence team for Khieu Samphan, you may proceed.
- 12 MS. GUISSÉ:
- 13 Thank you, Mr. President. Good morning to you, the Bench, to the
- 14 parties, and to everyone present.
- 15 I will be very brief, because I must say that I am somewhat
- 16 perturbed because if I have understood, the purpose of this
- 17 hearing in application to various memos, and I'm referring to
- 18 E170, paragraphs 2 and 4; memo E163, paragraph 3; and E223,
- 19 paragraph 4.
- 20 [11.29.44]
- 21 If I have properly understood the purpose of these memos, as to
- 22 the purpose of this hearing, during which we are supposed to
- 23 raise our objections on matters of admissibility, and in light of
- 24 what we have seen today, the presentation of key documents by the
- 25 parties who wish to do so, I must say that the position of the

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 149 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 22/01/2013

- 1 Chamber was to present these key documents to the public and to
- 2 give the parties an opportunity to plead and to respond, with the
- 3 possibility given to the Accused to comment. And this is what
- 4 transpires in the various memos prior to this hearing.
- 5 Under such conditions, Khieu Samphan's team is not ready to plead
- 6 on issues of admissibility, presentation of key documents and the
- 7 merits. In this regard, let me reiterate what I stated yesterday,
- 8 that taking into account the position of the Chamber regarding
- 9 the broad admissibility of documents, we will not be able to have
- 10 a true debate on the probative value of the documents before this
- 11 Chamber.
- 12 [11.31.09]
- 13 The point I want to make today is that, insofar as we are sitting
- 14 to look at the different memos and the documents, I endorse
- 15 entirely what my learned colleague, Karnavas, has stated. The --
- 16 this is not an opportunity for the prosecutor and the civil
- 17 parties to plead, which means that all documents that have been
- 18 presented so far, and in regard to which we have remained silent,
- 19 we would have to revisit those documents in order to plead. That
- 20 is the first point.
- 21 The second point is this, bearing in mind the fact that my client
- 22 is admitted to hospital, we cannot make any submissions at this
- 23 stage. Thank you for your attention.
- 24 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 25 Thank you.

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 149 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 22/01/2013

- 1 I now hand over to the Prosecution to respond to the various
- 2 objections raised by parties. You may proceed.
- 3 [11.32.30]
- 4 MR. LYSAK:
- 5 Thank you, Mr. President.
- 6 I am not sure I understand why counsel for Khieu Samphan is
- 7 perturbed. I think the Trial Chamber's memo was clear that we
- 8 would present documents. This is not a closing argument, it was a
- 9 presentation of documentary evidence, and that counsel would have
- 10 an opportunity to respond and make observations; not, I believe,
- 11 to debate admissibility, which has already been decided with
- 12 respect to these documents, but to make any observations that
- 13 they wish.
- 14 With regard to Nuon Chea's counsel, who focused on document E3/5,
- 15 the August 1975 "Revolutionary Flag", the Court has already
- 16 determined the admissibility of that document and rejected the
- 17 arguments that documents need to be originals. I will,
- 18 nonetheless, take that to be a comment still challenging the
- 19 weight of the document. So I would make the following three
- 20 observations, and I am glad that counsel reminded the Court of
- 21 the disingenuous statements of Nuon Chea that were made at the
- 22 outset of this trial regarding these documents.
- 23 [11.33.53]
- 24 First, colour copies have since been shown of some of the
- 25 "Revolutionary Flags", from which it can be seen clearly that

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 149 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 22/01/2013

- 1 this was a booklet that was then copied into black and white. So
- 2 the assertion that these were booklets has been shown by some
- 3 colour copies of the "Revolutionary Flag" that have been put
- 4 before the Chamber.
- 5 In regards to the assertion that somehow we are not searching for
- 6 the truth, that documents have been manufactured, that this is a
- 7 show trial, these are incredibly disingenuous remarks. I would
- 8 remind everyone the Court has heard testimony from witness Kim
- 9 Vun, who worked at the office that printed "Revolutionary Flag".
- 10 He came to this Court, he testified, he looked at these documents
- 11 and he confirmed their authenticity.
- 12 And in regards to this particular document, the August 1975
- 13 "Revolutionary Flag" that records a speech given to 3,000 cadres
- 14 from the army in July 1975, we have heard recent testimony from
- 15 one of the soldiers who confirms attending that meeting that is
- 16 discussed in this issue of "Revolutionary Flag". So, for counsel
- 17 to suggest that there is any question about this document is
- 18 simply wrong.
- 19 And that is my response to the comments from the Defence.
- 20 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 21 Thank you.
- 22 (Judges deliberate)
- 23 [11.38.10]
- 24 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 25 According to the schedule of this document hearing, this

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 149 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 22/01/2013

- 1 afternoon the Chamber will hear the presentation of documents by
- 2 the defence team for Mr. Ieng Sary. There are altogether 56
- 3 documents sought by the defence team for Ieng Sary, so the
- 4 Chamber wishes to ask the defence team whether or not you are
- 5 ready and this document can be presented this afternoon.
- 6 MR. KARNAVAS:
- 7 We are ready, Mr. President.
- 8 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 9 Thank you.
- 10 How about the Lead Co Lawyer for civil parties?
- 11 Just now you mentioned that you have not been ready on the
- 12 comments or the presentation of documents concerning the facts
- 13 relevant to the structure of the military of the Democratic
- 14 Kampuchea. The Chamber wishes to ask whether or not you can
- 15 present this document.
- 16 MS. SIMONNEAU-FORT:
- 17 Mr. President, we have to apologize, but I think that the rather
- 18 hasty preparation for this hearing has led us into error, because
- 19 we thought that our presentation would follow the overall
- 20 presentation by the Prosecutors. Be that as it may, we have some
- 21 things to say about military structures. We will be able to do
- 22 this in the second part of the afternoon, if the Chamber would
- 23 accept for us to do this after the Ieng Sary defence. And we can
- 24 send the list of our documents to all of the parties. There
- 25 aren't many of them. We can send them that over the lunch break,

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 149 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 22/01/2013

- 1 if that is suitable.
- 2 The other possibility is for us to present all our documents,
- 3 military structures and forced transfer, after the presentation
- 4 by the Prosecution, which would make it possible for the Chamber
- 5 to acquaint itself with our documents over a reasonable time
- 6 before we come around to presenting them. We can do it either
- 7 way, Mr. President. Thank you very much.
- 8 (Judges deliberate)
- 9 [11.42.10]
- 10 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 11 Thank you.
- 12 The time is now appropriate for lunch adjournment. The Chamber
- 13 will adjourn now until 1.30 this afternoon.
- 14 The Court is now adjourned.
- 15 (Court adjourns from 1142H to 1341H)
- 16 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 17 Please be seated. The Court is now back in session.
- 18 This afternoon we will continue with the document hearing by
- 19 hearing the presentation by Ieng Sary's defence of their
- 20 submission regarding the military structure, the movement of
- 21 population phases 1 and 2, and the killing site at Tuol Po Chrey.
- 22 The floor is now given to Ieng Sary's defence to make the
- 23 presentation regarding the documents. Counsel Michael Karnavas,
- 24 please hold; I notice that the prosecutor is on his feet.
- 25 You may proceed.

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 149 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 22/01/2013

- 1 MR. DE WILDE D'ESTMAEL:
- 2 Thank you, Mr. President. Good morning to the Bench and to all
- 3 parties before.
- 4 [13.43.43]
- 5 Ieng Sary's defence presents objections to the -- or talks about
- 6 the 54 documents. I will try to look at the number of documents
- 7 on the list; 24 of those documents have already been the subject
- 8 of debate and even decisions of the Chamber. So in order that we
- 9 do not lose time and discuss the same documents -- 12 documents
- 10 were discussed yesterday during the afternoon session as well as
- 11 other documents which were the subject of debate in 2012 -- may I
- 12 take about 10 minutes to list the documents which, in my opinion,
- 13 should not be discussed today?
- 14 [13.44.41]
- 15 So, I am in your hands, Mr. President. If you think it is useful
- 16 for me to do so, so that we can limit today's discussions only to
- 17 the 30 documents, I believe, and the footnotes of the -- of the
- 18 footnotes. Twenty-four other documents have already been the
- 19 subject of discussions and the Defence should not present those
- 20 documents again or should not raise objections.
- 21 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 22 Counsel Michael Karnavas, you may respond.
- 23 MR. KARNAVAS:
- 24 Thank you, Mr. President.
- 25 First of all, it is not my intention to go through each and every

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 149 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 22/01/2013

- 1 document and the gentleman knows that. Our position has always
- 2 been that we would do it by topics.
- 3 Secondly, the 54 documents that we include as part of this annex
- 4 that we will be submitting to the Trial Chamber as part of our
- 5 written submissions include documents that were in -- noted in
- 6 the footnotes and when we look at your trial memorandum of
- 7 E223/2, at paragraph 5, there seems to be an omission with
- 8 respect to documents related to the military structures and so
- 9 that was the purpose of that. Now, to the extent that there may
- 10 be some overlap, that's unavoidable in some instances though we
- 11 -- your -- we took the opportunity to look at the footnotes
- 12 themselves.
- 13 [13.46.29]
- 14 This presentation does not include objections to Closing --
- 15 Closing Order documents such as IS 5.53 or D125/217 which have
- 16 been included in OCP's annex. And also we do not include witness
- 17 statements requested by the Prosecution in its motion of E208 --
- 18 E208/1 and E96/8 because we are -- we understand these will be
- 19 the subject of future hearings.
- 20 That said, I will agree with the Prosecution that some of the
- 21 topics of some of these documents are similar to the ones raised
- 22 yesterday and I am perfectly happy to simply submit our annex --
- 23 our motion with the annex and our remarks and sit down to save
- 24 time if the Prosecution is worried that we will be consuming
- 25 valuable Court time.

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 149 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 22/01/2013

- 1 [13.47.41]
- 2 But what -- the topics that I have here are telegrams. There are
- 3 letters; one needs to be -- I need to -- to clarify something
- 4 with the Court, a letter from Heder. Then there is a letter from
- 5 a pastor. There are some witness statements. There are some
- 6 documents from USAID, UNICEF, WHO, the U.S. State Department,
- 7 World Vision. There are documents related to international
- 8 communications from the French and U.S. State Departments, again,
- 9 similar to what we did yesterday. These are all from the
- 10 footnotes. There are some media articles including an article
- 11 that was authored by Suong Sikoeun where we don't object to that
- 12 being introduced and it sort of dovetails what he testified to,
- 13 but we leave it to the Court's discretion. There are three CPK
- 14 publications and minutes of -- of meetings. There's one video
- 15 titled "What Happened to Cambodia" by Ronnie Yimsut -- or "Ronnie
- 16 Yimsut's Story", I should say. And then there's a power
- 17 delegation decision by Judge You Bunleng to Judge Lemonde
- 18 allowing him to -- with respect to a letter that was authored by
- 19 Mr. Heder.
- 20 So, I'm in your -- in your hands; I can either go through my
- 21 presentation or simply say that with respect to all of these
- 22 documents or these -- these topics, we object based on what I've
- 23 indicated yesterday, based on Rule 87.3, and based on the fact
- 24 that some of the documents predate the temporal jurisdiction. And
- 25 unless they meet certain criteria that is, for background or

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 149 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 22/01/2013

- 1 for context -anything that precedes the temporal jurisdiction of
- 2 this tribunal should not be admitted.
- 3 [13.50.14]
- 4 With respect to the Heder letter, it is worth pointing out that
- 5 this is a letter from Heder to the OCIJ while he was working for
- 6 the OCIJ explaining certain matters and it bears underscoring
- 7 that Heder's summaries of Becker's interview with Ms. Ieng
- 8 Thirith was -- was not admitted because it was found to be
- 9 unreliable. In other words, he was -- somehow he was transcribing
- 10 or typing her notes and that was found unreliable and that's in
- 11 E185.2.
- 12 Very briefly, again, to save time, since time seems to be of the
- 13 essence, with respect to these documents from USAID, UNICEF and
- 14 what have you, as I've indicated yesterday, we think the Trial
- 15 Chamber should give little or no weight -- cannot -- should not
- 16 take the content of these documents at face value. It is
- 17 virtually impossible to test the validity of the -- of what is
- 18 being reported. These documents and reports contain information
- 19 and conclusions that are based not on direct observations.
- 20 Basically, well, these are my submissions.
- 21 And I see the Prosecution seems to be in a particularly combative
- 22 mood this afternoon, so I'll allow him to make his observations.
- 23 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 24 Thank you.
- 25 The Co-Prosecutor, you may proceed.

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 149 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 22/01/2013

- 1 MR. DE WILDE D'ESTMAEL:
- 2 Mr. President, I had made a motion before this Chamber and
- 3 Counsel Karnavas was given the floor to respond to that motion
- 4 and it appears that regarding all the motions, I think he should
- 5 respond to my specific application. And, depending on the
- 6 decision of the Chamber, I will be able to say which documents
- 7 are duplicates or duplicate orders and then he can make his
- 8 objections. I think he is mixing things up.
- 9 [13.52.55]
- 10 I still do not know whether the Chamber would like me to list
- 11 documents that have already been the subject of hearings before.
- 12 Thank you, Mr. President.
- 13 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 14 That is correct. If you object to certain documents and that it
- 15 is not necessary for Ieng Sary's defence counsel to present those
- 16 objections. In order to -- not to waste the time, you should list
- 17 those documents so that the Chamber and all parties will get to
- 18 understand clearly on this issue and if you just make a brief
- 19 summary, then, the Chamber will not have the basis to make
- 20 decision. You have to state that clearly.
- 21 [13.53.50]
- 22 For example, out of those 24 documents that you're saying are
- 23 repetitious is to be presented by the defence counsel so that the
- 24 counsel will have the opportunity to make their remark or
- 25 observation so that we can then decide whether the Defence shall

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 149 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 22/01/2013

- 1 make their objection in whole or in part. And if you make a brief
- 2 response or remark like this, the Chamber will not have any
- 3 grounds to make any ruling.
- 4 MR. DE WILDE D'ESTMAEL:
- 5 Thank you, Mr. President. Indeed, that was the main thrust of my
- 6 application. I will move very quickly and in -- in an orderly
- 7 manner regarding the -- the table given by the Defence.
- 8 The first document was on the table sent by email this morning,
- 9 is D108/28/108. It already has an E3 number and this is E31750
- 10 (phonetic), and it was presented before. This is a witness, Ms.
- 11 Voeun, who was presented during the hearing of the 8th of August
- 12 2012 by Judge Lavergne; E1/131.1, at about 11:50. There were no
- 13 objections raised at the time regarding that document.
- 14 [13.55.42]
- 15 The second document which poses problems is number 3 on the list
- 16 given by the Ieng Sary defence team. It's D108/31. I repeat
- 17 D108/31.28. As a matter of fact, in this case, it is another
- 18 version of a document that had already been a subject of a
- 19 hearing. The same document that was presented at -- at another
- 20 time, D08/7.3, and the exhibit number was given--
- 21 THE INTERPRETER:
- 22 The exhibit number was read too fast, Mr. President, so we
- 23 couldn't retain it.
- 24 MR. DE WILDE D'ESTMAEL:
- 25 -- that document was presented last year.

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 149 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 22/01/2013

- 1 And then, as Ieng Sary's defence has pointed out, there are a
- 2 number of witness statements on the list. The first witness
- 3 statement which was the subject of a separate hearing is D125/97.
- 4 It is a witness statement by TCW-231.
- 5 [13.57.03]
- 6 Then we have four documents that were discussed during
- 7 yesterday's hearing before this Chamber. These documents begin
- 8 with D199/26.2.
- 9 The first, D199/26.2.209, was on the list presented yesterday in
- 10 the annex, Annex 2A. The number is E223/2/1.2 and the number
- 11 given to that document on the list was number 7. It is not
- 12 necessary to revisit it because we talked about it yesterday.
- 13 The second document is D199/26.2.219. It's in the same situation;
- 14 it's on the annex we talked about yesterday. The number in the
- 15 annex is number 8.
- 16 Then you have D199/26.2.228, still in the same situation. We
- 17 discussed it in yesterday's hearing in the afternoon. That
- document has a number. It's number 9 on Annex 2A. It has an
- 19 exhibit number, 228/8.
- 20 Then you have D199/26.1.216. It was discussed yesterday and it is
- 21 number 11 on the list, the same Annex 2A.
- 22 Then we have two other witness statements. They were -- they were
- 23 interviewed by Co-Investigating Judges; D32/26 -- D232/26, and it
- 24 is witness TCW-389. Then we have D233/8 and that is witness
- 25 TCW-796. So these two witnesses will be the subject of a separate

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 149 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 22/01/2013

- 1 hearing.
- 2 Then we have a document, D269/9.1.16. It was number 19 on the
- 3 list produced by counsel for Ieng Sary. The E3 number is E3/1765,
- 4 but it also has another exhibit number, E3/781.
- 5 And D366/7.1.157, as a matter of fact, this document is on our
- 6 list of documents of July 2011; that is document E109/4.1 and it
- 7 is in Annex 2 and this is number 16 on that annex. It was the
- 8 subject of a hearing in January 2012.
- 9 [14.00.44]
- 10 And let me point out that the documents listed on the Defence
- 11 list -- that is, D269/9.1.16, is absolutely identical with
- 12 D366/7.1.157, so the E3 numbers were given to this document
- 13 following its decision, decision 185 of April 2012.
- 14 On number 20 on the Ieng Sary list, we have number D299.1.15L. As
- 15 a matter of fact, that document already has an E3 number and it
- 16 is E3/3091R. E3/130R, that document is on our list of July 2011;
- 17 D109/4.1, in Annex 16 and the number is 150 on that annex. The
- 18 decision was therefore taken regarding that document and an E3
- 19 number was given to it following adversarial discussions in March
- 20 2012 and following a decision by the Chamber, E185.1.
- 21 [14.02.24]
- 22 On number 23 of Ieng Sary's list, we have document D304/1.3. That
- 23 document is on our list of July 2011, D109/4.1, and Annex 12
- 24 number 555. This is also a statement by an individual, but he
- 25 didn't give a statement before the Investigating Judges and it

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 149 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 22/01/2013

- 1 should be the subject of separate hearings for all documents on
- 2 Annex 12 and Annex 13.
- 3 Of our July 2011 documents, there are eight documents that were
- 4 discussed yesterday and I will simply give out -- read out the
- 5 exhibit numbers and the references and the number in which -- in
- 6 which they appear on Annexes A-B we discussed yesterday.
- 7 The first document is D313/1.2.65. It is on the table which we
- 8 discussed yesterday, E223/2/1.2, and it is number 13 on that
- 9 document.
- 10 14.03.551
- 11 Then we have document D365/1.1.10. That document was presented
- 12 yesterday, as well, and it is in the same annex; Annex A,
- 13 E223/2/1.2, and it is number 18 on that document.
- 14 Document D365/1.15, that document is in the annex -- the same
- 15 Annex A and it is number 19. It was discussed yesterday.
- 16 We have document D365/1.7, and it is number 21 on the Annex A
- 17 which we discussed yesterday.
- 18 Document D365/1/123, that document is also on the annex we
- 19 discussed yesterday and it is number 23; Annex A, and the
- 20 reference is E223/1/1.2.
- 21 [14.05.12]
- Then we have D365/1.1.28. It is number 26 on the same Annex A.
- 23 Then we have D365/1/1.3 is number 17 on the annex that was
- 24 presented yesterday and discussed.
- 25 And then we have D365/1.1.34 and it is number 27 on the same

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 149 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 22/01/2013

- 1 annex, Annex A.
- 2 And then we have a few other documents which have already been a
- 3 subject of hearings. The first is a statement by a witness
- 4 D369/6; that one has not been a subject of a hearing, but it has
- 5 to be the subject of a separate hearing. It is also on Annex 12,
- 6 and the number is 189 on our list of documents under E109/4.1.
- 7 [14.06.25]
- 8 I note that in the list that was given us today that the Ieng
- 9 Sary defence entered a document E108/810. It is no longer on the
- 10 list of documents discussed this afternoon.
- 11 And we have only three documents left. The first is a document
- 12 with the reference IS 13.30 and the reference number is E3/800.
- 13 It is a document that has already been the subject of a hearing
- 14 in -- in mid-January 2012 and it is on our annex of E documents
- 15 and it's E109/4.1 and it is Annex 3 and the reference and number
- 16 on that document is 40. Your decision E196 in April 2012 has
- 17 already determined that it is an admissible document, so it
- 18 should not be the subject of debate any longer. The situation is
- 19 similar for IS 13.1. It has another reference number and it is
- 20 D248/6.1.5 and an E3 number was given to it and it is E3/822.
- 21 [14.08.06]
- 22 This document is on our list of documents dating back to July
- 23 2011 and it's E109/4.1 and it is Annex 3, and the number is 40
- 24 under reference D48.
- 25 The two documents IS 13.31 and D48 are identical in Khmer;

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 149 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 22/01/2013

- 1 although in English, there is a difference in that one is longer
- 2 than the other by a page. It's worth pointing this out.
- 3 And the last document which should be presented in a separate
- 4 hearing is a statement by a witness, TCW-325, and the reference
- 5 is IS 19.71. The reference is D366/7.1.5870. This document is
- 6 part of Annex 12 and the number is 488 on our list of E documents
- 7 and it's E190/4.1, but as I pointed out, as is the case with
- 8 other witness statements, it should be the subject of a separate
- 9 hearing.
- 10 [14.09.38]
- 11 I have come to the end of my list. It was somewhat fastidious,
- 12 but it was, I believe, useful.
- 13 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 14 Thank you.
- 15 I note the intention of the Lead Co-Lawyer for the civil parties.
- 16 Do you have any observation you want to make? If not, we wish to
- 17 hand over to the defence team to discuss the request for
- 18 withdrawing certain documents for the reason that they have
- 19 overlap.
- 20 Do you have any observation to make, Lead Co-Lawyers? Because
- 21 just now we granted you the floor, but you did not react.
- 22 MS. SIMMONEAU-FORT:
- 23 I would have made the point if I had been authorized, Mr.
- 24 President, but at this stage, I want to make a preliminary remark
- 25 and have a clarification before a colleague from the Defence

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 149 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 22/01/2013

- 1 makes his objections because it seems to me that he takes it for
- 2 granted that he is entitled to submit objections in writing. But
- 3 yesterday, the Chamber explained how the teams of Nuon Chea and
- 4 Khieu Samphan could make objections in the future because their
- 5 clients were not there, but I want to know if the Chamber does,
- 6 in fact, authorize subsequent later written objections to be
- 7 submitted by the defence of Ieng Sary because I think that that
- 8 could otherwise modify the -- that could modify the oral
- 9 discussion that we're having here today.
- 10 I'd be most grateful for clarification on that. Thank you very
- 11 much.
- 12 [14.11.49]
- 13 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 14 Thank you.
- 15 Now, I hand over to the defence teams. Mr. Michael Karnavas, you
- 16 can proceed.
- 17 MR. KARNAVAS:
- 18 Thank you, Mr. President.
- 19 It's my understanding that the Prosecution had the list of
- 20 documents that we were -- the 54 documents as of yesterday. No
- 21 complaints were raised at the time, and while -- as I indicated
- 22 earlier, there may be some overlap.
- 23 [14.12.12]
- 24 We took it upon ourselves to go through the paragraphs dealing
- 25 with military structures and tried to be as diligent as we

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 149 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 22/01/2013

- 1 possibly could in identifying what we thought the documents that
- 2 had not been discussed or not been admitted. So to the -- to the
- 3 extent that we have listed here for our presentation which was, I
- 4 should say -- although it's not an excuse -- put together in a
- 5 rather rushed manner to the extent that we have presented
- 6 overlapping documents, we apologize.
- 7 But be that as it may, we firmly submit that our presentation is
- 8 based on topics and of course in the future, if the Prosecution,
- 9 especially this particular prosecutor, is so concerned about
- 10 time, then it would be useful if in advance they see that we have
- 11 presented -- we are in error and they have sufficient time to
- 12 point the error to us, we would gladly look at those submissions
- 13 and -- so as not to waste anybody's time.
- 14 As for the civil party, yesterday I believe she was here. I
- 15 thought I saw her here. I thought I saw her hear what I had to
- 16 say concerning our written submissions and I believe in the past
- 17 we have submitted written submissions and I don't recall ever
- 18 hearing her ever raise an objection then and now she's seeking
- 19 clarification.
- 20 [14.13.40]
- 21 However, if she had heard my submissions yesterday, she would
- 22 have also heard that I too was seeking clarification of how is it
- 23 that you wish us to proceed because it has been our particular
- 24 habit that we submit in the -- in the past, we have submitted
- 25 written objections to documents in addition to any oral

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 149 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 22/01/2013

- 1 presentations.
- 2 If the Trial Chamber does not wish to have written submissions,
- 3 then, we need some clear guidance. But we think it is useful,
- 4 especially since we're dealing with so many documents; we're
- 5 changing from Ds to Es. There's -- there's so much that can be
- 6 lost by all parties concerned that having something in writing,
- 7 especially if they are dealing with topics, might be useful. And
- 8 I might add that this is the habit that it is employed by other
- 9 tribunals dealing with war crimes.
- 10 [14.14.50]
- 11 Our submissions have already been made. I just made them prior to
- 12 the prosecutor standing up for the second occasion. We've
- 13 indicated our objections to the type of documents that we think
- 14 should not come in.
- 15 If a -- if a witness is expected to come in and he hasn't come
- 16 in, then those documents should not be used or introduced at this
- 17 point in time. If they -- if and when they come, they can be
- 18 shown the documents. The Prosecution or any party can move for
- 19 the admission of those documents or statements.
- 20 As respect to all other types of documents, as I've indicated,
- 21 letters, documents generated by governments or NGOs, we've
- 22 already -- we are already on record as to why they should not be
- 23 admitted.
- 24 And, again, to the extent that our list overlaps documents that
- 25 have already been discussed, albeit under different names, we

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 149 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 22/01/2013

- 1 take this opportunity to apologize for wasting everyone's time.
- 2 Thank you.
- 3 (Judges deliberate)
- 4 [14.17.24]
- 5 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 6 The Chamber has heard various issue raised by parties to the
- 7 proceedings concerning the documents sought to be put before the
- 8 Chamber as well as the submissions by party and response by
- 9 various party to the oral application by the parties.
- 10 And, to ensure the smooth proceedings, the Chamber will adjourn
- 11 now for deliberation until 20 to 3.00 or, rather, until 3.00,
- 12 and the Chamber will resume at 3.00.
- 13 The Court is now adjourned.
- 14 (Court recesses from 1418H to 1515H)
- 15 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 16 Please be seated. The Court is now back in session.
- 17 Just now, there was a request to the Chamber to clarify the
- 18 procedure for presenting the documents before this Chamber.
- 19 To be precisely clear to all parties involved following the
- 20 deliberation of the Judges of the Bench, the Chamber wishes to
- 21 advise the party in relation to the objection as well as the
- 22 submission of documents to be put before the Chamber.
- 23 And the Chamber wishes to hand over to Judge Silvia Cartwright to
- 24 provide guidance to all parties in respect of this matter. I now
- 25 hand over to Judge Cartwright.

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 149 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 22/01/2013

- 1 [15.17.40]
- 2 JUDGE CARTWRIGHT:
- 3 Thank you, President.
- 4 The Chamber notes that there are two matters on which it needs to
- 5 give guidance to the parties. These two topics are discussion of
- 6 the admissibility of documents, and separate and independent from
- 7 that, is the presentation of key documents. The Chamber's
- 8 guidance refers first and solely to admissibility and then I will
- 9 move to issues concerning key documents.
- 10 The Chamber notes that the OCP and the Lead Co-Lawyers have made
- 11 oral submissions on objections to the admissibility of documents.
- 12 It notes also that Ieng Sary has responded orally but that
- 13 counsel for him has referred to the making of submissions in
- 14 writing.
- 15 The Chamber would like Mr. Karnavas to confirm now, if that's
- 16 practicable, if the written submissions are a reference to the
- 17 annex to the email circulated today. Mr. Karnavas?
- 18 MR. KARNAVAS:
- 19 Thank you. It deals both with the annexes that the Prosecution
- 20 submitted from yesterday's presentation and, of course, what was
- 21 circulated by us this afternoon which, of course, we are in the
- 22 process of double-checking now in light of the remarks that were
- 23 made and decisions that have been taken.
- 24 [15.19.46]
- 25 JUDGE CARTWRIGHT:

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 149 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 22/01/2013

- 1 Can I further clarify, then, how much time would you need to
- 2 finalize this process?
- 3 MR. KARNAVAS:
- 4 Well, in light of what we heard this afternoon, we're in the
- 5 process now of double-checking. We thought we had checked
- 6 everything. Obviously, we missed some things, so we think that by
- 7 tomorrow we should be able to have that completed.
- 8 We do have one issue that is unclear. For instance, it was
- 9 mentioned that Judge Lavergne showed a document to a witness and
- 10 nobody objected. Well, with all due respect, we cannot object to
- 11 Judge Lavergne showing documents to witnesses and, of course, the
- 12 question is: What becomes of that document once it goes from a
- 13 "D" to an "E"? Is it deemed admitted or is it out there, in the
- 14 stratosphere, for us to then try to move for its admission?
- 15 And so we're having -- so that's one of the documents, but we are
- 16 looking -- we hope to have a redacted and, hopefully, a proper
- 17 annex by tomorrow.
- 18 [15.20.55]
- 19 JUDGE CARTWRIGHT:
- 20 Well, the -- I note that that's a rather subtle way of saying you
- 21 wish to object to the document. Please deal with that in your
- 22 written comments, please, Mr. Karnavas.
- 23 And the Chamber would like to take this opportunity of thanking
- 24 you for the work that you have put in and the preparation that
- 25 you have done to be ready to make your oral presentations and

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 149 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 22/01/2013

- 1 respond thus far. Thank you for that.
- 2 MR. KARNAVAS:
- 3 Thank you.
- 4 But, Judge Cartwright, there is -- I may not necessarily want to
- 5 object to a document, but where the I think the Khieu Samphan
- 6 team has filed submissions as to what becomes of the document.
- 7 Once it's shown, either by a Judge or by a party, to a particular
- 8 witness, are we to assume that the document is -- or at least a
- 9 portion that was shown already admitted or is there still a need
- 10 for the party to move for the admission of that document? And, if
- 11 it comes from a Judge, obviously, the presumption is that the
- 12 Judge wants the document in.
- 13 [15.22.07]
- 14 And so, if I may and I hope that I'm not testing your patience,
- 15 but at the ICTY, for instance, simply because you showed a
- 16 document to a witness, that document would not necessarily come
- 17 in. One would still have to make an application, and normally
- 18 only the portion that was shown, and if you wanted other portions
- 19 you would have to make some sort of a submission as to why those
- 20 other portions were not shown or why they're deemed necessary.
- 21 So, for us, it's a little bit unclear. So, if the Trial Chamber
- 22 -- it need not give us an answer today but at least notify us, so
- 23 we are aware in the future of what -- or how to deal with those
- 24 documents.
- 25 But I certainly don't feel like standing up and objecting to a

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 149 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 22/01/2013

- 1 document that Judge Lavergne is submitting, although I am tempted
- 2 at times, but be that as it may, you know, I think the Judge is
- 3 entitled to ask whatever questions, however objectionable I may
- 4 find them to be, but that's their prerogative. It doesn't
- 5 necessarily mean that the Judge is not cognizant of the fact that
- 6 they may be asking a question that perhaps presses the limits as
- 7 to whether it should be an appropriate question or not. But I'm
- 8 speaking from my own system.
- 9 JUDGE CARTWRIGHT:
- 10 I see I think we see your various points here, Mr. Karnavas.
- 11 [15.23.34]
- 12 MR. KARNAVAS:
- 13 Thank you.
- 14 JUDGE CARTWRIGHT:
- 15 However, we're dealing now with objections to the admissibility
- 16 of documents and if no objection is made to a document presented
- 17 by a Judge then that is the end of that issue.
- 18 So responses are a different matter, so I hope that that assists
- 19 you to some degree.
- 20 MR. KARNAVAS:
- 21 It does, it does. Thank you.
- 22 JUDGE CARTWRIGHT:
- 23 Well, Mr. Karnavas, you certainly have until tomorrow to finalize
- 24 the written portion and, as I said, the Chamber is grateful to
- you for the work that you have put in.

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 149 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 22/01/2013

- 1 [15.24.13]
- 2 Now, the next issue on objections to admissibility of documents
- 3 is this: The Khieu Samphan and Nuon Chea teams have both
- 4 indicated their unreadiness to make oral submissions objecting to
- 5 the admissibility of any documents.
- 6 Now, we do note that their respective clients have been
- 7 hospitalized in the last week, however -- and moreover that the
- 8 Trial Chamber brought forward the date for dealing with these
- 9 objections to the admissibility of documents -- nonetheless, this
- 10 has been an issue available since December of last year.
- 11 And so the Chamber has decided that the Khieu Samphan and Nuon
- 12 Chea teams may file any objections they have to the admissibility
- 13 of documents, in writing, by Friday the 8th of February. All
- 14 parties will then have the opportunity to respond by Friday the
- 15 22nd of February. The Chamber will then makes its decision
- 16 concerning objections to the admissibility of documents and that
- 17 will conclude this process.
- 18 [15.26.03]
- 19 The dates are: Khieu Samphan and Nuon Chea teams by the 8th of
- 20 February, and all parties may respond by the 22nd of February. Is
- 21 that right?
- 22 We now move to the second independent topic which is the
- 23 presentation of key documents. The Chamber would like to remind
- 24 the parties of the purpose of the hearings which have been
- 25 dedicated to the presentation of documents considered to be of

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 149 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 22/01/2013

- 1 particular relevance to a specific segment of the trial.
- 2 [15.27.00]
- 3 The first is that it gives the parties the opportunity to
- 4 emphasize documents that they consider to be important to their
- 5 respective cases. And the second purpose, which also answers the
- 6 Khieu Samphan's defence concerns -- articulated earlier, is that
- 7 the hearings are dedicated to the presentation of documents and
- 8 are aimed to ensure a greater measure of public accessibility to
- 9 the documentary aspect of the trial; meaning this gives a chance
- 10 for the public to hear a summary of what these key documents are
- 11 about, and further giving an opportunity to those parties who
- 12 seek it to highlight for the Chamber key documents considered, as
- 13 I have already said, to be particularly important to specific
- 14 segments of the trial.
- 15 Whenever a document is presented by any party as part of this
- 16 hearing, the accused will also be permitted to comment on the
- 17 document if they choose to do so. And I refer, for example, to
- 18 Memorandum E170, dated 9 February 2012.
- 19 [15.28.36]
- 20 The Chamber notes that, on a number of occasions, some of the
- 21 accused have declined to comment on documents presented during
- 22 such hearings, arguing that they intend to exercise their right
- 23 to remain silent. While no discussion on the admissibility of
- 24 documents presented during this stage is to be allowed unless the
- 25 issue of admissibility has not previously been discussed or ruled

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 149 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 22/01/2013

- 1 upon, it's clear that the Chamber has never prevented the Accused
- 2 or their lawyers from discussing the relevance or the probative
- 3 value of the documents.
- 4 It's been indicated on a number of occasions, for example, C --
- 5 E233 paragraph 3 -- and I quote:
- 6 "The time allocated to the Defence includes the opportunity for
- 7 the accused, where sought, to comment on any documents presented
- 8 or previously put before the Chamber during this trial segment."
- 9 Now, that refers in general to the purpose of the portions of the
- 10 hearings on presentation of key documents. The Chamber notes that
- 11 the OCP has begun this process and that the Lead Co-Lawyers have
- 12 indicated that they will be ready to make their presentation
- 13 shortly.
- 14 [15.30.28]
- 15 In order to clarify the procedure in relation to key documents
- 16 from this point on, it seems most efficient, given the inability
- 17 of some of the parties to be ready to present their key
- 18 documents, to ask the OCP to continue with its presentation on
- 19 the Movement of Population Phase 1 and Tuol Po Chrey, then on the
- 20 Movement of Population Phase 2. Then the Lead Co-Lawyers will be
- 21 asked to complete -- to make their own presentations on those
- 22 topics.
- 23 That leaves then the question of joint criminal enterprise and
- 24 the roles of the accused, and I think, President, we were going
- 25 to propose that those topics be presented also by OCP if they are

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 149 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 22/01/2013

- 1 ready to do so, and the Lead Co-Lawyers. That then gives the
- 2 defence teams' ample time to be ready by when we resume these
- 3 hearings on the presentation of key documents and the Chamber
- 4 will expect them to be ready to present their key documents or to
- 5 make such comments on the documents as they wish to make.
- 6 So the question is to the OCP, would you be ready to proceed to
- 7 joint criminal enterprise and the role of the accused when we
- 8 have completed the Movements of Population and Tuol Po Chrey?
- 9 MR. RAYNOR:
- 10 Judge Cartwright, thank you. Can I answer that with a very simple
- 11 answer, which is "no", but can I explain the position, please?
- 12 [15.32.48]
- 13 As the Trial Chamber will know, requests were made last week to
- 14 the OCP in respect of the documents presentations that the Trial
- 15 Chamber has heard in respect of military structure and the
- 16 presentation that I'll be giving together with my national
- 17 colleague in respect of forced movement 1, Tuol Po Chrey, and
- 18 forced movement 2.
- 19 Can I explain, please, Judge Cartwright, that in taking the
- 20 notice from the Court last week to prepare for these documents, a
- 21 team was established by the OCP to prepare this presentation for
- 22 this afternoon which involved -- which is not uncommon, I accept,
- 23 by all counsel in this Court -- significant and substantial work
- 24 literally from the time notification was given last week through
- 25 to today, including substantial work on both Saturday and Sunday

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 149 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 22/01/2013

- 1 to prepare this presentation.
- 2 [15.33.54]
- 3 Can I say this, that the OCP is of course mindful of the time
- 4 constraints that the Court is under; we are mindful of the need
- 5 for Court time to be utilized properly in the presentation of
- 6 documents to the Trial Chamber.
- 7 We have discussed this very topic that you raise, Judge
- 8 Cartwright, within OCP over the last few days, and the position
- 9 is that we are not able to present within the timeframe that you
- 10 have suggested but we are certainly willing to start preparation
- 11 now to present such a presentation to the Trial Chamber, but we
- 12 do ask for some forbearance in terms of time.
- 13 The presentation on the role of the Accused is, without a show of
- 14 doubt, the most important documentation that the OCP will
- 15 present. We -- can I say this -- preparation has already started
- 16 on this. It is on-going preparation. I can tell the Trial Chamber
- 17 even this, that certain of my fellow other counsel have been
- 18 assigned portions of that presentation. They have started work on
- 19 the presentation but we do ask for more time.
- 20 [15.35.18]
- 21 Can I please not be tied on what the time request is, as I
- 22 haven't discussed this with the National-International
- 23 Co-Prosecutors? I know that they would be willing, I'm sure, to
- 24 clarify a request actually for more time tomorrow morning, and I
- 25 can communicate that through to you Judge Cartwright tomorrow

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 149 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 22/01/2013

- 1 morning.
- 2 So, in summary, we are not ready now. We are working on it, but
- 3 we would very much appreciate some time to properly prepare for
- 4 this presentation in order that Trial Chamber has, I hope, a
- 5 reasonably polished presentation rather than one that is prepared
- 6 in haste. Thank you.
- 7 JUDGE CARTWRIGHT:
- 8 Well, thank you very much for that indication. This was the
- 9 purpose of making the enquiry.
- 10 [15.36.15]
- 11 The Chamber will await your indications as to how much time you
- 12 need to be complete in that presentation and will then rule on
- 13 that aspect.
- 14 But what the Chamber has not done as yet is to thank the
- 15 prosecutors also for the work that they have put in in being
- 16 ready for the objections to the admissibility of documents and
- 17 also to the presentation of key documents. We appreciate that
- 18 we've put a great deal of pressure and we, as with the Ieng Sary
- 19 team, appreciate the effort that you have made.
- 20 So, for the moment, we will proceed with the presentation of key
- 21 documents on the movement of population, phase 1, Tuol Po Chrey,
- 22 movement of population, phase 2, followed by the Lead Co-Lawyers,
- 23 and within the next few days following your indication to us of
- 24 how much more time you need, we will give a timeframe for the
- 25 remaining topics.

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 149 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 22/01/2013

- 1 And then I am reminding defence teams that they have a lot work
- 2 ahead of them because we will expect them to be ready to respond
- 3 and/or present their own key documents, and sometimes it will be
- 4 at quite short notice depending on health issues and other
- 5 matters.
- 6 President, I hope that we have covered everything that you
- 7 discussed during the afternoon adjournment?
- 8 [15.38.07]
- 9 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 10 Thank you, Judge Cartwright.
- 11 Defence counsel, you may proceed.
- 12 MS. GUISSÉ:
- 13 Thank you, Mr. President. I would like to simply clarify a point
- 14 in what I said in the event where I wasn't clear.
- 15 I note the decision taken by the Chamber today, but regarding the
- 16 mix-up we feel and the words that were quoted by Ms. Cartwright
- 17 -- Judge Cartwright in paragraph 4 of Memo 170.
- 18 That was, of course, of the mix-up this morning. The kind of
- 19 hearings that we are dealing with in these memos are stated in
- 20 paragraph 4. This hearing does not have to deal with
- 21 admissibility of documents in view of having them tendered into
- $\,$  22  $\,$  evidence, no time was allowed for responses by other parties. On
- 23 this basis, we had envisaged that there will be hearings devoted
- 24 to documents.
- 25 [15.39.19]

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 149 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 22/01/2013

- 1 I'll try to slow down. I am having problems. I am speaking very
- 2 fast.
- 3 Paragraph 4 of Memo E170: this hearing does not have to do with
- 4 admissibility of documents in order to have them tendered into
- 5 evidence. No time was allowed for responses by other parties and
- 6 that is why we always envisaged that such hearings should be
- 7 organized.
- 8 And our position, as I have pointed out sufficiently, is that we
- 9 understood that the Accused were those who had to make comments
- 10 and not defence teams. That is the cause of the mix-up because
- 11 after reading your memos, we did not guite understand. We crave
- 12 your indulgence for not having paid sufficient attention to what
- 13 you stated in the memos.
- 14 (Judges deliberate)
- 15 [15.40.40]
- 16 MR. PRESIDENT:
- 17 I'd like to give the floor to Judge Lavergne so he can respond in
- 18 French to the French-speaking counsel so that it is better for
- 19 you to understand it.
- 20 Judge Lavergne, you may proceed.
- 21 JUDGE LAVERGNE:
- 22 Thank you, Mr. President. I am not quite sure I am in a position
- 23 to respond correctly. I just want to be sure that the position of
- 24 the Chamber is clear to all parties, including Khieu Samphan's
- 25 defence team. Is it clear?

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 149 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 22/01/2013

- 1 [15.41.20]
- 2 MS. GUISSÉ:
- 3 Of course, today the position is a lot clearer than in the past,
- 4 a lot clearer than what we read in the memo. Our position was
- 5 predicated on what the Chamber had stated, and if that is the
- 6 case we would like to have to respond in hearings regarding
- 7 presentation of documents. That was the purpose of what I stated.
- 8 JUDGE LAVERGNE:
- 9 Of course, I would like to point out that in the memos in
- 10 question it is stated that whenever documents have to be
- 11 presented by parties during hearings, the parties may make
- 12 remarks on such documents expressly; it is stated "expressly".
- 13 [15.42.12]
- 14 So perhaps what you are saying is that you would like to also
- 15 present documents?
- 16 MS. GUISSÉ:
- 17 I don't want us to prolong the debate, but our position was quite
- 18 clear and was made so on several occasions. Perhaps our problem
- 19 is with translation. Our position has always been clear. It
- 20 appears that my learned friend, Vercken, explained why we're
- 21 participating in such hearings, and on such on that occasion
- 22 the clarifications were not made as they have been expressly made
- 23 today. We have the Accused, indeed, but the Accused have defence
- 24 teams.
- 25 So in light of the paragraph I have just read out, we do not

Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Trial Chamber – Trial Day 149 Case No. 002/19-09-2007-ECCC/TC 22/01/2013

24

25

	78
1	understand that the defence counsel had to make responses, and
2	I'm referring to paragraph 4 of E170. Now we have understood the
3	position of the Chamber clearly.
4	(Judges deliberate)
5	[15.43.36]
6	MR. PRESIDENT:
7	We only have a short period of time for today's proceeding, so it
8	is appropriate for an early adjournment. We shall adjourn today
9	and we will resume tomorrow, starting from 9 a.m.
LO	May all parties and the public be informed?
L1	Security guards, you are instructed to take the accused, Ieng
L2	Sary, back to the detention facility and have him returned to the
L3	holding cell downstairs where he can participate remotely with
L 4	the linking of the audio-visual means.
L5	The Court is now adjourned.
L6	THE GREFFIER:
L7	(No interpretation)
L8	(Court adjourns at 1544H)
L9	
20	
21	
22	
23	

Page 78